DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 442 991 CE 080 431

AUTHOR	Benn, Roseanne, Ed.
TITLE	Scholarly Practitioners: The Education of Educators of Adults. Occasional Paper. The Proceedings of the International Conference on Training Adult Educators (3rd, Exeter, England, July 8-11, 1998).
INSTITUTION	Exeter Univ. (England). Centre for Research in Continuing Education.
REPORT NO	CRCE-OP-4
ISBN	ISBN-1-899070-05-2
PUB DATE	1998-00-00
NOTE	132p.; For other proceedings from this conference, see ED 378 414 and ED 399 452.
AVAILABLE FROM	Centre for Research in Continuing Education, University of Exeter, Cotley, Streatham Rise, Exeter EX4 4PE, U.K. Tel: 011392 411905, Fax: 011392 436082, E-mail: DCAE@exeter.ac.uk (9 British pounds (including postage and packing)).
PUB TYPE	Collected Works - Proceedings (021)
EDRS PRICE	MF01/PC06 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS	Adult Students; Art Education; Developed Nations; Developing Nations; Distance Education; Foreign Countries; *Inservice Teacher Education; On the Job Training; Open Education; Postsecondary Education; Prior Learning; Reflective Teaching; *Staff Development; *Student Evaluation; *Teacher Educator Education; *Teaching Methods
IDENTIFIERS	Croatia; Japan; Poland; United Kingdom

ABSTRACT

This document contains 19 papers presented at a conference on educating adult educators at the University of Exeter, England in July 1998. The following are included: "Themes and Issues in Training the Adult Educator" (Rosesanne Benn); "Training Adult Educators in Poland" (Tadeusz Aleksander); "Educating Teacher Educators" (Nomi Arnom); "The Training of Adult Educators in Western Europe by Open and Distance Learning Methods" (Geoff Chivers, Nikki Chowdry); "The Formation of Prisoners' Own Educational Systems and Their Relationships to 'Outside' Adult Educators: Re-defining the Boundaries of a Discussion on Educating the Adult Educator" (Howard Davidson); "Encouraging Reflective Practice in Adult Educators Studying through Distance Education" (Darryl Dymock); "Training in and for Voluntary Organizations in the UK" (Konrad Elsdon); "Integrated Practice: Reflections on the Need for a New Concept in Our Education of Adult Educators" (Ellen Enggaard and Helle Marstal); "The Role of an Educator in Kyoudou Gakushu (Mutual Study in a Small Group): Educational Provision for Young Adults in Japan" (Yaguchi Etsuko, Fuse Miho); "Developing Teacher Educators for Working with Student Retrained as Teachers in a Mid-life Career Change" (Rivka Geron, Nomi Arnon); "NVQs in Higher Education Tutor Training: The Candidates' Experience" (Yvonne Hillier); "Mirror Images: Reflective Practice in the Training of Adult Educators" (Cheryl Hunt); "When Is Staff Development Not Staff Development? When It's Training" (Ann Jackson); "The Cultural Sources of Dilemmas in Adult Educators' Training in Contemporary Poland" (Witold Jakubowski); "Training Art Tutors in Adult Education" (David Jones); "Adult Educators for Voluntary Groups in the Polish Transformation Period" (Ewa Kurantowicz); "Training Adult Educators for Working with Adults in Croatia"

Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made
from the original document.

(Ilija Lavrnja, Anita Klapan); "An Open Window for the Training of Adult Educators: Higher Education" (Nick Small); and "Recognising Prior Learning and Assessing Current Competency in the Training of Adult Educators--Does It Devalue the Learning Process?" (Tom Stehlik). Each paper contains references. (KC)

Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made
from the original document.

ED 442 991

UNIVERSITY of EXETER

Centre For Research in Continuing Education

Occasional Paper Number 4

SCHOLARLY PRACTITIONERS: THE EDUCATION OF EDUCATORS OF ADULTS

The Proceedings of the 3rd International Conference on Training Adult Educators

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
Office of Educational Research and Improvement
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)
☑ This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it.
☐ Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality.
• Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official OERI position or policy.

PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE AND DISSEMINATE THIS MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY
R. Benn
TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)
1

Edited by
Roseanne Benn

1998

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

CE 080 431

SCHOLARLY PRACTIONERERS: THE EDUCATION OF EDUCATORS OF ADULTS

Edited by
Roseanne Benn

Centre for Research in Continuing Education
Occasional Paper number 4
1998

Published by the Centre for Research in Continuing Education, University of Exeter
Cotley, Streatham Rise, Exeter EX4 4PE, UK

Copyright © University of Exeter Centre for Research in Continuing Education.

While copyright in this occasional paper as a whole is vested in the Centre for Research in Continuing Education, copyright in individual papers belongs to their respective authors, and no paper may be reproduced wholly or in part without the express permission in writing of both author and publisher

Further copies of this Occasional paper may be obtained from the Centre for Research in Continuing Education, University of Exeter, at the above address.
Tel: 011392 411905 Fax: 011392 436082 e-mail: DCAE@exeter.ac.uk

Price £9.00 including p&p

ISBN 1 899070 05 2

CONTENTS

		Page
	Preface	1
Benn, Roseanne	Themes and issues in training the adult educator	2
Aleksander, Tadeusz	Training adult educators in Poland	7
Arnom, Nomi	Educating teacher educators	10
Chivers, Geoff and Chowdry, Nikki	The training of adult educators in Western Europe by open and distance learning methods	14
Davison, Howard	The formation of prisoners' own educational systems and their relationships to 'outside' adult educators: re-defining the boundaries of a discussion on educating the adult educator	21
Dymock, Darryl	Encouraging reflective practice in adult educators studying through distance education	28
Elsdon, Konrad	Training in and for voluntary organisations in the UK	37
Enggaard. Ellen and Marstal, Helle	Integrated practice: reflections on the need for a new concept in our education of adult educators	44
Fusé, Miho and Yaguchi, Etsuko	The role of an educator in Kyoudou gakushu (mutual study in a small group): educational provision for young adults in Japan	51
Geron, Rivka and Arnon, Nomi	Developing teacher educators for working with student retrained as teachers in a mid-life career change	56
Hillier, Yvonne	NVQs in higher education tutor training: the candidates' experience	61
Hunt, Cheryl	Mirror images: reflective practice in the training of adult educators	71
Jackson, Ann	When is staff development not staff development? When it's training	78
Jakubowski, Witold	The cultural sources of dilemmas in adult educators training in contemporary Poland	85
Jones, David	Training art tutors in adult education	92
Kurantowicz, Ewa	Adult educators for voluntary groups in the Polish transformation period	99
Lavrnya, Ilija and Klapan, Aanita	Training adult educators for working with adults in Croatia	106
Small, Nick	An open window for the training of adult educators: higher education.	112
Stehlik, Tom	Recognising prior learning and assessing current competency in the training of adult educators-does it devalue the learning process?	119

PREFACE

The University of Exeter, Department of Continuing and Adult Education continued the successful series of International Conferences on Educating Adult Educators at Crossmead Conference Centre, University of Exeter, on 8 - 11 July 1998. The Conference was aimed at those interested and involved in theoretical and practical aspects of the education and training of workers in adult and continuing education. Participants came from United Kingdom, Poland, Israel, Canada, Australia, Denmark, Japan and Croatia. Seventeen papers were presented in workshops during the three days. The discussion was wide ranging and stimulating. These papers, together with two by participants who were, at the last minute, unable to attend, are presented in this University of Exeter Centre for Research in Continuing Education Occasional Paper as a further contribution to the ongoing debate about the educating and professionalisation of adult educators.

The Conference was planned by Roseanne Benn and Roger Fieldhouse from the University of Exeter. We should like to thank Clare Millington, Annet Coles and Julie Chipchase of the Department of Continuing and Adult Education for all their hard work in looking after the conference arrangement and Louise Benn for her help with conference registration.

It is hoped to continue and extend the dialogue at the 4th Conference in Denmark in 2000. Please contact the editor to be placed on the mailing list at the address of the Centre given earlier.

Themes and issues in training the adult educator

Roseanne Benn, University of Exeter, UK

This is the proceedings of the third in this series of international conferences on training the adult educator. It seems timely to take this opportunity to reflect over the themes and issues that arose from all three conferences (Benn and Fieldhouse 1994, Collins 1995)

The first conference came about for quite pragmatic reasons. It had become clear by 1992 that, in the UK at least, several factors were conspiring together to cause an explosion in adult education. These included a realisation on the Government's part that without a well-trained workforce Britain plc would fall behind in the global market and the consequent investment in continuing vocational education and professional development. In parallel, notions of wider participation and access worked hand-in-hand with the need of the further education system for more students to bring a higher proportion of adults into the formal education system. Suddenly adult education was jerked from the freedom and obscurity of the margins into the privileges and constraints of the mainstream. Tutors in further and higher education, experienced in teaching younger students, were thrown into teaching adults from a wide variety of cultures and backgrounds. At the same time, swingeing financial cuts in the education system resulted in job insecurities, larger classes and less class contact time. The emphasis in Thatcherite Britain on 'education for work' led to the assumption that 'worthwhile' education was synonymous with accredited education and funding became heavily focused on qualification-bearing work. Further education colleges began to realise that tutors need to have at least rudimentary training in teaching adults (Foden 1992 particularly chapter 12). These factors led to a sharp increase in the number of training courses for adult educators. This development re-ignited the debate about adult education and professionalism. Some of us involved in university provision felt it would be valuable to explore issues around training the adult educator with colleagues in an attempt to prevent expansion diluting quality, gaining insight and richness by making this an international occasion.

The result was a conference at Wadham College Oxford on 13-15 September 1993 aimed at those interested and involved in theoretical and practical aspects of the training and development of teachers in adult education, both full and part-time. It was attended by 35 participants from twelve countries (Australia, Belgium, Canada, France, Greece, Israel, Japan, Spain, Sweden, Switzerland, UK and USA). Nineteen papers were presented in workshops giving rise to a lively and illuminating dialogue.

The Conference addressed professionalism, the nature of provision and the wider context of political thinking and social and educational policy.

Issues included the dichotomy between adult education as a profession with consequent status and recognition and as a social movement with consequent informality and flexibility. This relates to one of the fundamental problems facing professionals in adult education that adult educators are not necessarily recognised as such either by themselves or by others. They are often highly qualified but in a discipline other than adult education; experienced but not trained; part-time and often hourly paid. Where qualifications do exist they are often concerned with professional competence rather than with adult education itself, seen as an academic discipline and field of research. These factors arguably lead to a context-bound conception of the aims and purposes of adult education. If adult education is to be a profession, it will need not only to identify core and broader contextual knowledge but also 'gateway' entry to the profession through acquisition of this knowledge. It will need to

develop a set of values and incorporate a code of ethics, both transmitted by systematic and critical formal education. This raises issues of what might be a suitable core curriculum and appropriate pedagogy; requirements for initial induction to the profession and subsequent continuing professional development; and the need to make explicit the underlying ethics and beliefs of the profession. As with all professional training, there is a need to balance theory with practice and competence and develop approaches such as the reflective practitioner that allow the professional to operate effectively in their actual practice.

But professionals do not operate in a vacuum and are affected by wider social policies and the political and ideological context. There may well be incompatibilities between political forces and professional values particularly in a profession with beliefs and practices founded in notions of social justice. The demand for standards and competencies can either be seen as significantly improving professional education or resulting in more narrowly focused provision. This limitation arguably reinforces exclusion and works against an inclusive educational culture which serves to break down barriers and incorporate 'otherness'. The difficult juggling act is to develop a process of professionalisation embedded in firm academic and professional foundations that is neither exclusive in its powerfulness nor an obedient arm of the State.

All-in-all it was a fascinating conference raising fundamental issues around professionalism and practice.

But the second conference in Canmore, Canada on 14-17 May 1995 with 40 papers was quite different. Different, of course, in the venue: a move from the dreaming spires of Oxford to the unbelievable beauty of the Canadian Rockies; different in the high proportion of English-as-a-first-language participants from mainly North America, Britain and Australia but also different in a more fundamental way. The world was a harder place particularly in North America as was articulated in Michael Collins's editorial.

> In view of the unrelenting cutbacks and restructuring initiatives undermining publicly funded education, the original intent of the Canmore meeting was to ascertain whether a convincing case could still be made for the maintaining and developing university-based adult education. More to the point, are we still able to muster the level of commitment and political will needed to defend our academic adult education programs, extension divisions and extra-mural departments?

Though entitled *Educating the adult educator: the role of the university*, the dominant theme of the conference became concerned with contemporary political discourse in adult education with a concentration on ethical commitments and political insights. This led to two sets of issues, one within the papers and one concerning the processes of the conference. It is difficult to convey the latter to anyone not there. The flavour can best be expressed in an excerpt of a poem written by Peter Willis about the conference

> angry responses: passion, fire born
> of losses, wounds already suffered.
> Voices challenge; call the scholar's
> detachment *colluding with the*
> *enemy* Reclaims the educator's engaged
> calling: not detached, not surveying,
> measuring an objectivised world: messing
>
> changing and changed by it. Detachment
> smells of the quisling, the collaborator. We

are critics, activists, singers, poets not servants
of rational economics not developers
of our friends, neighbours, enemies
renamed *human resources*.

Heady stuff indeed but the processes resulted in feelings of division within the group, of insecurity and exclusion. The issues in the papers reflected to some extent the process divisions. One strand concentrated on the critical dimension of adult education; not training but an examination of the wider social and political context within which adult education and the training of adult educators takes part. This concentrated on notions of social purpose, justice, democracy, inclusivity in a postmodern world. It critiqued not just society but also adult educators for failing to acknowledge and be responsive to the needs of 'others'. Adult education for the marginalised was illustrated through case studies including Belfast, prison education, the sex industry (yes that is right!), First Nation people and anti-nuclear advocacy. Within current political climates, universities are changing. Is there a fundamental contradiction between the values and ethos of universities and those of adult education? Is working in the formal education system 'colluding with the enemy'? And a word about training. Is it for engagement, understanding, competence and creativity or to produce a docile compliant educated workforce?

The other strand quietly and calmly concentrated more on policy, administration and training. The effects of globalisation occupied this strand as did the postmodern notion of the changing nature of knowledge. These came together in the concept of the 'Learning Society' with its emphasis on self-directed auto-didactic modes of informal learning. Alternative teaching and learning processes such as the reflective practitioner approach, anomaly-based learning and collaborative learning were discussed. The notion of learning organisations raised its head and, an echo back to Oxford, the issue of professionalisation was touched on as to whether a group of people with an overwhelmingly part-time orientation should seek full-time legitimisation.

Exeter on 8-11 July 1998 with its cathedral, moors and sea - well, what themes and issues considered there by the participants from Australia, Canada, Croatia, Denmark, Israel, Japan, Poland, and the UK? One of the major themes was change: changes in society, changes in the learning needs of adults, changes in the training of tutors who teach those adults and visions of how adult education and adult educators could contribute to the changes.

In the UK, for example, Tony Blair's Learning Society, Learning Cities, Learning for Life, in fact Learning, Learning and still more Learning, has placed adult education absolutely in the centre of the mainstream not just of education but of government thinking. Will our system of training adult educators be able to prepare educators effectively for this New Britain? How will our training locate itself in the proposed Institute of Learning and teaching for Higher Education? On the one hand, the considerable number of recent government papers which have touched on adult education. On the other, the irony that despite this concentration, adult education within local education authorities in England is under siege, and in many places has disappeared or is disappearing fast. Other countries going through even greater transition are also looking to adult education. What training will these adult educators require to cope with practical and organisational change in periods of political and social transformation? In Poland, adult education is an integral part of the move to democracy. There education is seen not only as transformation and as the critical analyst of social reality but also transformation itself is seen as an educative process. In Israel, adult education is seen as central to the process of absorbing large numbers of new immigrants. This has led to a demand for qualified competent adult educators. The issues around providing these, often from the existing pool of qualified teachers from the compulsory sector, are familiar to colleagues

from around the world. Fundamental questions concerning processes, methods and values need to be drawn together within overarching theoretical frameworks. Didactic approaches need to be replaced by dialogue and respect for all others. Denmark and Japan are moving towards experiential, group-based learning approaches for adult educators which lead rather than follow changes in the society at large.

There were other changes to be considered. An issue echoing Canmore - if whole countries need adult education, then the formal system cannot and indeed should not look to provide all this education. The growing number of voluntary groups will require leaders and these may require training. What kind of education do they need, what will they be attracted to? Will the greater social need for competent adult educators, whether for the formal or informal sectors, mean that the adult educators themselves will recognise this and seek training through formal means? Or will more modest and informal offerings be more attractive? If education is seen as most relevant delivered in the context of practice, then mentoring may be a way forward and, if this 'training potential' is to be fostered, adult educators and educators of adult educators could contribute through a cascade process

Another change that dominates many of our professional lives is that brought about by the fast moving world of the new technologies. One paper dealt explicitly with open and distance learning (ODL) through the lens of a European project on the development of adult educators in six European countries. Interestingly it concludes by suggesting that ODL is unlikely to replace face-to-face (F2F) environments. Hence adult educators will continue to need skills in F2F teaching but they ignore the powerful adjunct of ODL at their peril.

Implementation of current ideas in adult education received attention too. The concept and practice of the reflective practitioner underpinned much of the discussion and very much caught the mood of the conference. It was notable that the two papers which concentrated on this theme concerned the use of reflective practice in distance learning courses. It was also clear, both in the papers and the discussion, that the term was being given a variety of different meaning. I particularly was struck by a learner's notion in one of these papers of a third eye, an 'I see why' eye.

Competencies in practice gave rise to considerable stimulating discussion. There was support for the belief that NVQs (the UK competency awards) increased confidence for candidates and affirmed their practice and their professionalism. But, in general, competency-based learning was viewed negatively. One paper linked competencies with the recognition of prior learning and questioned whether this hijacks real learning and whether the learning process is more or less important than formal credentials. Are we in effect saying to our students 'I can't give you a brain but I can give you a diploma!'. Should we, as adult educators, be moving beyond competence anyway and striving not for competence but for excellence? The discussion on evaluation of student learning was taken a stage further when we were asked to consider the premise that what is needed for adult education is a way of identifying the learning that is to take place which does not assume that, having reached a certain point, the task is accomplished. This concept of 'educational benefit' moves away from absolutes and competencies towards a position of relative values. This raises issues of evidence, of course, but takes us back to a debate that many educators feel is at the heart of all formal adult education ie how to quantify the important rather than make important the quantifiable.

This links well with the argument that staff development needs to be about more than time-limited externally devised accredited training programmes. It needs to be based on core values and practices influenced by the local culture. There is a wide diversity of adults who wish to learn and a consequent wide diversity of adult educators. This means an inevitable diversity of knowledge and skills based on theoretical work integrated with practice,

experiential learning, and empathy. The aim that adult educators might become a body of scholarly practitioners is surely an ongoing process of lifelong learning

But conferences are about more than papers, discussion and ideas. The very real joy of the Exeter conference was the putting into practice all the finer claims of adult education - respect, creative mutual listening, laughter. No poetry here but plenty of music-making and singing!

So three very different conferences reflecting the times and preoccupations of the conference organisers and the participants. The first concentrating on issues of professionalisation and practice within the contradictory objectives of political thought and adult education. The second concentrating on the context with its threat to university adult education and the moving off the agenda of notions of social justice though more hard-edges ideas of postmodernity, globalisation and learning organisations crept in. The third conference with its underlying awareness of changing societies, the changing role of adult educators and the consequent changes required in their training together with interesting explorations of new modes of delivery and examples of good practice. And echoing in the background the informal/formal divide and a sense that adult educators need perhaps a new form of training to fit themselves for a very different role if the learning society is ever to genuinely come about.

References

Benn, R. and Fieldhouse, R. (eds) (1994) *Training and Professional Development in Adult and Continuing Education* Exeter: University of Exeter Centre for Research in Continuing Education Occasional Paper Number 1.

Collins, M.(ed) (1995) *Educating the Adult Educator: Role of the University* Saskatchewan: College of Education, University of Saskatchewan.

Foden, F. (1992) *The education of part-time teachers in further and higher education* Leeds: University of Leeds.

Training adult educators in Poland

Tadeusz Aleksander, Jagiellonian University, Poland

Introduction

Training adult educators has a long tradition in Poland. It dates back to the period between the wars, when adult education was conducted mainly by social organisations. Every few years the societies organised courses on methods and organisation of educational work for teachers, librarians, choir and orchestra conductors and managers of educational activities. Also in various regions of the country courses for the personnel of the societies were held. In 1925 Helena Redlinska - at that time a very prominent Polish theoretician and organiser of adult education, a member of the Polish delegation to the conference on adult education in Cambridge in 1929 and propagator of the output of the conference in Poland - established a private School of Social and Education Work within the Free Polish University. The school provided higher education for adult educators, i.e. organisers of adult education in associations, and librarians. The alumni were then employed in the biggest institutions of adult education in Poland.

After WW II the Poles strengthened their efforts in creating a new system of training adult educators. During the 50 years after the war this training was developed in two forms: short courses and full 5 years' academic studies both for candidates for the profession (regular studies) and for those already employed in adult education (extramural studies). The development of these forms of education and additional training of educators was supported by the state's curricular and organisation suggestions and subsidies. At that time the state wanted to make adult educators a cadre of political agitators providing ideological education of the society and strengthening the communist system imposed on Poland.

Just after WW II, priority was given to the development of adult educators' training courses. They were organised by educational associations and continually developed trade unions which, apart from social aid for workers, took care of educational activities and undertook various cultural initiatives.

With the stabilisation and development of various forms of adult education, more complex forms of training adult educators appeared. First, in the 50's at the lyceum level and then, in the 70's at the university level. (Exceptionally, the Jagiellonian University offered higher studies in this field as early as in 1946 - 1952). The latter form, called pedagogy of culture and education were organised in 10 Polish universities and pedagogical schools of academic level. They provided instruction for many regular students and for employees of schools, course organising institutions and education associations (extramural studies). Moreover, in various departments, like e.g. in administration, banking, power industry, etc. various forms of internal training and advancement of educators were organised. Most often they were courses.

At the beginning of the 90's, in consequence of political changes the system of education and training personnel employed in the institutions of adult education in Poland was. It was changed not only from the administrative point of view but also in its ideological and contents aspects. The change was necessary also because new people joined the group of adult educators. During my recent investigations in 314 institutions conducting economic activities (plants) and social institutions (administration, judicature, telecommunication and others) I found that apart from university teachers and state departmental research institutions many high rank practitioners (engineers, lawyers, economist, businessmen) were engaged in professional training of the employees. Many of them did not have andragogical qualifications for such activities. It was necessary to teach them the methods of teaching adults. Due to a variety of forms it is not easy to say how those people learnt how to teach adults, how they improved their methods and skills. They took advantage of various possibilities of supplementing this knowledge. One of them are pedagogical courses. Such courses are organised in the departmental and trade multidirectional training centres for administration, banking, power industry, mining, the railways, judicature, health service, finances, telecommunication, etc. In each of

the trades there are several educational and training centres for various groups of employees. Pedagogical courses for those wishing to obtain the teaching licence in various trade cells of adult education (performed in particular employing institutions and in the centres themselves) are also a part of the centres' activities. Following the suggestions of the co-ordinating educational authorities such courses last 90 hours. The curricula are constructed by invited academic teachers or other experts in adult education, and then consulted and subject to approval by a leading training centre in the trade.

My analysis of such curricula shows that they include selected problems of various disciplines: psychology of adults, social principles of adult education, adult pedagogy, general principles of adult education, detailed methods of professional training, theoretical and practical principles of adult education (physical, moral, aesthetic), etc. In order to elaborate these problems in selected centres of various trades or departments the course participants are separated from their usual work. Such courses usually last for 2 weeks, often with a week's break in the middle, during which the candidates for educators prepare their papers. The instruction is usually carried out in a form of classes and seminars, less often lectures are delivered. Much stress is put on mastering by the participants the skill to apply active and audio-visual methods of adult education. In the end of the course the participants take an examination. If successful, they receive a licence to teach in various forms of professional training in a trade or department. Additionally organised 2-year pedagogical studies in universities are another form of contemporary pedagogical preparation of educators for adult educational institutions, better developed from the organisational point of view. They are facultative studies for students of various disciplines who wish to have a right to teach their subjects at schools, including adult education. Such studies are more and more often organised in universities, technical, agricultural and economic institutions of higher education. As a rule they include: psychology, sociology, sociology of education, various sorts of pedagogy, didactics, methods of teaching a subject selected by the student. The instruction in a form of lectures and classes as well as practice ends with a certificate authorising the alumni to teach, also in adult education institutions. In some academic institutions such studies are conducted in two variants: one for regular students and the other for the alumni who wish to teach at schools and those who are already employed as unqualified teachers. The discussed 2-year studies more and more often replace the earlier pedagogical education of students studying teaching disciplines.

The third form of training and pedagogical development of adults educators in Poland are occasionally organised post-diploma studies for the managers of adult education institutions. Such studies are offered by big associations dealing with adult education or by some academic institutions. At present such studies are conducted at the Nicholas Copernicus University in Torun. Established in 1994, it is addressed to adult education organisers and teachers. The instruction lasts for 2 semesters (300 hours). The costs of its functioning are partly met by the Ministry of National Education. The problems covered include: traditions of adult education in Poland, theoretical principles of adult education, organisation of adult education institutions, forms and methods of contemporary adult education, application of computers in adult education, opportunities of social and cultural animation, theory and organisation of self-education, etc. Instruction is provided by the University's academic staff and invited experts from other Polish universities. The program is very popular with people from all the country. In the first year of its activities it attracted 88 people from 32 cities and towns. It is the only school of this kind in Poland. The intention to establish a similar program in Krakow has not been implemented yet due to personnel problems.

It should be stressed that pedagogical studies (discipline: pedagogy) are also of some importance for the preparation of adult education organisers and teachers. They are organised in all the 17 pedagogical higher schools in Poland. Some of them offer master's degree in the theory of adult education. The alumni are then employed as educators in general and professional institutions of adult education.

After this short description of education and additional training of adult education organisers and teachers I would like to mention two not fully used forms of improving the qualifications of these people. First, summer methodological conferences for the personnel of adult education institutions.

Such conferences used to occur. Managers of adult education institutions met in vacations resorts and discussed new and modern organisational and methodological solutions in adult education and possibilities to implement them in schools and other institutions of adult education. Another form, unused yet, is a possibility to supplement one's professional education, mainly in pedagogy and, consequently, obtain qualification degrees. It is worth mentioning that teachers in Poland have an opportunity to obtain (and they do) specialisation degrees offered by the provincial (and the central) methodological centres. The degrees are: III, II and I. In order to obtain them the teachers must show a special committee of the centre their specific innovations, methodological and organisational achievements in teaching a subject, study recommended literature and pass a qualification exam before the committee. Such degrees are available for teachers in all subjects, but unfortunately not in methods of teaching adults. I trust that both these chances will be taken and advantages they have for training adult educators will be well used.

Educating teacher educators

Nomi Arnon,
MOFET Institute for Research, Curriculum and Program Development for Teacher Educators, Israel and Levinsky College of Education, Israel.

This paper describes a special project for new pedagogy instructors during their first years in their new occupation. Most of them are experienced teachers, and mentors of student teachers, but they feel that being a pedagogy instructor might mean more than what they know about learning and teaching. The aim of the program, conducted at the MOFET Institute for Research, Curriculum and Program Development for Teacher Educators, was to help new pedagogy instructors to prepare themselves for their new role, and to give them a supportive framework during their first years in the new occupation.

Teacher Education as a Profession

The current concept of teaching as a profession has emerged from the previously held concept of training mostly by modeling. This development has precipitated a fundamental change in the training of future teachers. No longer are student teachers those who learn something and then implement it in the classroom. Rather, they are now asked to become more autonomous and reflective: learning from personal experience and combining theory and practice. This concept has led to changes in the pre-service training of teachers, wherein more emphasis is placed on the academic level of studies on the one hand, and on reflective practice teaching, on the other. This change has also led to the future development of teacher education as a profession in its own right, where formal training to acquire the necessary tools and theories is required.

The MOFET Institute for Research, Curriculum and Program Development for Teacher Educators

The MOFET Institute for Research, Curriculum and Program Development for Teacher Educators is a unique institute that for the last decade has been concerned with the preparation of such programs to assist in this professionalization: preparation for and enrichment of teacher educators.

The Pedagogy Instructors

The pedagogy instructors are the segment of teacher educators who are responsible for the practice of the teacher student's studies.

A Master's degree obtained in any discipline taught in schools, or in pedagogy, is a prerequisite for workings as a pedagogy instructor. Usually, the pedagogy instructor is hired because s/he is known to the staff of the college based on his/her teaching experience at a school. Entry level pedagogy instructors are expected to make changes in attitudes and methods from working with young children to working with students who are young adults. But they have not been prepared for these shifts because up to now there were no frameworks in which these issues where dealt with. (Ziv, Kats , Zilberstein , Tamir 1995).

The Program for New Pedagogy Instructors in the MOFET Institute

The project at the MOFET Institute for beginning and relatively new pedagogy instructor included two different programs:

- A one year in-service course for beginners and those with limited experience. This program has been in operation for five years
- A 10 day pre-service marathon workshop for novices.

Rational and Course of Action

New pedagogy instructors reported concern about difficulties in their functioning in the new job in the following areas:

- Lack of knowledge of the contents, like curriculum development and didactics that they will have to teach, both on high academic level and in practice
- Lack of tools for conducting their student groups
- Difficulty in adapting their teaching-learning methods to young adult students as compared to children
- Feeling of being manipulated by their students' demands for immediate solutions, and the latters' lack of patience to finding out solutions on their own
- Lack of faith in themselves as an authoritative professionals, because sometimes their students are more experienced in the procedures of teacher education than they themselves are.

Basic assumptions

- Young teacher students, in spite of their young age, have different motives, modes of learning, and expectations from their teachers than children in schools (Tokatly 1998).
- Young teacher students, possess knowledge and experience that can be used as a learning resource for developing their professional thinking.
- The instructors themselves are also adult students, who have characteristics of adult learners that must be taken into account in the planning of their training.
- Facing a new career, the instructors, in spite of their professional experience in education, and their general skills as adult persons, exhibit anxiety and need much empathy and encouragement.
- There is a similarity between the novice pedagogy instructor and the teacher student in their professional stage of development. Both are in the survival stage (Fuller 1969).
- Being aware of this similarity might help the pedagogy instructor to understand their students' difficulties and to be empathetic with them (Kron, Yerusahlmi 1994).

Aims

- Investigating theoretical and practical aspects of the pedagogy instruction
- Examining issues related to adult education referring to training for a career
- Helping the pedagogy instructors to look into their tool-box and to examine the tools and skills they master: defining which of them would be of use in their new task, which are not appropriate and what the new skills and tools they still have to accomplish are
- Helping the pedagogy instructors to develop tools and skills for their new task
- Using the knowledge and the personal and professional experience of the instructors as a learning resource
- Helping instructors develop reflective thinking about their methods and their style of guidance
- Developing a sense of community and group support.

Subjects and Content

The role concept of the Pedagogy Instructor was dealt in the course from the following aspects:

- **The Pedagogy Instructor as a Teacher Trainer**
  - The role concept of the pedagogy instructor
  - Reconciling the dilemma of the role of guidance and the role of evaluation
  - Models of guidance
  - Guiding skills: listening, counseling, giving feedback, leading a discussion
  - Guiding and supervising the practical experience of the student in school:
    - Pedagogical dilemmas in training teacher students

- Guiding the planing for school work
- Criteria of evaluation of the practice
- methods of observation
- giving feedback
- Developing reflective thinking
- The Pedagogy Journal.

- **The Pedagogy Instructor as a Teacher**
  - Basic issues in adult learning, and in training for a career
  - Topics and issues in didactics
  - Topics and issues in curriculum development.

- **The Pedagogy Instructor as a Group Facilitator**
  - The first meeting: making acquaintance, creating an atmosphere of acceptance
  - Making a working-learning contract: coordinating expectations regarding both content and working methods, prospects and limits
  - Group processes in the guidance group
  - Awareness of group processes in the guidance group
  - Assertive behavior as opposite to aggressive or submissive attitudes
  - Exchanging feedback as a method of growth
  - Closure of the group activity: summing up the year activity, final feedback, separating.

Working Methods and Activities

Working methods were based on the Basic assumptions mentioned above: both upon the requirements of reflective guidance and on the needs of the adult student (Knowles 1985, 1986; Shon 1983; Tokatli 1994, 1997 Heb). Much emphasis was given to accepting atmosphere in the workshop which was based on mutual relationship and collegial respect and on the belief we learn mostly by the modeling that we are exposed to.

An emphasis was given on learning by practicing. Creative activities like painting, role playing, and outdoor activities proved to be very fruitful in bringing up authentic materials, which would not easily come out by using conventional cognitive methods like conversations or discussions. These methods proved to enable the group to start working on meaningful issues in a relatively short time. This was enabled due to the supportive atmosphere that has been created from the very beginning.

Some of the working methods and activities were:

- Planning the workshop as an answer to an identified need
- Cooperation and maximum involvement of all participants
- Coordinating expectations regarding both content and working methods
- Exchanging feedback after each meeting to examine the appropriateness and relevance of the material being taught and the teaching and learning methods being used
- Opening up an assortment of teaching-learning frameworks: individual learning, working in small groups, discussions in the plenum, lectures, and brain storming
- Experimenting with a variety of forms of learning: simulation, case studies, creativity etc.
- Pinpointing the parallel processes between the learning in the group of the instructors and the processes taking place in the groups they lead
- Modeling the concept of the teacher as a facilitator rather than as the sole source of knowledge

- Incorporating the professional background and experience of each participant by encouraging the unique contribution of individuals, each in his own special field
- Paying attention to and showing concern for the physical comfort of the participants.

Summary and Implications for the Future

This program has been going on for about five years. Six in-service groups and two summer pre-service marathon groups (15-20 student in each) have attended this program till now.

In their feedback the participants report about the importance of this framework as a resource of skills and concepts for their new occupation. They are emphasizing the importance of the support of the group and of the existence of an address where one can freely 'ask silly questions and get proper answers'. Some of them would say: 'I can't imagine myself surviving the first year of work in the teachers college without this course!'

The MOFET Institute is now starting a unique experimental in-service two years course of Professionalization in Teacher Education, referring to Pedagogy Instruction. Yet, these studies will not substitute the course described above which gives an answer to the immediate and pressing needs of the novice teacher educators facing the practice of their new profession.

References

English

Fuller F F (1969), 'Concerns of teachers: A developmental conceptualization, *American Educational Research Journal*. 6, (2), 207-226.

Mezirow J. (1991) *'Transformative dimensions of adult learning'*, San Francisco: Jossey Bass.

Knowles M S (1985) *'Andragogy in Action'*, San Francisco: Jossey Bass.

Knowles M S (1986) *'Using learning contracts'*, San Francisco: Jossey Bass.

Shon D. (1983) *'The reflective Practitioner: How Professionals Think in Action'*, New York, Basic Books.

Hebrew

Kron T (1994), 'What is supervision: dilemmas, attitudes and models' in Kron T and Yerushalmi H (eds) *Supervision of Psychotherapy*, pp.11-27 The Magnes press, The Hebrew University, Jerusalem.

Tokatki R (1994), 'Curriculum Development for Adults', in Kirmayer P and Bar Shalom T (eds) *Gadish*, Vol B, pp 31-32, The Ministry of Education, The Department of Adult Education, Jerusalem

Tokatki R (1997), 'An Andragogy-Developmental Model in Community Work' , in Kirmayer P and Basok E (eds) *Gadish*, Vol C-D , pp 74-91, The Ministry of Education, The Department of Adult Education, Jerusalem

Tokatki R (1998), 'In-service Training of Teachers and The Teacher Training Institutions', in Shai A (ed) *Bamichlala*, No 9, pp 105-127, The David Yelin College of Education, Jerusalem.

Ziv S, Kats P, Zilberstein M, Tamir P (1995). *Characteristics of the Work of Pedagogy Instructors in Teachers Education System in Israel*, Research Report, The MOFET Institute, The Ministry of Education, Tel Aviv.

The training of adult educators in Western Europe by open and distance learning methods

Geoff Chivers and Nikki Chowdry, University of Sheffield, UK

Introduction

The extent to which open and distance learning methods are used in adult education and training is very variable across Western Europe. This was highlighted for us during a conference of the European Society for Research into the Education of Adults (ESREA) in Strobl, Austria in 1995. A thematic workshop on continuing professional development was held over several days of the one week conference, and several speakers referred to a potential role for open and distance learning (ODL) in their provision of learning opportunities for workers. While chairing a session towards the end of the week we asked those present, who numbered around thirty from a dozen European countries whether they had ever actually used ODL methods in their adult education or training programmes. We also asked whether anyone had ever studied by these methods. In response to both question only two or three hands went up, indicating that the gap between theory and practice was very wide in this area.

This was something of a surprise to us since ODL methods are very widely used in adult education and training in the UK (Chivers, 1996). We immediately decided that we should investigate the possibility of obtaining funding from the EU SOCRATES programme, under the ODL strand, to undertake a project on developing adult educators in Western Europe in the field of ODL. The choice of the SOCRATES programme as a possible funding source was partly due to the fact that the information and forms for bids under the ODL strand had arrived with us in Sheffield just before departure to Strobl, and we had carried them to the conference.

The final hours at the conference were spent identifying possible partners from other countries for the project bid, and firming up the main theme. The proposal forms were completed in outline on the journey back from Strobl to Sheffield, as there was now just one week in which to complete and send off the forms. On receipt of the outline forms all the potential partners agreed to take part, sending formal letters to this effect signed by their institutional head. Detailed costings were completed by the University of Sheffield Finance Department, and the bid went off to Brussels by the deadline.

Aims of the project and project partners

As the whole area of developing adult educators and trainers by ODL was new for most partners, we wanted to involve organisations with some experience of training adult educators by conventional means, and which had a commitment to the ODL field for the future. We felt that 5 partners were sufficient to give us a reasonable Western European coverage without making the project unwieldy and unproductive. At this time central and eastern European countries were not eligible for involvement in SOCRATES projects.

The partners and their organisations for the project were:

1. Maria Helena Antunes: Univesidade Lusofona de Humanidades e Technologies, Lisbon

2. Dr Gerhard Bisovsky: Volkshockschule Meidling, Vienna

3. Robert Hoghielm and Petros Gougoulakis: Stockholm Institute of Education

4. Marianne Pederson: Royal Danish Teachers Institute, Copenhagen

5. The authors, who acted as project coordinators, liaising with the SOCRATES Office in Brussels, and also took a full part in the practical project work.

While we were pleased to involve partners from countries with very different adult education traditions, in retrospect it would have been helpful to include a partner from France, since none of the project team was very familiar with the French situation. The Swedish and Danish partners had a long track record of initial training of adult educators by face-to-face methods, leading to certification to practice as adult educators. Neither had any experience at this time of ODL methods. The Portuguese partner had experience of training adult educators and trainers, including via the production and dissemination of videotape material. In this case the emphasis was on developing continuing vocational trainers via short courses which did not offer accreditation. The Austrian partner had experience of organising short in-service courses for experienced adult educators, including the many part-time tutors employed by his institution. At this time ODL methods were in their infancy.

The authors' institution offered qualification courses at postgraduate level in the fields of continuing education, training and development, and (computer) networked collaborative learning, all part-time and flexibly delivered with a strong emphasis on ODL delivery by various means.

The mix of experience, was ideal for the project envisaged, since a major aim was to cascade expertise within the project team, and to learn from each other's very different experiences and perspectives.

The aims of the project were agreed as:

1. To investigate the current situation in regard to the use of ODL in the development of already experienced adult educators in Europe.

2. To determine what is currently taught to adult educators about ODL methods, and to what extent they are already using these methods in their work.

3. To develop pilot initiatives in each country involved in the project, utilising ODL methods for the in-service development of adult educators, especially in remote or difficult areas which are quite inaccessible for face-to-face teaching, or create difficulties for conventional classes for other reasons.

4. To orientate the new learning programme heavily towards the experiential learning of adult educators through work based issues, and to develop them as researchers.

5. To identify existing ODL methods and products which could be exploited, and adapted for use in the project.

6. To develop new ODL methods and products

7. To work collaboratively and compare results at each stage of the project

8. To evaluate the pilot initiatives and the overall project in depth.

9. To disseminate the outcomes across Europe (west and east).

Management of the Project

The bid was submitted in September 1995, and we received notification of its success in early April 1996. Unfortunately, the contract was backdated until November 1995, which was non-negotiable in Brussels and resulted in the project team having to complete one year's work in 9 months. The project was fortunately renewed for a further period in the continuing 1996, but only until the end of August 1997, and not the end of the calendar year as we had been led to believe. Additionally, extra matching funding had to be secured from our own resources, such that the Commission granted the project 45% of the required funding, and the institutions involved had to find 54% 'matching funding'.

Nikki Chowdry was appointed as project manager and funded from the SOCRATES grant, together with a half-time clerk, Sue Brown, while Geoff Chivers acted as project director with some of his salary costs paid by the University of Sheffield 'matched' against the project (as for the core partners' salary costs in the other 4 countries).

Nearly all of the overall planning, organising and reporting work for the project was carried out from Sheffield by Nikki, Sue and Geoff, while the project partners focused on the specific aspects of their national projects.

Three face-to-face meetings of the project team were held each year, to consolidate on the communication by e-mail that went on virtually around the clock. Communication problems abound in European working across 5 countries, especially given the complexity of European Commission projects. The working language was English, which created difficulties for the Portuguese partner in particular. Equally problematic were the cultural differences between the countries, and the problems thrown up by the quite different traditions in regard to adult learning. To give one example, the gap between adult education and adult vocational training, which is quite wide in Scandinavia, and which can certainly be identified in Austria and the UK, hardly exists in Portugal, such that there is no real difference between the English terms 'adult educator' and 'adult trainer'. In the project this particular concern was overcome by referring to adult educators and trainers throughout its life.

Apart from communication battles, the major management problems have been:

- Trying to complete all the work to the original aims and objectives in 16 months instead of 24 months. Urgent deadlines were with us all the time leading to work having to be rushed. All the partners had difficulty keeping up the work rate. The Sheffield team found it difficult to run the project as co-ordinators and play a full part as a partner. As a result some of the Sheffield specific work had to be curtailed.

- Project finances have been a problem. Apart from not receiving as much from Brussels as we requested, the finances have been held in the UK in ecus, and with the rising value of sterling have lost value.

- The Swedish partners have received substantial funding for new technologies from their institute during the life of the project, and have tended to press forward with ODL approaches which are not relevant to the other partners at this stage. This has been overcome in part by encouraging them to apply these technologies in the Swedish pilot course, but not in the international working.

- The Danish partners have seen their involvement as an opportunity to develop a full degree course based on ODL delivery. Given the time lags which are familiar to all of us

when planning for a new course and seeking accreditation, it has been difficult to fit our objectives for the project to their timescales.

- Nevertheless, careful planning, prudent financial management and vigorous progress chasing, at and between meetings, has enabled us to meet all the initial project aims to some extent or in full.

Review of ODL in Developing Adult Educators and Trainers in Six Countries of the EU

The first aim of the project turned out to be one of the most difficult, since the task was rather open ended. We were certainly *not* able to consider all the countries of the EU, and in the time available focused primarily on our own, although the Portuguese team were able to consider developments in Spain and the Austrian partners gave some examples of comparable initiatives in Germany.

A full report of this stage of the project is available as a published document (Chivers, Chowdry et al 1997). Space does not permit anything more than a brief reflection on this report, which consists of country reports by the project partners, and an overarching commentary from the authors of this paper.

As we suspected at the outset, the reports make it clear that the UK has a very strong lead over all the other countries reviewed in regard to the utilisation of ODL in adult learning of all kinds. There are many apparent reasons for this lead, including: government policy in setting up the Open University in 1970; substantial government funding to advance open learning in the vocational field in the 1970's and early 1980'; and the withdrawal of government funding from traditional higher and further education, forcing a market orientated, more flexible approach to adult learning provision.

Perhaps surprisingly, Portugal has taken up ODL substantially, at least in the vocational sector, as has Spain. It may be that in the catching up process following the overthrow of fascism in these countries, and in the case of Portugal the influx of very large numbers of relatively sophisticated expatriates returning from the colonies, gave an impetus to consider very modern approaches to workplace learning needs. (A similar trend can be discerned in central Europe currently).

In contrast, the historically well supported adult education services of Denmark and Sweden have continued their 'humanistic' tradition of face-to-face teaching right up to the present and there has been limited emphasis on ODL (Holmberg, 1994).

Bisovsky (1991) reports that attempts to develop legislation to regulate DL development in Austria have failed due to political disputes between the federal and state authorities.

The excitement generated by the Internet is changing perspectives rapidly, and it was especially interesting to note that in our project the partners with the least experience of utilising ODL were the most enthusiastic to experiment with very recent technologies.

Perhaps unsurprisingly, the extent to which countries were utilising ODL in the development of adult educators and trainers mirrored the extent to which they were using ODL in adult learning generally. The UK team were able to identify widespread use of ODL courses and materials, especially for developing higher level professionals in mid-career (ICDL, 1996). The Portuguese partner reported that many adult educators and trainers had learnt how to use (and even how to produce) ODL materials in the training of trainers. In this case, the large

demand for management and business training in Portugal and Spain had led to an emphasis on open learning materials which could be used in support of face-to-face classes. Video materials were being continually developed for sales training, and training in such human relations areas as negotiation, chairing meetings, interviewing, presenting, etc. Clearly, a major driving force is to produce materials in Portuguese.

The Austrian, Danish and Swedish partners reported that very limited use had been made of ODL methods in the development of adult educators in their countries as a formal policy. In reality some text-based guidance materials did represent a basic form of OL materials, and the Austrian partner identified that some language tutors were benefiting from using interactive language learning materials.

Outcomes of the pilot projects

The final outcomes of the pilot projects initiated in each country are not clear as we write, since much work in progress has continued after the September 1997 deadline for the end of the SOCRATES project.

The Portuguese partner has focused on the utilisation of ODL methods for the development of trainers for the small business sector. Trainers have been trained to both produce and utilise ODL materials in the context of training managers of a wide variety of small and medium sized enterprises (SMES). This work is seen as very important in the Portuguese context, since there are very few large employers (over 250 employers) left in Portugal and nearly all economic growth is being generated by SMES.

The Swedish partner has been the most ambitious technologically, and the pilot project in this country has involved a complex teleconferencing based in-service course for adult educators located in the far north, delivered from Stockholm. The project has been fascinating as a foretaste of what will doubtless become a major method of ODL in the next century. However, despite the availability of the technology due to special grant funding, and the expertise of the technical staff involved, each of the three uses of video conferencing during the course suffered considerable technological failures and delays to the detriment of learning. This communication method was backed by extensive use of e-mail between the participants, and computer conferencing, which were considered very effective in learning terms. Nevertheless, the video conferencing element stimulated considerable interest in the course, and this may have marketing implications in countries where text based approaches are regarded as uninspiring today.

The Danish partners have finally completed their course in ODL format, utilising a combination of delivery systems, text based materials, materials on the Web, and interpersonal communication around learning by computer conferencing and e-mail. The obvious advantage of using this approach is that learners utilise these new technologies in their course, and become familiar and confident with them, as well as experiencing them as learning tools and reflecting on their potential for their own courses for adults.

The Austrian partners have developed on several fronts, and have perhaps gained the most from the project. Their pilot project is based in a new adult education college, and one area has now been designated as an open learning centre. All kinds of OL materials and equipment are now being purchased to go into this area, and staff of the college have been trained in its use. The college is also now offering seminars and short courses on how to use ODL in adult education for the benefit of adult educators in Vienna and the surrounding area. Experiments are underway on using e-mail, the Web and computer conferencing for developing adult educators at a distance.

The Sheffield team has focused on developing further text-based materials for training adult educators in the knowledge that rather few of our students have access to e-mail. A module on ODL has been refined and extended, and a wholly new module on adult education in Europe has been written. This material is held on disc and could be turned into Web site format in the future. An experiment to utilise e-mail communication and computer conferencing with a group of students on our postgraduate programme on training and development in Eire was relatively unsuccessful. Although the students involved, many in relatively remote locations, were provided with the relevant software and linkages through the project, few attempted to sustain communications after the initial novelty wore off, especially with each other.

A similar outcome resulted from efforts to link together students from different countries involved in the SOCRATES project towards the end of its life. It seems clear that busy adult educators undertaking an in-service course need some strong incentive to give up time to this kind of activity when it is not locked in as a course requirement at the outset.

The staff involved in running our SOCRATES project, and adult educators involved in distance learning courses do see great benefits in communicating with each other, and with isolated students, by e-mail, and computer conferencing is also favoured where team agreement is needed quickly on management issues.

In light of this finding, we have produced a telematics handbook for the complete beginner, which is being piloted in several countries, and covers various software systems. It is expected that this open learning tool will enable beginners to get started and progress without class attendance. It will also serve as an aide memoir for infrequent users.

Conclusions

We believe that despite various problems faced by the project, which has necessarily operated in less than ideal circumstances, we have met our concrete objectives, and moved forward the training of adult educators by ODL in Europe. The partners are all influential in this field in their own countries, and in several cases had no intention of exploring the ODL field for practical purposes before our intervention.

Several individual partners were being connected to the Internet as the project proceeded, and we perceived a danger of moving to a technology driven approach to learning delivery because of the excitement raised by the new opportunities. It remains our view that for transmission of cognitive knowledge and understanding the well constructed, interactive, text-based materials, which have served adult learners well, will continue to hold their place for years to come. However, for the development of key skills, from computer skills to communication skills, the new technologies have an important place in the development of adult educators. Certainly those wanting to work on European projects will need to develop expertise in this area, as it is assumed in Brussels and is invaluable for day-to-day working.

Nothing from this project indicates that ODL will ever fully replace learning in a face-to-face environment, and all adult educators need to be skilled face-to-face teachers. However, ODL is a powerful adjunct at the least, and in some cases can be the main approach in adult learning, and adult educators will be sidelined if they do not keep abreast of developments, and use ODL confidently as appropriate.

References

Bisovsky, G (1991) 'Blockerte Bildungs reform. Staatliche Erwashsenebildungs Politic, in Osterreich seit 1970', *BLK - Kustatzstudium Fur Pedagogische Mitarbeiter: In Forum E*, 47 (1994) 1, p 29.

Chivers, G (1996) 'The Development of Continuing Education' and Training Professionals: A Research Agenda' paper presented at the ESREA CPD Seminar, Manchester, 2 - 4 February, 1996, published by DACE, University of Sheffield

Chivers, G and Chowdry, N. et al (1997) *Open and Distance Learning in Relation to the Development of Adult Educators and Trainers in Six Countries of the European Union*: an Interim Report, DACE, University of Sheffield

Holmberg, C. (1994) 'Policies, Technologies or Pedagogy. Ways of Developing the Distance Learning Field in Sweden', paper presented at Pedagogy and School Innovation, Tartu University, Estonia, 21-22 October.

ICDL (1996) The International Centre for Distance Learning Database, http:// acacia. open, ac.uk (June 1996 version).

The formation of prisoners' own educational systems and their relationships to 'outside' adult educators: re-defining the boundaries of a discussion on educating the adult educator

Howard S. Davidson, University of Manitoba, Canada

As part of a wider concern for the nature of participatory models in adult education, this paper examines a history of prisoner organized educational systems, with attention given particularly to the roles professional adult educators have played in that history.

Historically, formal adult education has played two closely related roles in the penal context. As a substitute for prison labour it has been used to keep prisoners occupied and thus manageable. As 'correctional education' it became a form of social engineering (Davidson, 1998). A few outside educators (i.e., professional, non-prisoners working for penal or external educational authorities) appreciate the contradictions between these roles and the 'essentially egalitarian intent of adult education' (Collins & Niemi, 1989, p. 193). Many continue to believe that educators can be trained to work in these coercive settings and do more than keep idle prisoners occupied and reduce recidivism (Williford, 1994). I think this belief is mistaken. Under current conditions of extreme overcrowding, privatization, cut backs in basic and higher education programs, renewed political support for the use of prison labour, and the newest technocratic rationalization of penal regimes, the outside educator is increasingly a component of the correctional enterprise (Davidson, 1998).

Outsiders can perform a different role if they set aside efforts to modify 'correctional education' and attend critically to the potential for participatory models which exist in vibrant forms of prisoner organized activities. Given the dominate ideology, many will think this consideration is romantic, if not actually offensive. To them I say that a productive engagement with prisoners' own educational systems is defensible on the grounds that only through the politicalisation of prisoners and not through their domestication is it possible to liberate a knowing subject and to transform the social relations that define and punish criminalised behaviour.

The body of this paper explores a history of prisoner organized educational activities with particular emphasis on the relationships between these activities and outside professional educators. For the most part outsiders have purposefully suppressed this activity, although occasionally they have been supportive. In illuminating both the repressive and supportive moments, I hope to encourage discussion about our future relationships with prisoners' own educational systems.

Prisoner organised education

The 'college' of London's King's Bench prison in the eighteenth century defined itself as a 'corporation or fellowship...to discharge certain duties of common concern' (Innes, 1983, 280). In rooms the college designated as meeting places, they conducted 'powers of government over their fellow prisoners' (p. 281). This included courts and general discussions that allowed prisoners to speak with a common voice to authorities. Its existence depended on the weakness of state authority. Prisoners' power extended over considerable social space because guards had few incentives to play an active role in security.

By the late 1700s, nascent educational reformers (e.g., John Howard) venerated in the historiography of correctional education (Gehring, 1995) began to resist prisoners' autonomy. To

them they were atavistic beings whose bodies, emotions, morals, and intellects required the disciplining mechanisms of solitude, religious and literacy education, and hard labour. Independent prisoner organizations like the college had to be crushed if their rehabilitative-surveillance practices were to take effect. For the most part, we must say that the reformers succeeded. If prisoners' organizations continued, they were so suppressed and disguised that they have escaped any notice in the major studies on penal history (Garland, 1990). This coercive relationship between outside educators and prisoners' educational systems continues into the present.

In the early 1900s, a growing number of socialists and anarchists were incarcerated for their militant activities. Articles on the politics of prisons in class struggle were featured frequently in the literature of their organizations. Penal regimes insisted on censoring this literature. Along with censorship, isolation was essential for control. However, in overcrowded prisons, where individuals had to mingle to work and live, censorship and isolation were hard to sustain. In the endless struggle for social space between keepers and kept, the latter managed to gain enough power to operate clandestine networks that brought this literature inside and circulated it widely (Legere, 1914, 338). These networks should be included in a history of prisoner organized education.

One prisoner, Benj Legere, who participated in these clandestine networks at Auburn prison, New York in 1913, became a teacher in the prison school. His account suggests that in 1913 censorship relaxed because he brought this literature into the class and transformed it into a 'center of revolutionary Socialist and industrial union propaganda' (p. 340). He also mentions a 'library' of radical literature.

While Legere is interested in celebrating these successes, the main point of his article was to condemn the role of a progressive reformer, who suppressed socialist literature and replaced prisoner-teachers with outside educators. Ironically, Thomas Osborne is famous in the discourse of prison education for his use of participatory democratic methods to teach prisoners to become self-governing citizens (Davidson, 1995). But Legere notes that Osborne was anything but democratic when it came to the influence of socialists and anarchists. In addition to censoring their literature and keeping them away from the school, Osborne banned socialists from occupying elected offices in the self-governing bodies.

Similar relationships prevailed between outside educators and the California radical prison movement in the 1960s and 1970s. Dating back to the 'bibliotherapy' program at San Quentin in the 1950s, teachers and librarians censored radical literature and prevented prisoners from writing and publishing commentaries on prison and crime (Cummins, 1994, 21-52). Prisoners accused the school of serving as a form of surveillance and prison management. Some teachers resisted these roles and supported Black Muslims efforts to take control of the curriculum, especially in ethnic studies. In most cases, however, teachers and students clashed over course content and class governance.

As they became disillusioned with the objectives of treatment and educational programs, their own political activity was radicalized. This 'led to a proliferation of secret inmate study groups intended...to subvert San Quentin's official education system' (p. 91). Legislated and court ordered relaxation of censorship in the 1960s opened the prison to an array of radical literature that provided essential materials for these clandestine activities.

Officially sanctioned 'convict self-improvement groups' became book lending and political study networks which provoked considerable discontent from authorities. But these groups were minor players in prisoner organized education compared to the 'covert political education

department[s]' of radical organizations. In 1971 the Black Panthers and Black Guerrilla Family (BGF) operated 'secret Marxist political education groups, which included instruction in basic literacy skills and production of rudimentary textbooks, along with discussion of revolutionary theory and practical tips on bomb making and gang war' (p. 136). Students read Eldridge Cleaver, Che Guevara, Marx, and George Jackson. The Black Cultural Group organized political study sessions that used the works of Mao to inform self-criticism.

In his last major work Paulo Freire cautioned that 'in the domain of socio-economic structures, the most critical knowledge of reality, which we acquire through the unveiling of that reality, does not of itself alone effect a change in reality' (Freire, 1997, 30). Historical consciousness must be related to concrete struggles for liberation. Cummins argues that the political movements in California's prisons were too isolated from political struggle on the outside and as a consequence became unrealistic. Prisoners believed that their politicalisation was part of an imminent revolution, when militant black groups on the outside were being suppressed and becoming sectarian. The New Left--itself in disarray--failed to critique egotistical criminal activity or to confront a romanticized image of the prisoner as rebel. Cummins goes so far as to question the authenticity of prisoners' politicalisation. For example, BGF and organizations like it relied on exploitive underground economies for their power base. While prisoners read Marx, Fanon, and Guevara, there was no praxis to create solidarity across racial divides (Cummins, 1994, 128-186).

By contrast, the educational systems of Irish Republican political prisoners were intimately connected to an advanced political struggle. Dana and McMonagle open their description of this system by noting:

> one of the crucial steps in gaining freedom is forming a system of self-education where the ideas of a revolutionary movement can be developed, tested through discussion and passed on to others within the movement (Dana & McMonagle, 1997, 67).

When Republicans were first interned in 1971 those who knew Gaelic and Gaelic history taught others with little interference from guards. In 1976, the British government withdrew their prisoner-of-war status and treated them as criminals. They resisted this by refusing to wear prisoner uniforms, wrapping themselves in blankets ('blanket protests') and going on hunger strikes. During this period they 'discovered that they could still educate one another, but now by shouting to their neighbours through doors, out windows or along water pipes' (p. 69). After five years of protest, the British government conceded to their demands for POW status. In the 'communal lifestyle' which emerged, they established a sophisticated educational system. A required course for 'those considering themselves political prisoners' was on the history of Republicans in Long Kesh prison 'because it examines the importance of the struggle inside the H-Blocks, helping to define what being a...Republican POW is all about' (p. 70). Irish language was taught in beginner and advanced courses. The methods of instruction were peer tutoring and more structured learning. For example, a class on Historical Analysis was guided by a draft outline of modern Irish history written by a POW. Each week eight students took responsibility for assigning related readings

> draw[ing] up a number of points to discuss, as well as questions to the others as a way to initiate discussion. The group then examines the topic from all sides, trying to determine what happened, why the event happened the way it did, and engaging in debate to decide if the Republican movement could have done anything differently and what lessons can be learned from the event (p. 72).

Unfortunately, this account does not mention any links between the POWs and outside educators. Nor does Hammond's (1996) study of Salavdoran political prisoners' educational systems or Sbarbaro's (1995) notes on the *intifada*. The tone and temper of these studies suggest that little or no relationship occurred; indeed, it is likely that schools run by outsiders did not exist in El Salvador and Palestine. Nonetheless, an important supportive connection between the Republican's educational system and outside educators does exist. Since this supportive connection also applies to the penal press, I want to take a moment to describe that educational system first.

The penal press consists of prisoners' newspapers and periodicals published for internal circulation or to be distributed outside. In Canada alone, from 1951 to the late 1980s there were over eighty publications (Gaucher, 1989, 6). Evidence of the press exists from the nineteenth century; however, its peak period of circulation was in the 1950s.

Gaucher attributes the Canadian press' existence to the relaxed restrictions on prisoner writing that accompanied the reformist zeal of the post war period. The earliest press was supported by the commissioner of the federal prison system, but any amicable relationship between editors and administrators was tenuous at best. At the time enthusiasm among prisoners for vocational training and a general easing of restrictions led to the publication of articles that authorities supported. When individuals discovered that these programs did not prepare them for jobs outside and parole boards and administrations were using them to maintain institutional order, the contents of the press shifted to a more critical tone. As tensions rose, editors and writers demanded the right to express their views openly, which put them in direct conflict with authorities and led to increased censorship. In the 1960s editors continuously battled censorship and curtailed funding. Disruptions to production and circulation pushed them into disarray and a focus on internal events (e.g., sports). Involuntary transfers to higher and lower security institutions was an essential factor in destabilized editorial boards. After the 1970s only a few presses continued to publish.

Outsiders played a supportive role in the Irish Republican's educational system and the penal press by bringing to the attention of other educators, prisoners and prison activists accounts of these activities through the *Journal of Prisoners on Prisons*. The *Journal* was founded in 1988 by educators (two of whom are former prisoners), prisoners, and prison activists. Biannually, it publishes articles by prisoners and former prisoners on the politics and experience of crime, punishment, and social justice. It was formed in order to provide a means whereby their discourse could develop and engage discussions of '*the other*' in critical discourse generally (Davidson, 1988). The *Journal* looks like a scholarly periodical. It is edited to that standard. But editing is a politicized dynamic since one is publishing in a conventional academic format 'a critical ethnography' originating out of a complex, heavily stigmatized social construction (Gaucher, 1988).

The *Journal* relates to prisoners' educational systems as a means to give those systems a voice; however, it is also an educational resource within those systems. Fifty percent of its subscribers are prisoners and prison libraries. In a letter to a member of its editorial collective, the prisoner/political activist Lorenzo Stone-Bey situates the *Journal* in his description of prisoner organized education:

> Yes, most prisoners organized education is what Prison officials call a Threat to security, Revolutionary, Gang involvement, etc and often the response is harassment, transfers from the institution to...the Super Max and Indefinite Segregation. Yet, we understand the importance of education and political education in particular so we do so without fear of the State Repression. We

> create our own libraries with the books and other material such as you send [i.e., the Journal] and get copies when we can in order to circulate it (Stone-Bey, 9 June 1997).

Some forms of prisoner organized education have both conflicting and supportive relationships to outside educators. One of these is a course in jailhouse lawyering. Julian Stone taught himself the law in order to appeal his death sentence. When death row was temporarily abolished in the U.S. in 1972, Stone began to promote legal education. At Norfolk prison, his idea for law classes was picked up by the prisoners' Legal Advisory Committee (Stone, 1995, 194). The course was divided into two classes. A basic class taught the jurisdictions of American courts and how to read law and do legal research. An advanced class taught students to prepare legal actions, to access and extract information from law books, and to prepare and serve court documents. Students were required to attend class, discuss readings, and pass oral and written tests. Those who passed the advanced class were issued certificates. Stone argues that these conventional methods were necessary for students to take the program seriously and because the certificate designated a person to be qualified to give prisoners' legal aide in fighting wrongful convictions, appeals, and civil suits.

Stone's program had an equivocal relationship with professional outside educators. On the one hand, it was essential that the course be kept apart from the prison school because 'the principal would be in a position to dictate what materials would be used to teach the course, who would be suitable students, how the class would be organized, who would teach, and how students would be evaluated' (p. 194). At the same time, Stone fostered connections with law students in Boston's major universities. These connections legitimated the program, provided a resource for course content, and opened up possibilities for released jailhouse lawyers to obtain jobs as paralegals. In addition, Stone, like many students in his classes, participated in Boston University's prison higher education program. It was through teaching the sociology of deviance in this program that I came into contact with him, and as a consequence of that contact was able to publish his account of this program. Outsiders involved with the higher education program proved to be a significant resource for organizing inside.

As early as the mid-1970s, prisoners were in contact with sociologists, social historians, and feminists coming inside to teach for higher education programs. For example, the Santa Cruz Women's Project, which began as a women's study course evolved into 'a statewide educational, political, and cultural network which converged at the women's prison most weekends for four years (Faith, 1995, 175). Faith does not speak directly to links between the project and prisoners' educational systems; however, her descriptions of the interactions between outsiders and students in designing and operating the classes and defending the program and students against interference from authorities suggests that ownership of the project became considerably blurred.

As another example, Peter Linebaugh taught *Capital* 'by catechism' to Harry Brown at Marion prison in Illinois and social history to a class at Attica, New York, 'a place with a tradition, and with pride in that history' (Linebaugh, 1995, 81). When he entered New Hampshire's Concord prison to teach for Franconia College, Linebaugh encountered individuals prepared to discuss Stalin's conception of historical materialism. At Walpole in 1973, when prisoners governed the Massachusetts' 'joint' by an elected council during a guard's strike, a prisoner taught Linebaugh about the council and Linebaugh spoke with him about the *Communist Manifesto*.

There are accounts of other prisoner organized educational systems. I have mentioned Hammond on Salvadoran's activities and Sbarbaro on the *intifada*. Juan Rivera has written an important discussion of a Nontraditional Approach that individuals created 'so that upon release they can take up their lives in a way that will benefit themselves and their communities' (Rivera, 1995,

160). Kathy Boudin has written on AIDS Counselling and Education (ACE), which includes a superb discussion of a program that integrated literacy skills activities 'into a critical-thinking curriculum...[that captured] the dynamic unfolding process of curriculum development in which both teacher and student play an active role' (Boudin, 1995, 141). Grounded in Freirian 'problem-posing methodology' and the reality of women's immediate concerns, this curriculum emerged as a peer counselling and educational program on AIDS. Space simply prevents me from examining these here.

Concluding remarks

It may be an exaggeration to say that prisoners' own educational systems are always so intimately connected to processes of politicalisation because these types of programs have made their way into print. However, it is difficult to imagine that such programs could exist without some degree of political sophistication. Minimally, their existence depends on varying levels of organized resistance to penal authority. Under severe forms of repression, ingenious methods were devised to keep these programs alive. When the continuous conflict between keepers and kept created more space for political organization, prisoners' educational systems were quick to expand. It is this feature of the formation of prisoners' educational systems that is of particular importance here.

The ability to gain and hold a social space has a major impact on the forms which these systems take. The near absence of state authority in the King's Bench prisons of the eighteenth century created the conditions for self-governing colleges. Socialists' education at Auburn, the Canadian penal press, the California prison movement, and the *Journal of Prisoners on Prisons* have been affected by degrees of censorship and freedom to write and publish. In the Irish Republican case, organized struggle to hold on to the status of POWs precluded their ability to establish formal classes in various subjects.

This brings us to the relationships between prisoners' educational systems and adult educators. Unfortunately several accounts do not examine these relationships. Others state that outsiders suppressed prisoner organized education in order to institute professionalised forms of 'correctional education'. Stone speaks directly to the necessity of keeping his course independent of the school's control. Cummins places prisoners' systems in opposition to schools operated by conventional educators. Evidence supports the argument that conventional schools function instrumentally as alternative forms of prisoner management and perform an insidious role in the operation of parole and classification boards.

But outsiders have also been supportive. Some teachers in higher education programs have contributed to prisoners' systems by providing prisoner-educators with a formal liberal arts education. Advising on content and methods of particular courses, providing access to libraries and guest speakers, and promoting prisoner writing and offering means for its publication may be counted as examples of educators educating educators, in the fullest sense.

In closing, I want to note that to confine the analysis of adult education in prison to programs delivered by professionals is to do the work of suppressing a much broader conceptualization of adult education. Altering the borderlines that define adult education in any particular setting is an essential if not sufficient part of a process that locates adult education in a struggle for genuine democratic social relations. Quoting Foucault, to fail to recognize and recount marginalized practices is to 'locate...low down on the hierarchy, beneath the required level of cognition of scienticity' a bloc of 'historical knowledge which were present but disguised within the body of functionalist and systematising theory' (quoted in Giroux, 1997, 103). To see prisoners' educational systems as part of the historicity of adult education and to account for them in the theoretical discourse of the field as a whole will not in itself transform practice, but it does

support the continuation of this struggle.

References

Boudin, K. (1995), 'Critical thinking in a basic literacy program: A problem-solving model in correctional education', *Journal of Correctional Education*, vol. 46, pp. 141-144.

Collins, M. & Niemi, J. A. (1989), 'Advancing adult basic education in prisons: The recruitment, selection, and training of inmate tutors', in Duguid, S. (ed.), *Yearbook of Correctional Education 1989*: Burnaby: Institute for the Humanities, pp. 193- 208.

Cummins, E. (1994), *The Rise and Fall of California's Radical Prison Movement*, Stanford: Stanford University Press.

Dana, J., & McMonagle, S. (1997), 'Deconstructing 'criminalisation': The politics of collective education in the H-blocks', *Journal of Prisoners on Prisons*, vol. 8, pp. 67-74.

Davidson, H. S. (1998), 'Adult education in transition: The influence of social context on teaching prisoners', in Scott, S., Spencer, B, and Thomas, A. (eds.), *Learning for Life: Canadian Readings in Adult Education*, Toronto: Thompson, pp. 223-235.

Davidson, H.S. (1995), 'An alternative view: Revisiting the Mutual Welfare League (1913-1923)', *Journal of Correctional Education*, vol. 46, pp. 169-178.

Davidson, H. S. (1988), 'Prisoners on prison abolition', *Journal of Prisoners on Prisons*, vol. 1, no. 1, pp. 1-4.

Faith, K. (1995), 'The Santa Cruz Women's Prison Project, 1972-1976', in Davidson, H. S. (ed.), *Schooling in a 'Total Institution': Critical Perspectives on Prison Education*, Westport: Begin & Garvey, pp. 173-192.

Freire, P. (1996), *Pedagogy of Hope*, New York: Continuum.

Garland, D. (1990), *Punishment and Modern Society: A Study in Social Theory*, Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Gaucher, R. (1989), The Canadian penal press: A documentation and analysis. *Journal of Prisoners on Prisons*, vol. 2, no. 1, pp. 3-24.

Gaucher, R. (1988), 'The prisoner as ethnographer: The Journal of Prisoners on Prisons', *Journal of Prisoners on Prisons*, vol. 1, no. 1, pp. 49-61.

Gehring, T. (1995), 'Characteristics of correctional education instruction, 1789-1875', *Journal of Correctional Education*, vol. 46, pp. 52-59.

Giroux, H. A. (1997), *Pedagogy and the Politics of Hope: Theory, Culture, and Schooling*. Boulder: Westview Press.

Hammond, J. L. (1996), 'Organization and education among Salvadoran political prisoners', *Crime, Law & Social Change*, vol. 25, pp. 17-41.

Innes, J. (1983), 'The King's Bench prison in the late eighteenth century: Law, authority and order in a London debtors' prison', in Brewer, J. and Styles, J. (eds.), *An Ungovernable People; The English and Law in the Seventeenth and Eighteenth Centuries*, London: Hutchinson, pp. 250-298.

Legere, B. J. (1914), 'The red flag in the Auburn prison', *The International Socialist Review*, vol. 15, no. 6, pp. 337-341.

Linebaugh, P. (1995), 'Freeing birds, erasing images, burning lamps: How I learned to teach in prison', in Davidson, H. S. (ed.), *Schooling in a 'Total Institution': Critical Perspectives on Prison Education*, Westport: Begin & Garvey, pp. 65-90.

Rivera, J. A. (1995), 'A nontraditional approach to social and criminal justice', in Davidson, H. S. (ed.), *Schooling in a 'Total Institution': Critical Perspectives on Prison Education*, Westport: Begin & Garvey, pp. 159-171.

Sbarbaro, E. (1995), 'A note on prison activism and social justice', in Davidson, H. S. (ed.), *Schooling in a 'Total Institution': Critical Perspectives on Prison Education*, Westport: Begin & Garvey, pp. 141-145.

Stone, J. (1995), 'Jailhouse lawyers educating fellow prisoners', in Davidson, H. S. (ed.), *Schooling in a 'Total Institution': Critical Perspectives on Prison Education*, Westport: Begin & Garvey, pp. 173-201.

Stone-Bey, L. (June 9, 1997), Personal communication to Howard Davidson.

Williford, M. (ed.) (1994), *Higher Education in Prison*, Phoenix: Onyx Press.

Encouraging reflective practice in adult educators studying through distance education

Darryl Dymock, University of New England, Australia

Introduction

The concept of 'reflective practice' appears to be generally regarded as 'a good thing' in adult educational circles, as Bright (1996) has also observed. Bright (1996: 162) defined reflective practice as 'a process involving interrelated skills in the testing and use of information in the planning and implementation of professional action', and noted that it 'claims significant improvements in the competence of professional action and resulting client outcomes'. He suggested that there are three linked stages in the development and implementation of reflective practice: the first stage involves 'simply understanding the process at an intellectual level distanced from the realm of practice', the second stage involves 'application of this theoretical process to the restrictions and demands of practice', and the third stage involves 'recognition and evaluation of the outcomes of implementation, and/or evaluation of the theoretical framework' (p. 162).

Bright commented (1996: 163) on the complexity and ambiguity of the concept, and on the apparent difficulties in developing the necessary attributes in adult educators within professional initial and post-initial training, quoting Schon's (1983, 1987) and Usher's (1985) belief that reflective practice cannot be taught. He also reported (p. 163) McNamara's (1991) claim that teachers who demonstrate reflective practice are often least effective in the classroom. These views suggest that the concept of reflective practice as a useful component of adult educators' professional practice is problematic.

Nevertheless, there are two factors I consider significant enough for the value of reflective practice in the training of adult educators to be seriously considered. The first is that the concept is sufficiently persistent in the adult education literature over at least the past decade - Bright (1993: 162) listed at least ten authors on the subject since 1989. Added to this is my own experience with reflective practice when I was appointed to teach about adult education at the University of New England in 1992. After more than twenty years of professional practice, teaching adults and in university continuing education, I was keen to explore how adult learning theory could be applied to a distance education course for training adult educators. I consciously undertook a process of reviewing a wide range of adult learning and distance education literature, and reflecting on this and on my own experience as an educator and program planner in adult education, in order to develop the best possible course of study. This has been an ongoing process, and my perception is that the course, and therefore the students, have benefited from the resulting changes.

One swallow might not make a summer, but my personal experience with what seemed to me to be 'reflective practice' was sufficiently affirming for me to explore how I might encourage a similar approach for the adult educators I was training. The purpose of this paper therefore is not to critique the concept of reflective practice per se, but rather to discuss how it might be fostered among adult educators studying through distance education. I am using the first person throughout because I believe it is an appropriate form for relating my personal experience in developing a course of study.

Fostering reflection

In encouraging 'reflection', I am not aiming very high: I simply want those educators undertaking a one-semester unit of study, Adult learning and teaching processes, to think about why they do what they do in their professional practice and to consider whether what they are learning in the course might be applied to that practice. This is a distance education course, and there is no requirement or provision for me to observe their educational practice for any changes, nor do I want to imply that their practice necessarily needs 'improvement'. In Bright's (1996: 162) hierarchy outlined above, I have been aiming for stage one - understanding the process at an intellectual level. Achievement of the other two stages, application of the process and evaluation of the outcomes, I can only deduce from what is reported to me as part of the teacher-student interaction in a distance education course.

Generally the students who undertake EDCO 491, *Adult learning and teaching processes*, are enrolled in distance education programs at Graduate Certificate, Graduate Diploma or Masters levels in Adult Education and Training. Most of them are employed full or part time in an educational role with adults, and they reside mainly in the eastern States of Australia, with a few in the Pacific Islands and the Middle East. They include nurse educators, teachers in vocational education and training and community education, trainers in industry and in government departments and self-employed training consultants. The distance education teaching material comprises an introductory audio tape, a set of printed 'Unit Notes' prepared by me, and a Resource Book of selected journal articles and book chapters.

In attempting to encourage students to become more reflective practitioners, I have been developing a number of strategies over several years. I am not conscious that these strategies draw explicitly on any one approach, but I was and am constantly reading in the areas of adult learning and of distance education and so need to acknowledge the contributions of many authors, altogether too numerous to list here. A particular challenge to my thinking has been Grow's (1991) article, 'Teaching learners to be self-directed'. Also significant has been the interaction with past and present colleagues at the University of New England, especially Richard Bagnall, Barrie Brennan, Margaret Somerville, and latterly Karen Ritchie, and my peers in adult and distance education at other institutions and at conferences. Constantly also feeding into the critically reflective process are the comments and criticisms from students enrolled in the courses I teach.

What I think I can achieve in a distance education course is to develop in students not so much 'reflective practice' as the 'practice of reflection'. In this paper I will concentrate on the strategies that have evolved which are specifically related to developing that practice.

Strategies for developing the 'practice of reflection'

The Unit Notes for EDCO 491 (Dymock 1998: 2) include a list of anticipated outcomes which conclude with:

You should also have developed:

- the ability to apply your understanding of adult learning and teaching processes to your own educational practice, and
- a critically reflective approach to your own educational practice.'

The process of critical reflection is encouraged by:

- 'Key questions' to help you focus on the main issues

- An invitation to send a 'Critical Reflection' letter with each assignment - see 'Assignment Guidelines' later in these Unit Notes.
- Provision for you to keep your own 'Learning Notebook' as you progress through the unit. (If you record your learning progress through a 'Learning Notebook', either in these Unit Notes or separately, there is a related assignment question in Module 3).
- Assignment topics that require you to draw your own conclusions based on your reading and, where appropriate, on your own experience

Because this is not a skills-based unit, it does not require you to demonstrate that you can put into practice what you have learned. It does assume however, that you will want to review your educational practice in the light of what you have learned in the unit, for your own professional development.

In this paper, each of the four strategies intended to encourage the process of critical reflection will be discussed in turn.

Key questions

The first opportunity to attempt to develop 'reflective practitioners' was in the development of the Unit Notes for 1993. In moving towards my overall aim of developing reflective practitioners, I provided a new structure, an introduction plus three 'modules'. The introductory section included this paragraph:

> This unit is part of a graduate program in [adult] education and is therefore designed to encourage you to take responsibility for your own learning by following what might be called 'the four Rs' of university study: to read widely, to reflect critically, to write clearly and to reference fully. The unit is not designed to provide set piece solutions to standardised problems, but to encourage you to apply insights from reflection on your reading and experience to specific settings and issues.

In the 1993 Unit Notes I presented a review of the major issues in adult learning and teaching, with a set of 'Key questions' at the beginning of each of the modules, e.g 'Do all adults learn in the same way or are there different learning styles?', 'What are the major theories of learning and are they relevant for adult learners?', and 'Can teachers motivate students to learn?'. The aim was to identify the main issues for the students in order to provide a clearer focus and at the same time encourage a more inquiring approach to their studies.

In order to stimulate reflection on the content and the process of the unit, two different kinds of 'thought boxes' were randomly scattered throughout the notes. 'Personal Reflection' boxes included several prompts that invited the students to think about their own experiences as learners and educators, with such questions as 'What factors have prompted you to undertake this course of study at this time in your life?', and 'To what extent, if any, should I be encouraging self-directed learning in my own teaching/learning situation?'. 'To think about' boxes had a light bulb icon and enclosed quotes from writers in adult education - short statements which were intended to provoke the students' thinking, e. g.:

> *To think about*
> Students who have kept mentally in trim by maintaining a consistent diet of learning from time to time tend to do better than otherwise identical students who have not. The reasons seem partly to do with practice, and partly to do with self-confidence (Rogers, 1989: 55).

The informal response to these 'think about' boxes was mixed - some students said that they made them think, while others complained that they interrupted the flow of the notes. Subsequently I abandoned them in favour of the 'Learning Notebook' idea reported below; the 'Personal reflection' questions remain in the text, without the border.

Analysis of the students' own learning and teaching was also facilitated by the inclusion of two short self-evaluation tests related to learning styles (Kolb's Learning Styles Inventory 1984), and teaching styles (Conti's Principles of Adult Learning Scale: 1989). There is a number of such inventories available, and the value of including those exercises is not so much in the particular results obtained, but in challenging students to consider whether they agree with the outcomes or not for themselves, and why, and also whether the concepts of learning styles and teaching styles respectively are useful for adult educators.

Other attempts to encourage more 'critical' reflection included introducing two set textbooks, with an explanation of why they were chosen, in addition to the Resource Book of selected readings, so that students might have a better basis for the opinions they expressed in their assignment essays. There was also 'Suggested Reading' at the end of each module, and a 'Recommended Reading' list that was annotated to make the library request process for distance education students as straightforward as possible.

At the end of 1993, one of the main student requests was for the notes to be expanded and there were complaints that the Resource Book was too extensive. The latter comments raised the issue of maintaining a balance between providing sufficient resources to ensure students are exposed to a range of views, and recognising the constraints within which distance education students (and mature age students generally) undertake their studies. Changes for the ensuing year included more substantial notes and a reduced number of articles in the Resource Book. The latter move was offset by depositing in a special Reserve Collection at the University Library selected articles for students to follow up particular interests related to assignments; an annotated list of these was provided in the Unit Notes.

In the event, it became clear that students did not use to any great extent the set texts or the recommended reading material outside that which was provided. While this was disappointing for me in terms of my aim to encourage wider reading as a basis for reflection, I also had to acknowledge the reality of competing priorities and time constraints for off -campus students. The result has been 'highly recommended' rather than set texts, and a very careful selection of Resource Book articles.

Critical reflection letter

A major innovation for the reflective process was the introduction in 1995 of a student letter in order to facilitate teacher-learner dialogue. In the introductory Adult Education unit, students were invited to send with each assignment a 'critical self-assessment' on the writing of the essay. This included responses under headings such as 'Strengths', 'Weaknesses', 'Problems faced', etc. The value of these was problematic - they tended to be written like reports, objective and distant, and the nature of some of the responses indicated that many students treated them as a chore rather than as a genuine opportunity to reflect on the process of preparing and writing the assignment. Nevertheless, there were occasional glimpses of student insight which suggested that the concept had potential as part of the learning process.

I decided to modify the expectations of the 'critical self assessment' from the introductory unit of study by inviting students to send a letter with each assignment in which they might reflect on the progress and process of their studies. The intention was to broaden the scope of what they might want to say, with the assignment as an immediate focus, but also providing an opportunity for

them to comment on issues they were not able to deal with in the assignment itself. The invitation in the Unit Notes (1995: 48) concluded with this paragraph-

I would prefer it if you addressed the letter, 'Dear Darryl', as a way of establishing a professional dialogue between us, even though (or particularly because) we are at a distance from each other. I will write my responses on the letter itself, and send it back with the assignment. The letter will not, of course, be formally assessed, but I hope will be a way of promoting the teaching-learning interaction. (If you have completed the [introductory Adult Education] unit, you will be familiar with the critical self -assessment. The 'Dear Darryl' letter is an attempt to make that a less formal and hopefully more enjoyable task.)

The response has been very encouraging. Most students have accepted the invitation to write a 'Dear Darryl' letter, and the range of topics covered is much broader than I had anticipated. Whilst some students write only about the assignment, others tell me about the difficulties they face as external students, or express concerns about their career prospects or job changes. There are stories of computer crashes, an extra glass of red wine that helped someone to finish an assignment, and sadder tales of coping with drought in a rural area, or the strain of caring for sick or elderly relatives.

Over four years, the 'Dear Darryl' letters have averaged about a page in length - a few students send only a paragraph, quite a few write two or three pages, and one student sent five to seven pages with each assignment. It is not possible to review the use of the letters in detail in this paper, but some brief extracts will indicate the range of responses and show how they can contribute to the 'reflective' process.

Some are personal comments and responses to the assignment task, as exemplified by the following two quotes-.

> I thoroughly enjoyed the recommended reading, however I think my brain got overlogged with 'relevant' quotes! ... I had many interruptions and at the final printing stage I lost the last third of my assignment due to serious disk errors. It was at this point that I broke down and was ready to give up. However after a good cry on my daughter's shoulder I rewrote the last section. This was all part of the learning experience.

and-.

> Well, I have written a 'Dear John' letter before, but never a 'Dear Darryl' one! Pardon my frivolity - just my silly sense of humour and sheer relief at getting this essay completed.

Even seemingly 'frivolous' comments are a sign, however, that barriers between teacher and student are being broken down. I reply in kind to indicate that I value the response.

There are also Dear Darryl' letters that indicate that some students believe they are able to transfer their learning from a particular assignment to their educational practice, as the following two examples show:

> With a great amount of SATISFACTION, it Is now that I sit back and reflect on the tremendous amount of useful knowledge I have gained. I already know that I have put it to very good use both professionally and personally. This assignment has made me think about many things, particularly on my teaching, the strategies,

> procedures and evaluations I use. As of the beginning of this semester I write my own evaluations of how the week progressed. ... It is amazing how much you learn and adjust things after critically reflecting on matters. [emphasis in original]

and:

> You set a lot of reading for this assignment - but I found it all worthwhile and thought provoking. I am finding that I am constantly aware of what I have been reading, and thinking about how it all applies to what I am doing. I can even say it is influencing my practice.

Of course these are selected quotes, and I am not suggesting that all students in the unit are conscious of 'reflective practice'. But I am saying that there is prima facie evidence that adult educators perceive that they do improve their practice through being encouraged to reflect on it.

Learning notebook

The learning notebook is another form of 'learning journal'. A number of authors (e.g. Holly: 1989) have discussed the use of a professional journal for reflective purposes, but I shied away from using the term, 'journal', because I thought it might seem too formal, and hence discourage students from using the method as part of the reflective approach. From 1997 I utilised 'boxes' scattered throughout the text to explain what was expected. For example the first 'Learning Notebook' box in the Unit Notes says:

> *Learning Notebook*
> As you read through the first reading in the Resource Book, jot down points that seem to you particularly important or interesting, and also record any queries that arise in the reading. You could come back to these queries at the end of the module and/or unit.

Many of the subsequent Learning Notebook boxes are linked to the Resource Book readings. For example, in the section on 'Principles of effective practice', it is suggested that students read the chapter by Cranton (19992), 'Developing a theory of practice', which is included in the Resource Book as one of 15 readings. The box that follows says:

> *Learning Notebook*
> In the Cranton (1992) article, look at 'Mark's assumptions and beliefs about teaching' on page 211, and ‚Beverly's assumptions and beliefs about teaching' on page 214.
>
> - Tick those you agree with in relation to your own teaching,
> - Add any of your own assumptions and beliefs about teaching 'that don't appear there.

Evidence that some students do utilise the process comes from comments in the critical reflection letters and the choice by a small number of students of that option for the final assignment, which says:

> Assignment 3, Option B
> Critically review the notes you have made in your 'Learning Notebook' during your study of this unit, and discuss the extent of the development of your understanding of learning and teaching and of any implications for your professional practice.

After completing this option in the final assignment, one student wrote:

> I hope that my assignment isn't too disjointed... jumping from one thought to the next. I guess that is very much how my learner's notebook is. I think it does show the progression of my learning experience.

Assignments

Assessment for the Adult Education units has always been by set or negotiated assignments, which are seen as more conducive to reflection than are examinations. The three assignments in EDCO 491 all have options intended to encourage the students to analyse rather than describe. Examples include:

- Assignment 1, Option B
  Consider your own learning endeavours since you left school and discuss to what extent you fit Brookfield's (1990, 31) summary description of the characteristics of an adult learner which is quoted below [not included here]. NOTE-. Use the first person in this essay.

After completing this assignment, one student commented in her 'Dear Darryl' letter:

> Overall I think this assignment helped me to understand that my adult students are going through and feeling much the same as I am as a student of this course. By focusing on my own characteristics as an adult I earner I can understand my adult students better.

- Assignment 2, Option D
  Discuss at least three major theories of learning and the extent to which they have any practical relevance for adult educators.

A student commented:

> This was a nice place to revisit my initial theories of learning material stored away for future reference .... I had moved away from being a 'dead-set' behaviourist when teaching junior high school to a combination of all three orientations as an instructor of the ... external syllabus for adult learners. ... It was... a slow and at times painful process of investigation and research. I tried to look at as many sources as I could... and these provided a great deal of critical reflection.

Assignment 3 is the final one for the unit, and students consistently report in their letters that it challenges them to reconsider their practice:

- Assignment 3, Option A
  Using the conceptual framework outlined in reading 11 (Clark, 1987) in your Resource Book, or any other systematic approach, critically analyse your role as a teacher or trainer of adults or a facilitator of adult learning. ... This analysis should justify existing practice and/or suggest modifications, and must include references to other relevant literature.

One student commented:

> I found this a very interesting and valuable assignment. Although I've taught for many years, there were many issues I had never given much thought to,

> especially those relating to the philosophy of my practice. I feel more aware now of how my philosophy, theories and methods interrelate, and although I'm sure I will still have occasions of feeling like Brookfield's impostor, I feel more confident about tracing problems back to their root.

To what extent have the students of the unit, *Adult learning and teaching processes,* developed 'the practice of reflection'? The answer is: I do not know the extent without further research, but I am sufficiently encouraged by the responses from some of the students, including those who wrote the comments below, to believe that there is transfer from learning to practice, and hence to pursue the strategies I have been developing:

> To be honest, all I'm reflecting on at the moment is how good it is to be finally finished for the year! ... I now know the importance of critically reflecting on my own practice and in fact have modified my view of my own role from that of teacher to that of facilitator.

and:

> You mention quite a lot about reflection and I know now how important it is and have emphasised it in our own curriculum planning - even the boss can now see its value and has agreed to some breaks rather than back-to-back courses.

and-.

> Through these three modules it has become more evident that I have gained invaluable self-awareness of my role as a teacher/facilitator and the way in which teaching practices and styles used, affect adult learners and learning. As a result of this self-awareness, I have been able to analyse and criticise these factors and look closely at how they have determined and influenced my approach to teaching and learning. ... In retrospect, I have ... appreciated the time that was set aside for self reflection and self-evaluation on existing teaching styles and techniques.

It can be seen that the final critical reflection letter serves also as a means of evaluation of the unit, although there is a separate form provided for that purpose, and completing the latter can also assist the reflective process. Further research is necessary to establish whether all adult educators studying at a distance can perceive any impact on their professional practice of the process of reflection, or whether, for example, the process influences mainly those who are already reflective learners.

References

Bright, B (1996) 'Reflecting on "reflective practice"', *Studies in the Education of Adults,* 28, 2, pp. 162-184.

Brookfield, S (1990) *Understanding and facilitating adult learning,* San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Conti, G (1989) 'Assessing teacher styles in continuing education', in Hayes, E (ed) *Effective teacher styles,* San Francisco: Jossey Bass, pp.3-16.

Cranton, P (1992) *Working with adult learners,* Toronto: Wall and Emerson.

Dymock, D (1993-1998) EDCO 491: *Adult learning and teaching processes,* Unit Notes, Armidale, NSW: University of New England (annually).

Grow, G (1991) *Teaching learners to be self-directed,* Adult Education Quarterly, 41, 3, pp. 125-149.

Holly, M (1989) *Writing to grow: Keeping a personal-professional journal,* Portsmouth, New Hampshire, Heinemann.

Kolb, D (1984) *Experiential learning,* New Jersey: Prentice-Hall.

McNamara, D (1990) 'Research on teachers' thinking: its contribution to educating student teachers to think critically', *Journal of Education for Teaching*, 16, pp. 147-60.
Schon, D (1983) *The reflective practitioner.* San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
Schon, D (1987) *Educating the reflective practitioner.* San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
Usher, R (1989) 'Beyond the anecdotal: adult learning and the use of experience', *Studies in the Education of Adults, 17,* 1, pp. 59-74.

Training in and for voluntary organisations in the UK

Konrad T. Elsdon[1], University of Nottingham, UK

The Context

Institutional adult education (AE) in the UK may serve perhaps 5% of the population in any one year - 10% if we include industrial training. Over a five year span the total would be greater. Large as these numbers are, they are dwarfed by the size and potential of the VS, which is bigger and more differentiated than we tend to assume. The evidence for this, and the causes, are summarised in Elsdon et al. (1997). We know there are at least five times as many voluntary organisations (VOs) - 1.4+ millions, with about 33 million adult members - as the Deakin (1996) Report thinks there are. This is aware of some 225,000, and among these mainly the large, well-staffed philanthropic ones. However, these represent less than a tenth. 85% of VOs have less than 100 members, don't employ so much as a charlady and run on finances which interest neither the Charity Commission nor the Inland Revenue. Well over 70% serve the leisure and other personal interests of their members, rather than providing services for other people. Between 30 and 40% are sports clubs. Over 90% are small local autonomous democracies, and autonomy means they provide their own leadership and their own objectives, methods and procedures from within. They *are* their members, rather than services which provide for passive clients.

Our research has shown conclusively that an enormous amount especially of informal learning goes on in these organisations - learning which relates to the skills and contents of the organisations' objectives, to their members' occupational commitments, to their social being, to their organisational, civic and political involvement and to their personal development. There is far too much here even to summarise; the detailed evidence will be found in the field studies (Elsdon, Reynolds, Stewart, 1991, 1992, 1993, 1994) and its interpretation in Elsdon et al. (1995a).

Formal Provision

The small minority of strongly staffed service-providing VOs naturally depends on institutions for the **initial** professional training of its formally qualified personnel. Institution-based training specifically for the needs of VOs differs from this and tends to consist of short, part-time in-service courses, of which more below.

Traditionally, institutional AE has done little of this initial professional training. The only substantial example (other than qualifying courses) that comes to mind is the Trade Union Education scheme, though this tended to become narrow and schematised. The most wide-spread role, that of the citizen, has received little attention. We used to claim it was implicit in the way we deliver and organise AE. If so, does it work?

One turns hopefully to Bax and Moens (1997) as a substantial EU funded international research project, only to discover that it deals mainly but thinly with philanthropic VOs and has putting people into paid jobs for its main theme. Apart from one course each from the Netherlands, Scotland and England it seems to describe contributors' aspirations rather than reality.

The Open University offers VOs two courses on, respectively, management and on winning resources and support. On paper they sound suitable for large, well-staffed, businesslike and wealthy organisations. - A Royal Society of Arts Diploma course is available at a number of colleges, and addresses a slightly broader segment. As with other providers, much must depend on whether those who teach the courses possess the necessary experience, expertise and

teaching ability - and whether the students need what is being offered. The University of Wales/Lampeter offers VOs, surprisingly by distance learning, a Certificate in Interpersonal Skills (are teleportation facilities provided?). A flock of individuals and consultancies with varying experience and qualifications offers courses, mostly expensive, e.g. on management or trustee topics, which can be read in brief and freely available documents or picked up in cheaper courses from reputable sources.

The Voluntary Sector

It will be clear from this rapid and perhaps rather cynical gallop round some of the formal offerings that, as such, they hardly touch the meat of the problem beyond the provision of initial training for professionals, whether intended for the much larger statutory, or the VS. However small a proportion of the total, the philanthropic segment of the VS employs the great majority of full- and part-time paid staff in the VS as well as many volunteers whom it engages in skilled and sometimes sensitive tasks. Specific training for all these is most effectively provided in-service and by those who can bring reputable experience to it.

What is more important and realistic for present purposes is therefore the variable but, in total, substantial and growing provision from within the sector. A number of local VOs and especially intermediary bodies arrange joint courses with local colleges and higher education institutions. A particularly impressive instance of this is the elaborate training programme offered by a widespread consortium of intermediary bodies (the Somerset Councils of Voluntary Services' Training Consortium) in conjunction with the colleges of further education (CFE) throughout that county. More recently the National Association of Councils of Voluntary Services has created a modular training scheme which is offered on a regional basis. For staff and voluntary workers in community centres, Community Matters has long held regular seminars/conferences on appropriate topics, including the Charity Commission's financial and reporting regulations. The Commission itself offers courses on charity law for trustees. ACAS has courses on employment law for managers and trustees and, nearer home, the WEA provides voluntary member training through Districts, using a national package.

Professional staffing and an ability to pay for training are only two reasons why relatively substantial course offerings are mostly tailored to the needs of the large professionally staffed service-delivering organisations rather than the great majority. However, this does not mean that nothing of note happens there - only that informality makes it hard to disentangle. This paper therefore concentrates, though not exclusively, on VS training from the non-institutional point of view. This is more common in the small, unstaffed, member- and interest-based organisations which form the vast majority of all VOs. It starts from individual experiences of being trained and of training others and hopes to consider some implications, if not exactly to draw conclusions. Without claiming statistical reliability, these experiences stand nevertheless for a field which has been shown in the UK to embrace more than three times the 10 million adults possibly involved with formal education over a five year cycle. Moreover, among them there are about 8 millions who hold some sort of responsible position in their organisations.

Case Studies

Hence the following examples which seem to demonstrate significant experience; they are intended to illuminate the area sufficiently for us to discern some sort of shape even if we shall hardly succeed in drawing a map. To be reasonably representative the sample needs to illustrate roles undertaken by volunteers and some staff, the kinds of persons occupying them, and the kinds of VOs. The actual range, however, is literally endless.

1. Big national VO: local Manager - paid / trained Professional

A. exemplifies the minority of the VS. She is a married woman aged 42. At 18 she rejected

both higher and further education and started work as a trainee care assistant. Over the next eight years she moved from this through various VO and statutory posts to a position as personnel manager in a VO, having acquired her professional qualification by day release, in the evenings and by correspondence.

During eleven years of domesticity she trained as a counsellor in evening courses at a CFE. She also became a member and local organiser of the Foundation for the Study of Sudden Infant Death Syndrome, a 'befriender' and support group organiser for it; a member of the National Childbirth Trust, a qualified breastfeeding counsellor, secretary of her local group and president of the area, as well as serving on a joint VO-National Health Service body.

5 ½ years in paid management posts with Citizens Advice Bureaux (CAB) followed, during which she undertook NCAB's own basic training, tutor training, management training courses, trainers' courses etc. She is now preoccupied with delivering basic training for volunteer advisers at her own CAB, and in supporting and supervising volunteers on the job. This is a major task because of heavy turnover of personnel. The reason is that basic training noticeably raises trainees' self-esteem. This stimulates activity, energy, etc, and the volunteers find jobs, some of them before or immediately after completing basic training: 80% of the last two years' trained intake at **A's** CAB have been lost to paid jobs.

Looking at her situation generally, **A.** claims that she doesn't particularly enjoy studying for its own sake; she 'would rather be doing'. Examinations she 'avoids at all costs'. Training, for her, is a chance to learn more, consolidate her expertise and qualify herself better for the work she is doing. Currently she is not a regular member of any VOs, but a magnet for individuals who need information, help, or counselling.

2. Three Members of an East End Settlement

(i) **B.**, formerly a picture restorer, became unemployed. He then took up voluntary work in a law centre and became a volunteer literacy tutor, receiving training for this from the settlement. The tutoring expanded and became a paid part-time job. While doing this he attended a part-time course leading to a professional teaching qualification, which led to additional part-time work. The Settlement then enabled him to attend a university extramural course leading to the diploma in adult education. While grant lasts, he now holds a full-time teaching appointment at the settlement and manages and trains its part-time tutors.

(ii) **C.**, a young woman, originally came as a volunteer youth worker on a part-time basis, was encouraged to take a two year full-time course to qualify as a youth and community worker, and returned to full-time paid community work at the Settlement until the grant from which she was paid ran out. She has now reverted to volunteer status but hopes to get more paid work when funds permit. She prefers working for a VO to a statutory employer 'because there is more opportunity for both giving and receiving'. The insecurity of employment with the VO has stimulated her involvement with and learning about political and social issues.

(iii) **D.**, another young woman, first came to the settlement for support after marriage breakdown, undertook voluntary work, was sent to a 'fresh start' course for two years and subsequently appointed to a 2 year funded community project at the settlement. When grant ran out she continued as a volunteer but also does part-time paid work for another VO. In addition to professional skills she has received an important political education about local and central government issues and policies and their effect on people, and how to be aware, informed and active as a citizen.

Cases C. and D. illustrate clearly the fluid continuity between paid and voluntary, professional

and lay, part- and full-time work in VOs. Leaders emerge from among the membership, receive training both informally within the organisation and from institutional AE outside it, continue into paid posts where they can get them, but are equally at home in voluntary work. Elsewhere, when paid professionals are appointed to VOs from outside, they need to learn how to acknowledge, value, learn from volunteer and lay contributions (not least those of elected officers and committee). However, they are also the guardians of standards and need to evaluate work and raise the sights of volunteers.

3. Medium local philanthropic VO: Trustee

E., an active retired man with long experience as a member, officer and, formerly, on the paid staff of VOs, was recruited to assist this VO in major constitutional and organisational development. As a trustee he is uneasy because his fellow trustees and directors appear to him to be less concerned with their supervisory and policy making role than he feels they ought to be and because of the habit of paid staff to make policy on the hoof and inform trustees afterwards how it is going. He gets impatient with trustee training arranged by staff and expensively delivered by 'the cowboy tribe which takes advantage of new legislation and the unjustified modesty of trustees to batten on VOs'. On the other hand he has become more sensitive to some staff attitudes in social work-oriented VOs and the ways in which these may be exacerbated if they are reinforced by similar ones among the trustees.

4. Group of small local VOs: Voluntary County Organiser (VCO)

F., in her sixties, is a 'Voluntary County Organiser' of the National Federation of Women's Institutes (NFWI) in a very rural county. From shy and very isolated beginnings and the very minimum of schooling she joined the local Women's Institute. Over the years this provided her with a broad and deep education in a variety of crafts, reinforced locally through courses arranged with the adult education service and centrally by high level courses at the NFWI's Denman College. Political education in a wide range of civic, social, ecological and third world issues was delivered regularly through briefings and discussions. Lessons in organisation and management were absorbed initially through watching others and then through service on her own Institute's committee and as one of its officers: she had learned how to lead and run a small democratic group and, from unpromising beginnings, had acquired the personal confidence and the social competence to do it acceptably. Other members and Institutes began to ask for help and advice and this led to attendance at the NFWI's training courses for VCOs. She now has a wide area responsibility for the organisation and support of new WIs, for rescuing those in trouble and winding up those past saving, for teaching everything from running meetings and keeping accounts to planning programmes and organising conferences, for finding and training new leaders. Through it all she preserves a cheerful modesty: 'they know that if I can't do it, I'll find out.'

5. Local mainly educational VO: Volunteer Tutor-organiser

G., an early-retired nurse and keen swimmer, joined the local 50plus group and was promptly asked to run a swimming section. She `learned to live after a lifetime of closed institutions' where she had been in charge because that is what nurses are. Here she had to learn to lead from within a group of equals, to mix on equal terms, be tolerant and ask others to tolerate her. The immediate task involved much more than an ability to swim, and she underwent the standard training in swimming, life saving and became a registered swimming coach. However, standard training did not cater for teaching old and sometimes frail people to swim. The necessary exercising and confidence building required the support in each case of the whole group, and the immediate task very rapidly developed into health and fitness teaching and indeed broad social education.

6. Initially unskilled Volunteer acquiring semi-professional Skills

H., one of a lorry driver's family of 8, now in early middle age, had stopped attending school at 14 and graduated via grocer's boy and building labourer to a foremanship on the roads. He had been unemployed for 2½ years at the time of interview. Having nothing to do, he resumed a childhood interest in nature and the countryside and, six months ago, joined a local trust for nature conservation responsible for a wetland reserve. He began by attending meetings and going on work parties. This rapidly led to individual study and practical projects, to leading school parties on site, and to course attendance at a CFE. He hopes that the conservation qualification towards which he is working will lead into a new career.

7. VOs depending on substantial Qualifications possessed by Volunteers

The Midland Railway Trust runs real trains on real lines. To do so all members concerned are legally obliged to pass the necessary qualifications at fully professional standard. It therefore runs signal and telegraph courses and others for members who wish to perform as signalmen, drivers, and firemen. The courses would (and occasionally do!) qualify these individuals to do their jobs on the national network. In addition there are certain skills (e.g. coach painting) in which members of the Trust are expert and which have been lost by the rail companies. They therefore have to turn to the Trust when such work, or training for it, is in demand.

A slightly different situation characterises a local archaeological society which owes its inception to an adult education course provided through the nearest university extramural department. The close link between them led to the creation of an extramural certificate course in archaeology. Ever since, the society has encouraged its members to join this course and thus acquire a systematic training; it insists that any member who undertakes responsible roles must possess the certificate.

VOs, Qualifications and Institutions

The case studies illustrate the way in which the minority of service-providing VOs rely on institutions for professional staffing and, to some extent, for delivery of generic educational and VO expertise. In case studies 5 and 7 very demanding and externally assessed training is undergone by ordinary members of all ages, either sex and a range of educational backgrounds from doctors to bank managers, housewives to blacksmiths, and clerks to museum curators. Here, as in other VOs such as the Red Cross, much depends on skilled performance. Externally assessed qualification is therefore legally or internally enforced. In case study 6 a qualification is being aimed at voluntarily, as a means of obtaining employment, while in 1 and 2 there is an impression that the individuals concerned obtained their qualifications almost by the way, as by-products of adult role education. While aware of the existence of **generic** VO qualifying courses, the project team did not, in fact, come across any instances of voluntary officers and members from a sample of 1,104 individuals making use of them. It is at least possible that they learn no less by informal means 'on the job', but that **qualification** for work in VOs remains an objective for paid staff in that part of the field where there is competition for jobs. However, generic training does take place internally on a substantial scale, as in the majority of the case studies, or in larger scale efforts such as the Workers' Educational Association's new national volunteer training scheme and the work of the Educational Centres Association. Both also influence the quality of provision in institutional adult education. Among large organisations which depend on volunteer organisers locally, the NFWI's arrangements are of great interest.

Another important feature, revealed by case studies 1 and 2, is what elsewhere (Elsdon 1995b) I have described as a Jacob's ladder between voluntary and professional engagement and training, by which the experience and training gathered from either continually assists personal and institutional development in the other. Though stimulated too often by inadequate core financing of VOs, this is, indeed, such a creative influence that it would justify developing ways

of making this intercourse a regular feature of organisational change and professional training. The evidence from professionals who have learned with and from volunteer activists, e.g. in Stewart et al. (1992), case studies 4 and 14, is convincing.

A Spectrum of Training Activities

Training within VOs which are not specifically educational in the intellectual, craft, art, or physical sense varies widely. Let us assume that training is a process by which people acquire the knowledge, understanding, skills and personal attitudes which together make up the expertise required for the discharge of any kind of role and responsibility within or on behalf of a VO (or, of course, in society at large). If so, then we may assume that there is a spectrum of roles and activities. It ranges from trained professional or managerial staff (who might include teachers or trainers) at one end, via those who may do paid or voluntary professional work at different times or even in different jobs at the same time, those who rise to staff roles from voluntary involvement through intercalatory or on the job training, to experienced volunteers who have risen into officer roles in which they may well be managing professional staff or indeed providing induction training for inexperienced professionals. Beyond them there is the vast majority: the volunteer organisers and committee members learning and discharging the roles and skills of management and democratic representation, or the particular content objectives of their VO, recruiting and training others to the same end, and finally the ordinary member learning not just this content but the role skills of responsible democratic membership, and beginning to pick up her first share in it by helping with the records, the tea or the arrangement of furniture. It is in all these ways, mostly simple and always informal, that VOs contribute most markedly to the generic area of adult training.

The spectrum is wide but has its own developmental dynamic, a training potential which affects far more individuals in the population as a whole than our institutions can - **or should** - ever contemplate. Moreover, it is a potential which is fulfilled surprisingly often to **some** degree: conservative projections referred to earlier suggest some 8 million **individual** adult activists - i.e. those who discharge some kind of regular responsibility in the running of some 1.4+ million VOs. Institutional AE's contribution is more obvious at professional and other specialised levels. The more generic role skills of the heavily populated end of the spectrum could become the objective of collaborative training, with intermediary bodies such as councils of voluntary services taking the lead wherever they can be persuaded to recognise a responsibility to the whole VS and not just to philanthropy. Conversely, formal providers may be wise to look to VOs for expertise at the informal end of the spectrum.

A 'training **potential**' has been cautiously referred to because not all VOs are skilled at profiting from the informal training which they mostly provide without being aware of the fact, and they often falter in more complex tasks. E.g., VOs often complain of difficulty in finding candidates for election to committees or as officers. The reason is almost invariably that people are expected to put themselves forward publicly and 'from cold'. Organisations in which there is a continual search for new leadership potential, and where potential activists are given the opportunity to learn their trade gradually and in safe anonymity, rarely have difficulty in securing a succession of responsible talent. What may be concluded from this is that all forms of training for responsibility are (like the case studies) examples of role education. The differences between them are the **scale and complexity** of the roles - and these two do not necessarily go together: chairing a self help group of a 'mere' dozen people trying to get off tranquillisers could well be more complex than the chair's role in a very large Rotary Club. What seems certain is that complex roles are rarely mastered without some kind of preparation, while simpler ones can be picked up by joining in.

It is clear that the degree and the skill with which necessary generic or role learning occurs in

the bulk of the VS is exceedingly variable. Yet external offerings of more coherent training could easily meet with incomprehension and resistance, especially in the case of the smallest and most informal VOs, and in those where, in essence, very little skill is required. AE trainers may find our experience in researching VOs worth replicating: VOs and their members are often exceedingly modest. They are astonished and touched that anyone should be interested in them, and wish to learn from their experience, and are delighted to share it. Being stimulated to articulate what they have learned and experienced makes it conscious, and usable for the purposes of policy, organisation and action. Moreover, it is more than likely that researchers and their institutions will learn no less from this process of creative mutual listening. Perhaps this could be our best contribution to the large informal area. However, must be many such VOs which would benefit greatly from specific but modest and informal offerings. It may well be that Councils of Voluntary Services could deliver these, possibly through some informal mentoring system rather than formal course work.

One more question might be briefly addressed. If generic training is essentially a form of role education, when should this be delivered? Some of the slender evidence about role education (mostly derived from parent and political education in schools) suggests that it does not 'take' until people are close to or actually in the role concerned. This means it is best delivered in the context of practice. The writer's unsystematic experience suggests that the same is true of training for responsibility among adults and, particularly, preparation for leading roles in VOs. Having been frog-marched into the chair of a VO that had no adequate and above all no young succession he made it a priority to recruit new and young committee members. To begin with he traded on their kindness in order to expose them to opportunities and duties which, in the past, had been the chair's prerogative, while supporting them in their discharge. They have now started to help themselves to responsibilities, and he begins to hope that two, or maybe three potential successors half his age will not refuse nomination when their time comes. For small informal VOs such mentoring could well be the most apt as well as the commonest form of training.

References

Bax, W. and Moens J. R. (eds.) (1997), *Training of Volunteers - project report*, Barcelona, European Association for the Education of Adults.

Deakin Commission on the Future of the Voluntary Sector (1996), *Meeting the Challenge of Change* ('the Deakin Report'), London, NCVO.

Elsdon, K.T. (1991), *Adult Learning in Voluntary Organisations*, vol. 1, Nottingham, Continuing Education Press.

Elsdon, K.T. (1995b) 'Voluntary organisations, learning and change: some answers to unasked questions', *International Journal of University Adult Education*, vol. XXXIV, no. 2, especially p.18ff.

Elsdon, K.T. et al. (1993), *Adult Learning in Voluntary Organisations*, vol. 3, Nottingham, Continuing Education Press.

Elsdon, K.T. et al. (1995a), *Voluntary Organisations: Citizenship, Learning and Change*, Leicester, N.I.A.C.E.

Elsdon, K.T. et al. (1997), *Studying Local Voluntary Organisations: purpose, methods and findings*, London, Community Development Foundation.

Reynolds, J. et al. (1994), *A Town in Action*, being vol. 4 of *Adult Learning in Voluntary Organisations*, Nottingham, Continuing Education Press.

Stewart, S. et al. (1992), *Adult Learning in Voluntary Organisations*, vol. 2, Nottingham, Continuing Education Press.

Integrated practice: reflections on the need for a new concept in our education of adult educators

Ellen Enggaard and Helle Marstal, Royal Danish Institute of Educational Studies, Denmark

This paper intends to give you an introduction to a one-year education called "Adult Educator", and to the concept "integrated practice".

The Education is the equivalent of one year's full time study, and we train and educate groups of 25 people. During one year the nurse, the carpenter, the biologist and the painter, just to mention a few, receive training and education in order to become adult educators. Those who pass the assessment after one year are qualified for jobs as adult educators within their field of profession. The nurse at the School of Nursing, the carpenter at a Technical School etc. Some even find new fields outside of their profession.

In each of the groups of students there is a very diverse range of experience and professions. Due to the diversity within each group we have found integrated practice a very useful concept to work with in order to help the students to develop the skills to teach and the skills to reflect on their teaching.

In the following we will describe the concept we call "integrated practice". A concept we continuously try to develop and improve.

Adult education in Denmark

In the last 10-15 years there has been increasing focus on the field of adult education, continuing education and lifelong learning. It has been governmental policy throughout the nineties to strengthen and broaden the adult educational system, to initiate new education possibilities for adults and to support experimental projects on training adults. The policy of adult education in Denmark has been on the one hand closely connected to the policy of the labour market, and on the other hand closely linked to the tradition of democratically oriented popular enlightenment, "folkeoplysning". This has resulted in numerous programmes and funds supporting attempts to qualify the adult population - both employed and unemployed - vocationally as well as generally, supporting attempts to work across the educational sectors and to integrate elements of personal development within the learning process.

To support this policy the Danish government decided to establish an authorised education for adult educators in 1995. The establishing of this new education reflects a wish to heighten the quality of already existing adult educational activities and a need for educating more adult teachers to meet the expansion of the area. The aim of the education is therefore twofold: One is giving the teachers/educators in the adult educational system proper pedagogical and didactical

training and education. Another is recruiting and training new adult teachers, educators and trainers.

Until 1995 there has not been a formalised/authorised education of adult educators in Denmark. Teachers in the adult educational system in Denmark have different educational backgrounds, and not all sectors of education require a pedagogical background from their teachers. In the vocational sector they often hire skilled workers to teach specific skills and they hire school teachers or bachelors or M.A.'s to teach the general subjects. In the sector of general adult education they use school teachers and bachelors/M.A.'s, and in the nonformal popular enlightenment sector they use all kinds of people with all kinds of educational backgrounds.
In Denmark we have three main types of publicly funded adult education and continuing education:

- The "folkeoplysning" (folk-enlightenment) including evening schools, people's university, folk high schools, non-residential folk high schools and production schools. "Folkeoplysning" is a collective concept covering the teaching and pedagogically organised activities which do not form part of the formal education system. They offer general qualifying education ranging from hobby activities over general school subjects to sociological, philosophical and ethical subjects aiming at expanding the students understanding of society, human relations and personal growth.

- The general adult education including the adult education centres, special education and literacy courses for adults and teaching of adult immigrants. These activities provide general formal qualifications which can be used in connection with continued education in relation to working life or in social life.

- The vocational training and educational activities including labour market training, business colleges and trade colleges. These activities include both formal vocational education (skilled workers) and both formal and non-formal training courses for unskilled and skilled labour.

For further information on Danish adult education, see the homepage of the Danish Ministry of Education, www.uvm.dk.
As you can well imagine these educational activities differ a lot both in form and in content, in learning culture and in target groups. They cover a wide range of subjects and activities dealing with almost all aspects of adult life. The new education for adult educators is directed towards all these activities.

The content of the education

The students learn to plan, carry out and develop teaching so that their future students will benefit from their teaching both professionally and personally.

To do this the students must have a knowledge of how adult people learn, what it takes to create a good learning process for adult students and how factors such as social climate and

environment influence the learning process. They must build an understanding of adult peoples life situation and living conditions, and a psychological understanding of the different stages of adult life. They will have to know of different adult educational traditions and cultures connected to the different educational sectors, and of course they will have to work with an understanding of modern society and it's demands for qualifications and competence.

The education is organised in two parts. In the first part the students work with general themes and problems concerning adult education and training. In the second part they work with more specific themes and problems connected to their individual aim for future teaching practice. The teaching is organised thematically in relation to the 4 main fields of the education: pedagogy, psychology, sociology and pedagogical development. The themes are e.g. "Adult people's life phases and development", "Didactics of adult teaching", "Learning processes of adults", "The roles of teachers and students", "Adult education and democracy", "Politics of adult education". The students are subjects to two assessments, at the end of the first and second semester of the education.

Who attends this education?

To be admitted to the education you must have a vocational or a higher educational background, and you must have some experience with teaching, training or counselling adult people. Our experience with the students from the first two years tells us, that students applying for the education have very different backgrounds. One might be an experienced teacher from a vocational training centre, who wants to qualify his pedagogy and didactics. Another might be a postgraduate who has given a few lectures and now wants to qualify for getting a job at a folk high school. Yet others might be the primary school teacher who now wants to work with mature people or the carpenter who has always dreamt of using his skills to educate young undisciplined people. The student's educational and academic background is as varied as the adult education where they have to function afterwards. They have one thing in common though - they want to use their skills in adult education, and they want to become good adult educators.

What does it take to become a good adult educator?

When confronted with this question in a Future Workshop (Jungck & Müllert, 1984) during the first week of the education, the students come up with this:

- a substantial professional knowledge in one's field of teaching (the subject)
- good communication skills
- capacity for empathic behaviour
- ability to perceive and understand group processes
- simple interest in and curiosity towards other people
- enthusiasm in dealing with one's subject and with living people
- participation in and convictions concerning societal and social development
- striving for continuing personal and professional development

In this list of qualifications and abilities the students reveal an understanding of the complexity of the teaching profession. It has to do with both a technical knowledge relating to one's subject and a personal appearance and personality.

During the one year of education they will have to build an identity as a professional teacher. It is not sufficient to be a specialist in one's subject. Consequently the students tend to focus on: the **psychological aspects** of being a teacher and **tools and techniques** that work!

Concerning the **psychological aspects** a lot of our students tend to focus their learning interest during the first part of the education on the psychological aspects of being a teacher. They undergo a personal development themselves, they are presented with loads of new ways of thinking, they work with theories - they move from a more or less fixed way of looking at the world and the educational problems in it, into chaos: everything moves, there are many ways of looking at education and its aims, it is obvious that teachers are not what they used to be (or what they were when we went to school), probably the students have changed as well, and it looks as if the qualifications asked for are in flux - or at least very hard to specify. It seems to them that everything depends on the teacher herself. She has to be a very special person with charisma and great reserves of psychic energy. There seems to be two main reasons for this focus: One reason might be that they undergo a personal (existential) change themselves due to the character of the learning process and due to their age - many of them are middle-aged and seeking a new direction. In the search for new ways to understand themselves and to build an identity, they look for models or roles they can step into. Another reason might be that their subject is not present in this education. We do not pay much attention to the students' professions or the subjects they will have to teach in their future career. We do not deal with special problems or didactics related to their subjects. Subsequently the focus moves to general problems and themes that might be difficult to relate to and identify with. This over-focusing on the personal (and emotional) aspect of teaching is "natural" when you do not have much teaching or training practice to relate to, when you are undergoing a change and when you have not yet realised that your ability to reflect on practice is your main driving force as a teacher.

The demand for **tools and techniques** is the second significant focus. "Tell me how to teach. Don't tell me how I might do it and please don't ask me to find my own way but give me some techniques that work. Tell me how I initiate and lead a discussion in class, how I deal with resistance in the classroom and give me some communication skills that work in the teaching situation." Didactic theory is often understood as recipes for teaching, objective and means, methods and techniques.

Integrated Practice

In working with the students' focus on the personal and the technical aspects of the teaching profession, we find it very important that the students experience themselves and their fellow students in the teaching situation, that they learn to observe and reflect on teaching situations in order to find their own strengths and weaknesses, and that they feel secure enough to come forward and test their identity as professional teachers. We have to establish a practice in the classroom that is not make believe or strictly theoretical In doing this we find it very important to reflect on the learning process itself, which includes both practice experience, theoretical and consciousness-expanding activity. In doing this we work with what we call the integrated practice.

The concept is grounded in the view that didactical theory should be derived **on the basis of** practice instead of **for** practice (Hiim and Hibbe 1997). We think it is crucial that the students learn to understand and handle didactics in the zone where theory and practice meet and interact. Any teaching situation is unique and has its own unpredictability. So if you want to develop your teaching and your skills for teaching we think your best tool is to be able to analyse your own teaching practice in order to reflect upon it, develop your reflections with pedagogical and didactical theory - and act!

Our objective is to develop the students' ability to reflect on practice, and the means to attain this objective is to establish practice in the learning process.

The objective of the integrated practice: the students should be able to:

- recognise the complexity of the teaching situation
- observe, analyse and reflect upon practice
- work with pedagogical and didactical theory to qualify, broaden and bring their own reflections into perspective
- transform reflections into action, continuously developing their own teaching, never coming to a standstill

To reach these objectives we have to recognise and establish practice in the education. We operate in 5 areas of practice:

- The students have two periods of **practice teaching** in different adult educational schools where they are supervised by an experienced teacher. They are asked to reflect on their periods of practice by writing a diary while in practice in order to maintain impressions and first hand registrations for further analysis and discussion, for example in a paper. Describing a situation from their period of practice as precisely as possible in writing. These practice descriptions are subject to analysis in groups, where the students point out key problems (pedagogical, psychological, didactical) of the situation and discuss relevant theoretical ways of going more thoroughly into the problem.

- The students have several **teaching exercises** in the class. They teach each other and they are subject to thorough feedback from their fellow students. The students are encouraged to try out new forms and methods in their teaching, they are reminded that they are here to learn and to challenge themselves, so they should be aware of their potentials and weak sides and work with them. In observing the teaching of the fellow students and in giving each other feedback, the students train their observation skills and their empathic abilities, they train relevant communication skills even though they are not the person in focus. They take turns in presenting theoretical material from textbooks and articles, and in doing this they are asked to focus not only on the content but also on the form, making didactical reflections. Again they are presented with feedback from their fellow students and from the teacher.

- The **teaching performed by the staff teachers**. It is very important, that the students meet different teachers during the education, different styles, personalities, attitudes and techniques. The teaching performed by the staff teachers should be subject to analysis, criticism, inspiration and reflection.

- They are asked to reflect on and evaluate **their own learning process** (both individually and collectively) in order to recognise this as a relevant practice that should be subject to analysis and reflection. (Schön, 1987) The point is to work with the students' ability to reflect upon practice and to reflect upon their own learning process in order to create **experience with** and **awareness of learning**. This is not only important in regard to the students' own learning process, but it is a key point when you want to teach adults: to work with the experience of your students, to integrate their life experience and their vocational experience in the teaching situation in order to let your students identify with the subject, participate actively and reflect upon their own experience.

- In practising giving feed back to each other, working in study groups and supervising each other, the students learn to **work in a pedagogical environment** where discussions with colleagues are valued and recognised as a main source of inspiration for development, both professionally and personally.

Working with integrated practice

To give you an idea of how we work with integrated practice, we will give you two examples of learning situations from the Adult Educator Education:

Student A is a 35-year old locksmith. He has teaching experience from a training centre for unskilled workers where he has instructed on short term courses in welding techniques. He has little school background, he has been out working since he was 18, he is very outgoing and direct, he is very enthusiastic about this education but he obviously cannot connect what he is learning with his practice as a teacher of welding techniques. By the end of the first part of the education he is asked to present a paper on a pedagogical theme he finds important to his future teaching practice. He claims, that he cannot do that, because even though he finds everything in this education very interesting and he feels that he is undergoing a change himself, it has nothing to do with teaching workers new welding techniques. He is then asked to describe (in writing) a training situation from his practice in as much detail as possible. He is asked to analyse his case, and with the help of some fellow students he points out two key problems in his practice description - two problems that we have worked with in class: 1. resistance in the training situation and 2. the value of teacher-involvement. He decides to write a paper on the first problem and in the process of doing this he actually manages to point out some principles for teaching that he can apply to his own practice. He manages to combine his own experience in the learning process with his future teaching practice and he points out two principles in relation to his problem of "resistance": 1. his training must relate to the work experience of his students and 2. the aim of his training should be broadened so that the welding techniques are taught in a

context of problem solving.

Student B is a psychologist. She has been working with family therapy for many years, and she now wants to use her professional experience for teaching psychology. She is obviously well educated, she is used to acquiring new knowledge and she has no problems with writing papers. However, she is very shy and she lacks confidence in the teaching situation, her teaching makes little impact on her students. By the end of the first part of the education she wants to present a theoretical paper on supervision among colleagues. She is asked to relate her theme to practice and to work with what seems to be her main challenge, communicating directly with her students. She is asked to teach her fellow students the techniques of supervision among colleagues in three teaching sessions, and on behalf of these to write a paper on implementing a supervision practice among colleagues. She ends up reflecting on the communication problems in teaching psychological subjects and the necessity for working out good exercises relating to the subject.

These two examples reveal - from different starting points - the same problem, the difficulty of combining theory and practice. In working with this we have to focus on the individual student, his or her problems and points of challenge. To help the individual student we create a common practice in the classroom so the students can help each other in focusing on learning points. The diversity of the group makes it obvious for the students, that there is not just one way of doing things, not just one good way of teaching. They watch each other teach and they reflect on how and why some things work for student A but not for student B.

In creating this common practice in the classroom we also create an atmosphere of security and solidarity. Everybody is in the same boat no matter how well educated. The locksmith watches the psychologist stumbling through her teaching session, and he finds that he can give her some ideas as to improving her communication skills. And the psychologist finds that her experience with questioning techniques from therapy is very helpful to the locksmith in his search for the meaning of theory.

During the year it becomes evident to the students, that there is no such thing as one teaching technique or solution. That there is not one perfect teacher personality. Their image of the perfect teacher, the focus on the psychological and technical aspects of teaching has given way to reflection on practice, to theory on practice through working with the concept integrated practice. They are developing a professionalism and an identity as a teacher.

References

Hiim, H. and Hippe, E., 1997, *Læring gennem oplevelse forståelse og handling*, Gyldendal

Schon, D. 1987, *Educating the reflective practitioner*, San Fransisco

Lønstrup, B., 1996, *Teaching Adults with Openness*, Klim

Jungck, R and Müllert, N., 1984, *Håndbog i Fremtidsværksteder*, Politisk Revy

The role of an educator in Kyoudou gakushu (mutual study in a small group): educational provision for young adults in Japan

Yaguchi Etsuko, Ochanomizu University, Japan
Fusé Miho, University of Nottingham, UK / Ochanomizu University, Japan

Introduction

This paper seeks to contribute to the conceptual discussion of adult education and of the role of adult educators, by introducing examples of educational provision for young adults in Japan. Firstly, the overview of the structure of educational provision in Japan is presented. It is explained that in the Japanese education system, adult education is included in a broader category of 'social education' (Shakai kyouiku), together with a type of child and youth education which takes place outside formal schooling. Secondly, this paper illustrates a learning method called 'Kyoudou gakushu' (mutual study in a small group), which was originally generated in the learning movement of young adults in local communities after World War II. It is argued that the philosophy of Kyoudou gakushu still retains its relevance for contemporary educational activities, those of young adults in particular. Several merits of Kyoudou gakushu for young adults are claimed based on the experience of one of the authors (Yaguchi), who has served as an educator for 15 years in leadership training programmes run by the national council of youth organisations. Several assumptions about the role of an adult educator for constructing learning experiences following the philosophy of Kyodo gakushu are outlined. This paper concludes with a suggestion that the research and practice of adult education should take more seriously the perspective of lifelong learning which integrates adult learning with the learners' prior experience in their life.

Where is the place of young adults in adult and continuing education?

Issues of education for young adults do not usually appear as a big agenda in the debate on adult education and learning. To a large extent, an Anglo-American concept of adult education presupposes the distinction between adulthood and childhood. Theories of adult learning and education is often predicated upon the 'universal' and 'unique' nature of adults, which is different from the characteristics of children (e.g. Knowles 1980, Mezirow 1991). However, this view tends to oversimplify the difference between adulthood and childhood and to dichotomise these two, which in reality exist in continuity in the course of one's life.

At the same time, when the 'adultness' of learners is treated as given and adult education is seen as though it was separated from education in childhood, the issues of young adults who are becoming mature adults are not well explored. It also seems to undermine the notion of lifelong learning, which is now so widely accepted and advocated.

The boundary of 'social education' in Japan

On the other hand, in the Japanese education system, youth education has long been recognised as the same type of provision as adult and continuing education. In Japan, in legal terms, education is largely classified into the following three, namely 'home education', which is given to children at home privately by the parents, 'school education', which refers to education provided by formal educational institutions, and

'social education (Shakai kyouiku), which includes all the educational activities which fall outside the former two categories. While the Social Education Act of 1949 delimits the boundary of social education to those provisions for which Education Committees in local governments have responsibility, in its broader usage social education refers to a variety of educational activities which are conducted in society at large, including adult and continuing education, and youth and child education outside formal schooling. For instance, in a broad sense, social education can entail education provided by Kohmin kan (learning centres for local citizens which are run by local authorities), public libraries, museums and educational industries ('culture centres'), or learning conducted voluntarily by citizens as individuals, in local groups or in NGOs.

The tradition of Kyoudou gakushu in social education

In the history of theories of social education in Japan, one of the most influential and unique traditions is probably the philosophy of 'Kyoudou gakushu' (mutual study in a small group). Historically, Kyoudou gakushu has its roots in the democratisation of Japan in the post World War II period. It started as the initiatives of young adults in rural communities, who formed small study circles to discuss various problems in their own life and sought to transform an entrenched feudal society through a grass-roots movement. This learning movement of young adults which rapidly spread nationwide was firstly theorised by YOSHIDA Noboru in the early 1950s (Yoshida 1954). Strongly influenced by a progressive theory of education expounded by John Dewey (e.g. Dewey 1933), Yoshida advocated Kyoudou gakushu as a method of learning 'without teachers, textbooks and a blackboard', which aims at discovering problems from the everyday experiences of learners and of solving these problems by action.

Since its emergence until recent years, the concept of Kyoudou gakushu has undergone much debate and produced many variants in its application. Thus Kyoudou gakushu cannot be treated as the single tradition and is still in need of a comprehensive and in-depth research of its historical development. Nevertheless, it seems to be possible to suggest several fundamental positions of Kyoudou gakushu.

One of the distinctive features of Kyoudou gakushu is the negation of those forms of education in which educators own knowledge and transmit it to learners as objects. Rather, in Kyoudou gakushu, knowledge is something to be reached for by a collective endeavour among participants, including educators ('Jogen sha') who have expertise in given subjects. In terms of methods, Kyoudou gakushu emphasises that there needs to be an active dialogue within a group. While in conventional forms of discussion, learning often stops at expressing one's opinion and ends up with a 'collective monologue' between an educator and learners, in Kyoudou gakushu to talk about one's thoughts, feelings and experiences in the circle of colleagues is the very starting point of an active and collaborative learning process. Through the web of interrelated dialogues, it is made possible to articulate and examine what we know and how we know it, and of realising that we could know more and know it more deeply. It may well be argued that the epistemological stance of Kyoudou gakushu has something similar to Freire's dialogic method of education and to his criticism of banking notion of education (Yaguchi, Kimata and Kusuhara 1992).

Kyoudou gakushu revitalised for current social education in Japan

Since the 1970s, acknowledging the contemporary relevance of Kyoudou gakushu, there have appeared some attempts in the field of social education to refine and further develop the method of mutual study in groups. This renewed interest in Kyoudou gakushu was similarly observed in that education aimed at the empowerment of the socially disadvantaged and social change, such as literacy education and education for

women's liberation. The common assumption of these contemporary forms of Kyoudou gakushu is that learning should start with the collaborative analysis of learners' own experience of everyday life, not with the passive application of abstracted knowledge which has been created somewhere else.

In the similar vein, one of the authors (Yaguchi) has attempted to apply the philosophy of Kyoudou gakushu to a contemporary provision of social education, in particular, training leaders of youth groups in local communities. For 15 years she has served as an educator ('Jogen sha') for programmes run by the national council of youth organisations, Japan Seinendan Council. It has been recognised that the learning method of Kyoudou gakushu seems most appropriate for young adults, in that it meets their deep needs to become active originators of their own lives.

Kyoudou gakushu also appears to be effective in redressing the problems which young adults have inherited from their stressful school years. As has long been pointed out, the current education system in Japan forces students to live under the constant pressure of becoming successful in competition and exams, and denies young people sufficient opportunities to freely develop themselves into socially responsible adults with fully rounded personalities. It is often observed in educational programmes for young adults that they lack self-confidence, active interests in social issues, the skill to build relationship with others and sympathetic concerns with them. These problems seem to partly derive from their experience in formal schooling.

At the same time, these problems of young adults appear to be compounded by the lack of places in society where young adults are accepted as who they are and can further discover and realise their creative potentials. This failure of society to meet the needs of young adults became publicly acknowledged through two events which occurred in Japan in 1995. One is the attack made by a religious cult, Aum shinri kyo on the underground system in Tokyo with a deadly nerve gas sarin. This extraordinary crime cost several lives and caused many, and it was made into light that the whole attempt to massacre people, starting with the experiment and production of the nerve gas, was undertaken by young members of the cult which include scientists and doctors who graduated respectable universities. On the other hand, the profound potential of young adults was also widely recognised through their voluntary work at the site of the aftermath of Hanshin Great earthquake, which occurred in the same year. Though they look very different in nature, both examples seem to similarly symbolise young adults' deep needs for an alternative, more committed way of relating themselves to society.

The relevance of Kyoudou gakushu for education for young adults

Given the problems and potential needs of young adults which have been mentioned above, social education seems to have a task to provide them with more humane and authentic experiences of learning than those which were provided in schools and are currently prevalent in society. In this sense, the method of Kyoudou gakushu has a lot to offer, and in fact, the relevance of Kyoudou gakushu for youth education is confirmed by both the experiences of the authors and those of learners. Certainly, at the beginning young adults sometimes feel embarrassed by the new method of learning, but it is usually observed that they come to enjoy this new experience with excitement and enthusiasm. The characteristics of the learning method of Kyoudou gakushu and its merits for young adults are found in the following dimensions:

Education which follows the philosophy of Kyoudou gakushu

- promotes the process of discovering the relatedness of one's own life experience and broader social issues. This can help young adults acquire the tools for 'reading' and exploring the world, rather than the skills of using ready-made information.

- is flexible in employing a variety of methods of learning and expressing / communicating one's ideas, such as writing, drawing, role playing, and singing. This can help young adults to discover / create their own 'language' to speak out their voice.

- negates authoritarian teachers who transmit knowledge to learners as objects, but designates educators as CO-investigators who share interests in subjects with learners. This can enhance young adults' genuine interests in knowledge, which enable them to continue their exploration even after an educational programme comes to an end.

- does not follow fixed methods or forms of programmes but emphasises that learners and an educator flexibly organise their learning as a group. This can enhance each learner's skills of managing learning in a group, which are essential to develop new groups in the future.

- recognises the importance of making records of one's own learning and of the learning which takes place in a group. This enables participants to trace how their understanding of given issues have changed, and also serves as the basis for further learning.

The role of an educator in Kyoudou gakushu

In the type of learning following the philosophy of Kyoudou gakushu, an educator has a role more than a subject teacher and a facilitator of the learning process. It seems that the following assumptions about the role of educators can be outlined:

In Kyoudou gakushu, an educator should

- have sufficient knowledge on given issues, but also interests in the social origin / background of these issues and how they are related to each other or to other subjects. If necessary, an educator should be able to give a lecture on these matters to learners.

- be familiar with a variety of learning methods and be able to support learners to further develop / discover their own ways of learning, exploring and communicating both as an individual and as a group.

- be flexibly prepared for a variety of expected needs of participants in terms of resources for learning, e.g. by securing access to the source of relevant information and the availability of specialised lecturers.

- be able to foster a critical dialogue within a group. This method involves helping each participant to articulate and examine what they and others know in the course of a collaborative learning process.

Implication for the concept of adult education

In concluding this short paper, we would like to make a contribution to the conceptual discussion of adult education. The issues of young adults seem to provoke the need to re-examine the conventional scope of the research and practice of adult education. They do not allow us to be content with adult education provision which is based on the assumed 'universal nature' of adulthood, independent of the learner's gender, social class, experience of prior education and so on. From the perspective of the educators working with young adults, those theories which presuppose the fixed 'nature' of adulthood without considering social, educational and material environments in which human beings grow up and live, appear to have little relevance. We would argue that adult education should take more seriously the perspective of lifelong learning, which views an individual's learning as a continuum from childhood through the period of 'becoming adults' to adulthood. A new approach to adult education seems to be in need.

Reference

Dewey, J. (1933) *How we think*. Boston: D. C. Heath.

Knowles, M. (1980) *The modern practice of adult education*. New York: Eaglewood Cliffs.

Mezirow, J. (1991) *Transformative dimension of adult learning*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Yaguchi, E. (1984) 'The theoretical history of "Kyoudou gakushu." ' *Bulletin of The Japan Society for the Study of Adult Education*, 20, 9-16. (In Japanese)

Yaguchi, E., Kimata, R. and Kusuhara, A. (1992) 'Learning theories and practices of adult education.' *Bulletin of The Japan Society for the Study of Adult Education*, 28, 1-13. (In Japanese)

Yoshida, N. (1954) 'The essence of Kyoudou gakushu.' Japan Seinendan Council (ed.), *A guide to Kyoudou gakushu*. Tokyo: Nihon Seinen Kan. (In Japanese)

Developing teacher educators for working with students retrained as teachers in a mid-life career change

Dr. Rivka Geron, Levinsky College of Education, Israel and Nomi Arnon, Levinsky College of Education and MOFET Institute for Research, Curriculum and Program Development for Teacher Educators, Israel

This paper describes a special project for Pedagogy Instructors who are working with mid-career change student teachers. The main aim of the program, conducted at the Levinsky College of Education, Israel, was to deepen the instructors' understanding of the needs of adult student teachers, and to develop an appropriate model of working with this special population.

'Lifelong Learning' - a Salient Social Change and its Implication for Teacher Training

Continuous lifelong-learning is one of the salient social and psychological revolution that has taken place in modern society. If in the past this phenomenon was uncommon, today studying to acquire another profession is accepted as a legitimate stage in personal or professional development. Any self-respecting system, including the educational system, demands that its personnel study and, at the conclusion of their studies, encourages them to become mobile within the system's larger framework and to apply their newly acquired skills. (Jarvis, 1987; (Jarvis, 1991 Heb.)

It has always been one of the goals of the educational system to encourage staff members to update their knowledge and training. However, it is only in the last twenty years that the tendency to support teachers to enrol in task-oriented courses, either for advanced academic degrees, or for specialization in their respective fields, has intensified.

This trend is part of the changing concept of education. Education is no longer a matter of simply passing down information from generation to generation, but rather the active pursuit of quick-changing information and the rapid personal and social adjustment necessary to apply it. Today, education is defined as active learning and, more than ever, is ready to provide learning opportunities to those who crave for lifelong study.

These changes, both social and educational, led to changes in the approach of teacher training institutions regarding their responsibility for the professional growth of the teacher. Their responsibility is no longer limited to the early stages of training, but rather a deepening and broadening responsibility for continuing studies at different stages in the professional development of teachers. Another interesting phenomena taking place in Israel is the choice of teaching as a mid career change. In increasing numbers, adults with academic degrees who have worked in other professions for many years enrol at teachers colleges to train for a new career. Yet another special group of adult learners is that of new-immigrant teachers. These professionals, after many years of work in teaching, must go through retraining, as students in their new country.

The Certification Department, within the framework of the Unit for Continuing Studies at Levinsky College of Education in Tel Aviv, Israel, was established in order to provide opportunities of changing career for the above mentioned populations.

The Certification Department at the Levinsky College of Education, Tel Aviv, Israel

The Students in the Department

About 700 students study within the framework of this department.
They can be divided into three main categories:

1st. **Practising teachers** with teaching experience who attend in order to upgrade their certification for an additional degree and/or to qualify in some special field exceeding the qualifications covered by the teaching certificate in their possession.

2nd. **Holders of academic degrees** who are interested in qualifying for teaching the subject in which they have their degree. Others are interested in specialising in teaching a subject different from that which they studied in the university.

3rd. **New immigrant teachers** who are interested in acquiring an Israeli teaching certificate. Most of them were teachers in their countries of origin. Some had a great deal of teaching experience (and sometimes having worked in administrative positions in their respective countries). Others had university degrees, but have no teaching experience.

All the above constitute a many faceted population demanding a differential approach in planning the curriculum at the theoretical level and setting up a program for gaining teaching experience.

The Pedagogy Instructors in the Department

As in all teacher training programs in Israel, the theoretical components are integrated with the practical ones in order to handle situations arising in the classroom. The pedagogy instructors, in addition to other responsibilities, are in charge of this aspect of classroom teaching.

About 40 pedagogy instructors are involved in the practical training of the students. These educators, experienced in teaching and training regular students, were thrown into teaching and training adults without any preparation.

The two striking phenomena mentioned above: the massive trend of adult students who come to the college, looking for a career change, on the one hand and the lack of professional training of the pedagogy instructors in working with adult students, on the other, were the triggers to establishing a relevant in-service training course, for the pedagogy instructors.

The In-service Program for Pedagogy Instructors in the Certification Department

Rationale and course of action

In light of the characteristics and the variability of the two populations - students and instructors - the planned in-service program was aimed to help these instructors to learn more about how to respond to the specific needs of the students and to develop special working methods appropriate for this more senior population.

Basic Assumptions

- The growing acceptance and the spread of 'lifelong learning' practice world wide, strengthens the need for educators who are working with adult learners to specialise in the field of Adult Education.
- Mid-career students are different from the regular population at the College of Education. We must take into account the special characteristics and needs of our students who are mature adults. (Tokatli, 1998 Heb.).
- The Instructors themselves are also adult students who have much living and professional experience. Their knowledge and experience should be used as a learning resource in the course of moulding their professional thinking.
- The planning of the in-service course has to be based on principles employed in the teaching-learning of adults. (Knowles, 1985, 1986; Mezirow, 1991).
- Our work will be concentrating on the instructors' development assuming that it will affect and have influence on their students' training.

Aims

- Setting up a forum capable of expressing the instructors' needs, difficulties and problems in their work with their student population.
- Developing a sense of community and group support.
- Using the knowledge and the personal and professional experience of the instructors as a learning resource.
- Defining the specific problems that arise in the process of pedagogical guidance of various populations of adult students teachers.
- Examining issues related to adult education and to retraining for a second career.
- Helping instructors develop reflective thinking processes about their methods and their guidance style.
- Formulating a differential model of training according to varied student populations:
  - University graduates preparing to be teachers
  - Certified teachers - studying to attain teacher's certificate in a new field or specialization
  - New immigrant trained teachers - studying for an Israeli teaching certificate.

Subjects and Content

- Pedagogical dilemmas in instructing the adult student.
- Basic issues in adult education and retraining for a second career
- The role concept of the pedagogy instructor
- Models of instruction:
  - Self orientated learning
  - Using metaphors
  - Conflict solving
  - Micro-teaching
  - Planning creative activities

Working Methods and activities

As was already stated, working methods are based both upon the requirements of reflective guidance and on the needs of the adult student (Shon 1983; Knowles 1986; Tokatli 1994, 1997 Heb):

- Co-ordinating expectations regarding both content and working methods
- Encouraging co-operation and maximum involvement of all participants
- Exchanging feedback after each meeting to examine the appropriateness and relevance of the material being taught and the teaching and learning methods being used.

- Opening up an assortment of teaching-learning frameworks:
  - Individual learning
  - Working in small groups
  - Discussions in the plenum
  - Simulation
- Experimenting with a variety of forms of active teaching learning:
  - simulation
  - Case studies
  - Analysing and giving feedback of documented guidance situations
  - Peer teaching
- Emphasising learning-teaching processes:
  - Using reflective thinking
  - Pinpointing of the parallel processes between the learning processes in the group of the instructors and the processes taking place in the groups they lead.
  - Modelling the concept of the teacher as a facilitator rather than as a sole source of knowledge.
  - Incorporating the professional background and experience of each participant by encouraging the unique contribution of individuals, each in his own special field.
- Concern for the setting:
  - Paying attention to and showing concern for the physical comfort of the participants: Serving coffee, tea and refreshments, comfortable surroundings etc.
  - Providing a relaxed setting which will enable informal ties and closer connections among group members.

The whole process was based on a bilateral streaming: starting from the pedagogical instructors, their experience, needs and the main issues that they engaged in, onto theory and back from studying theory and back to the practical-experiential world of the teacher educator.

Summary and Implications for the Future

In the course of planning and operating the workshop, we had no doubt that in the first circle, the circle of instructors, we had to put the studies on an evolutionary basis - that is, the team would be learning as it proceeds, making the relevant match between theory and practice. At this stage, we did not deal directly with the second circle - the students.

We believed it would be best to base the process on the active involvement of the participants, and on learning subjects relevant to their professional activity. We have tried to create a dynamic dialogue between us as the leaders of the program and our colleagues as well as among themselves. We assumed that this would enable them to translate this experience into building similar processes among their guidance groups.

This approach will be formalised during the coming academic year when, we hope, the instructors sum up their experience in a Manual of Instructing Adult Student Teachers.

References

English

Jarvis P (1987), *'Adult Learning in the Social Context'*, London: Crumb Helm.

Mezirow J, (1991) *'Transformative dimensions of adult learning'*, San Francisco: Jossey Bass.

Knowles M S (1985) *'Andragogy in Action'*, San Francisco: Jossey Bass..

Knowles M S (1986) *'Using learning contracts'*, San Francisco: Jossey Bass.

Shon D, (1983) *'The reflective Practitioner: How Professionals Think in Action'*, New York, Basic Books

Hebrew

Jarvis P (1996), '*Commentary at The HANUKA Conference of The Department of Adult Education, The Ministry of Education of Israel in Far Hamaccabia*'

Tokatki R (1994), 'Curriculum Development for Adults', in Kirmayer P and Bar Shalom T (eds) *Gadish*, Vol B, pp 31-32, The Ministry of Education, The Department of Adult Education, Jerusalem

Tokatki R (1997), 'An Andragogy-Developmental Model in Community Work' , in Kirmayer P and Basok E (eds) *Gadish* , Vol C-D , pp 74-91, The Ministry of Education, The Department of Adult Education, Jerusalem

Tokatki R (1998), 'In-service Training of Teachers and The Teacher Training Institutions', in Shai A (ed) *Bamichlala*, No 9, pp 105-127, The David Yelin College of Education, Jerusalem.

NVQs in higher education tutor training: the candidates' experience

Yvonne Hillier, City University, United Kingdom

Much has been written about the delivery of National Vocational Qualifications (NVQs) and most of this has been of a highly critical nature (Hyland, 1993, 1994, 1996a 1996b, 1998). Little research has been conducted into the experience of undertaking NVQs from the perspective of the candidates. This paper discusses the impact of Learning Development NVQs Level 4 for associate lecturers who teach adults in higher education. It tests human capital theory (Blaug, 1992, Becker, 1993, Fuller 1995), in particular, that of continuing professional development (CPD) and identifies the cost and benefit to candidates who have been working towards or successfully completed the NVQ.

The introduction of NVQs and their underlying philosophy has been well documented (Hodgkinson and Issit, 1995 , Burke, 1995, Jessup, 1991). The main tenets of competence based education and training are that trainees can accredit what they already know and do, that their knowledge and skill is relevant to their occupation, that they can become accredited as competent at their own pace and that they gain nationally recognised qualifications.

Criticisms of NVQs

The arguments against NVQs as a means of assessing professional competence have been numerous and scathing. They range from philosophical criticisms of the construction of knowledge and its attendant issues of assessment (Carr, 1993, Norris, 1991, Gipps, 1993, Marshall, 1994, Tomlinson, 1995) to attacks on the competence framework because it is based on behaviourist principles (Ashworth and Saxton, 1990, Chown and Last, 1993, Hyland, 1994, 1996, Child, 1996, Fuller, 1995?). The latter has been described by Armstrong (1995) as merely a 'blinkered reaction' against behaviourism (Armstrong, 1995, p10). These attacks have created a literature of 'anti-NVQism' graphically described by Ecclestone as

'the belated whinging of a group of academics who do not want to change their practice or to be accountable for it' (Ecclestone, 1997, p71).

NVQs are said to be 'suffocating' in their assessment specifications (Ecclestone 1997, p77), promote 'docile compliance' (Malcolm 1995) and are seriously flawed in definitions of competence (Hyland, 1994). Attempts to use the standards designed primarily for the workplace in colleges and universities is 'endlessly stretching' (Ecclestone, 1997, p75) the original remit and resulting in 'spiralling specifications' (Wolf, 1995). The focus on the technical difficulties in assessing NVQs and the relentless bureaucracy detract from the developmental gains from undertaking the NVQ units. Such attacks contrast with a silence from those who may be the recipients of good quality training and professional development which has had an impact on their professional lives. It has been difficult to find in the literature many positive comments about NVQs. A more positive treatment of the debate by Kathryn Ecclestone (1997) suggests that those who have worked towards NVQs, in particular the D units, understand the process required in assessing NVQs by reflecting on their own assessing practice.

Critics of the NVQ assessment scheme argue that there is no differentiation between what is just acceptable and what is above standard. As Norris succinctly states

> 'there is a tension between a floor of minimum acceptable standards that marks the divide between competence and incompetence and a ceiling of standards of excellence that encapsulate the essential features of best practice' (Norris, 1991, p335).

Yet many of the criticisms about assessment can also be applied to traditional forms of education and training (Ecclestone, 1997) Thus, the 'I know a 2:1 when I see it' is as subject to disagreement as the assessment of performance criteria for an NVQ (Ecclestone, 1997, p67).

The concern over reliability of assessment and standards for delivery of NVQs was acknowledged in the Beaumont Report (1995). Its key recommendations included simplification of the form and structure of standards, use of plain English and Welsh, guidance on assessment specification and elimination of unnecessary bureaucracy. These recommendations have subsequently been tackled by awarding bodies, National Council for Vocational Qualifications (NCVQ, now the Qualifications and Curriculum Authority, QCA) and the Lead Bodies, in particular through The Common Accord (1997b).

Professional knowledge

The Higher Education Quality Council (HEQC) report on the involvement of higher education in the delivery of S/NVQs (1995) acknowledged the difficulties in identifying sufficiency of knowledge and understanding and how this might be inferred from competent practice. This is a key issue for higher level NVQs where it is expected that individuals require a depth of knowledge and understanding to be able to perform competently as this professional level.

Edwards and Usher (1994) and Barnett (1994) call for definitions of knowledge which cannot simply be set in industry standards and assessed by checklists. Gonczi (1994) has argued that the reductionist nature of competence based education and training (CBET) has resulted in assessment methods which are 'inappropriate for conceptualising professional works' and he has 'serious doubts about [their] relevance to work at any level' (Gonczi, 1994, p29). Ultimately, the difficulty lies in making explicit what is implicit in professional practice, 'articulable versus the intuitive nature of expertise' (Tomlinson, 1995, p192). This is a key component of reflective practice (Schon 1983, 1987,) and how professional knowledge is constructed and elicited (Eraut, 1994).

There is a difference between the role of initial training to join a profession and continuing development required to update skills and knowledge and to maintain membership of a profession or professional body (Eraut, 1994, Lindley, 1996). Many professional bodies now require their members to undertake continuing professional development (CPD). Lifelong learning is central to models of CPD, where individuals can enter a profession and then develop and update their skills and knowledge throughout their careers. The NVQ framework may match this model by identifying the levels at which a person is said to be competent. The 'mix and match' approach of core plus options including units from various occupational standards creates a flexibility for personal development, employer specific development and CPD requirements of professional bodies. The need for flexibility is inherent in the postmodern analysis of work where as Bartram notes 'it is a rash individual who tried to plan the details of their lifetime learning and expect to stick to it for the next 40 years or so' (Bartram, 1996, p21).

Whether NVQs are an appropriate way to develop professional practice is an untested area, particularly in higher education which in the past has enjoyed a close relationship with many professional bodies (Eraut, 1994). Despite the successful ASSETT programme (Winter and

Maisch 1996) the evaluation of competence based programmes and, in particular, NVQs in higher education has not been possible due to their limited take up so far. Ecclestone (1997) urges empirical research to test out 'both the positive and negative claims for their implementation' (Ecclestone, 1997, p72).

The relationship between professional accreditation and vocational qualification is 'complex and potentially sensitive' (Government Position Paper, 1996, p18) and merely supplanting current professional qualifications with NVQs would serve 'no useful purpose'. Thus, as Rivis (1996) notes, higher education institutions have an important role to play in supporting learning at higher levels but are wary of NVQs due to the lack of clarity about the place of knowledge and understanding, the perceived rigidity of the framework and the individualistic stance of the standards which neglects the wider social, economic and politic contexts in which activities take place. However, Seagraves et al (1996), McAleavy and McCrystal (1995), Morgan (1997), Taylor, (1996), Winter and Maisch (1996) provide evidence that it is possible to incorporate the needs of the workplace in a higher education qualification. One way to achieve this, as the Dearing Report recommends, is for S/NVQs to be included within traditional academic qualifications (Dearing, NCIHE, 1997, 10.24, p146).

The value of an NVQ

Why should an individual invest time, money and effort to gain a vocational qualification? Human capital theory argues that investment provides consumption and investment benefits (Blaug, 1992, Tight, 1995). Thus, people will gain pecuniary and non pecuniary benefit over time. Little (1997) describes this willingness to invest as 'the pursuit of certificates' which is the 'socially legitimate way to improve one's life chances' (Little, 1997, p7).

Fuller (1995) suggests that a distinction should be made between the purposes of qualifications and the perceptions of their worth. She uses the notion of exchange value where qualifications have status according to their perceived value for employers, HEIs and individual qualification holders (Fuller 1994, 1995). Vocational qualifications theoretically should have both a high use and high exchange value as they equip people to undertake jobs competently. Employers are likely to be more interested in qualifications which have a high use value and individuals more likely to want qualifications which have a high exchange value. The value of qualifications can be said to be of importance for various 'stakeholders': employers, individuals, professional bodies, awarding institutions and ultimately the clients the professionals work with. However, the value of higher level NVQs for both employers and employees is yet to be established compared with traditional academic and vocational qualifications at this level.

The focus of this paper is on one field of professional practice, the education of adults. There is no Lead Body in education and therefore no national standards. The closest national standards which apply to this field are the Training and Development Standards. Can these be applied to teaching in the academic context? Not according to Ashworth and Saxton, (1990), Chown and Last (1993) and Hyland (1993, 1994, 1996a, 1996b, 1998). However, Garland (1995) suggests that the standards can be introduced without compromising critical reflectivity and critical understanding. Interestingly, as Rivis (1996) notes, most British academic staff have no formal qualifications in either teaching or guidance. A study by Universities' and Colleges' Staff Development Agency (UCoSDA) concluded that greater credibility and status is attached to the universities' own qualifications, ie Diplomas, Masters degrees than to existing schemes of accreditation and NVQs were not seen to be appropriate for accrediting academic staff (UCoSDA, 1995).As Gokulsing, Ainley and Tysome note,

> it is ironic that the profession largely responsible for the delivery of programmes leading to the award of NVQs and GNVQs - teaching- has been one of the slowest to apply the framework to its own professional qualifications (Gokulsing, Ainley and Tysome, 1996, p74).

Yet Dearing (NCIHE,1997) recommends that all teaching staff in higher education should be qualified to teach. The following section describes a study of candidates' experiences of undertaking Level 4 NVQ in Learning Development and suggests that there are benefits in gaining the award regardless of the difficulties encountered in the NVQ system.

The study

This paper draws upon a pilot study of two distinct styles of delivery of the NVQ but focuses on only one of the groups. Participants in this group were involved in a feasibility study in the Open University (OU) to identify whether the Training and Development Standards could provide a suitable mechanism for accredited training of associate lecturers. These seven candidates were working towards or had successfully completed the NVQ Level 4 in Learning Development. In individual interviews they were asked to discuss five main areas relating to their experiences of doing the NVQ: how they thought it had affected their work, their views on what it means to be a professional, how the NVQ had helped their practice, the costs and benefits in working towards the qualification and any personal benefits they had gained from undertaking the award. The candidates were associate lecturers who had no background in training and development. The staff who were asked to assess the candidates also worked as associate lecturers for the university but had extensive experience of training and development. These assessors were also given the opportunity to be accredited with the Level 4 if they did not already possess it. This paper shows that the application of NVQs in Learning Development for associate lecturers provides an appropriate format for accredited staff development.

The OU had not run a full NVQ programme for its associate lecturers before but does have a centre for vocational qualifications. It is familiar with offering accredited staff development programmes. The seven candidates interviewed in the study were volunteers drawn from across the southern region. Only two of the candidates had completed the NVQ Level 4 in Learning Development at the time of the interviews.

The case study tests the claims of NVQ rhetoric by analysing candidates' perceptions. Candidates were highly skilled professionals who all possessed traditional academic or vocational qualifications. This provided an opportunity to ask them to compare their experiences of undertaking the NVQ with their previous qualifications.

Reasons for doing the NVQ

According to human capital theory, people invest in training and development which lead to qualifications for consumption and investment benefits (Blaug, 1992, Becker, 1993). The candidates all responded that the award could lead to further work and career prospects. Those associate lecturers in particular who either worked full time in other professions or were retired felt that the D units would be most useful for gaining other work and providing pecuniary benefits.

Experience of doing the NVQ

The rhetoric of NVQs includes their accessibility. Without exception, all the candidates had found the NVQ difficult. The language of their responses portrayed a sense of initial despair: 'discouraging', 'stressful', 'frustrating', 'wanting to throw it out the window'. Even if they felt unsupported or lacking in advice or a structure for their portfolio development, the

candidates acknowledged the effort made by the programme team to minimise the impact of the language of the national standards when undertaking the programme of development and gathering evidence for accreditation.

Portfolio building

Most candidates approached their NVQs with confusion and trepidation, which often turned to anger and despair. Their approaches can be divided into two styles, a unit by unit gathering of evidence for the portfolio and a holistic approach through work projects which were subsequently cross referenced across to NVQ units and elements. The majority began with the former and migrated to the latter. Both methods were successful and recommended by candidates. One of the assessors for the OU study suggested that the full NVQ would not be appropriate for all associate lecturers but certain units, notably the D units and some of the C units could form the basis of 'mini awards' which would not only provide accreditation but more importantly define a standard of practice which could be consistently and coherently introduced across the OU.

Knowledge gains

The early criticisms of NVQs centred around their lack of underpinning knowledge. Candidates were asked for their comments on this. None of the candidates stated that they had gained significant new knowledge from the NVQ. However, when discussing knowledge covered in the training programme, they mentioned learning theories, training practice analysed in the literature, equal opportunities and models of evaluation. Most of the candidates had not used a learning needs analysis before and found it made an important difference to their practice. Learning needs analysis is a process which is defined in the national standards in the A units. Gathering evidence for the A units caused most difficulty as these are based on activities which were not a routine part of their role. However, doing these units ensured candidates were more aware of how to plan specifically for their students' needs.

NVQs versus academic qualifications

Candidates had mixed views about how much knowledge they had gained and its affect on their professional practice compared with their previous traditional qualifications. The candidates were drawn from a wide range of initial careers including industrial chemistry, educational psychology and training with the Civil Service. Some found it hard to distinguish between knowledge they had gained from their previous experience and qualifications and that required for the NVQ. Two candidates had been trained by the Civil Service and felt that this provided them with a basic grounding which they had further developed through their everyday practice.

Evidence from this study indicates that NVQs are just as, if not more demanding to undertake at higher levels than traditional academic qualifications. They are seen by the candidates to offer real advantages in identifying 'good practice' which should be adhered to. However, candidates did not feel that the NVQ had stretched their knowledge. Most agreed that this was also true of academic qualifications but that the latter did not actually help in the workplace. One candidate felt that his MSc had been 'as far removed from my day to day practice as I can think of' and in fact was more influenced by the NVQ in training and development when talking to the children in his full-time role as educational psychologist.

One of the objectives of the feasibility study by the OU included an evaluation of the effectiveness of the NVQ in raising standards of teaching and learning for the associate lecturers. One of the assessors had been keen to incorporate the NVQ as a means of achieving this. She felt that the feasibility study demonstrated the value of applying national standards to an academic teaching institution. She felt the application of standards could also

provide a coherent quality assurance mechanism. Yet she perceived that the status of the award was an immense difficulty for the organisation.

> It might meet resistance from people with MScs and PhDs. Why do we do MScs? It is not for personal achievement but job promotions require [qualifications]. At the moment academic establishments want MScs and PhDs and [the NVQ] is not comparable or even useful.

Another assessor felt it would be a shame not to use the NVQ in staff development for associate lecturers but felt that it was likely not to be pursued and was 'an example of academia not accepting NVQs'.

Changes in practice

NVQs are based on national standards which should be implemented in the workplace. Did the NVQ change practice? Those who criticise NVQs suggest that the awards retrospectively accredit a superficial checklist of skills without assessing underpinning knowledge and understanding or the capability to work in new and undefined situations. If NVQs have an impact on practice, what is it? Are the criticisms levelled at NVQs also true of traditional vocational and academic qualifications?

The candidates in the OU overwhelmingly agreed that their practice had changed as a result of the NVQ, although the impact varied according to their experience and the extent to which they were already operating in the training and development field. Only one candidate who was relatively new to teaching in the OU found it difficult to identify if any change in his practice was a result of doing the NVQ or simply because he was 'learning on the job'.

As a minimum the NVQ resulted in 'fine tuning' of current practice notably for the experienced assessors for the OU. The associate lecturers for the OU stated that they were much more aware of giving feedback to their students, defining more clearly the objectives for their tutorials and seminars and being aware of the need to systematically evaluate their practice.

Professionalism

As noted earlier, higher level NVQs may be appropriate for CPD in a range of professional areas. What did being professional mean to the candidates and did the NVQ help them develop their practice? Candidates were asked to define their idea of being a professional. Their responses indicated a core set of characteristics including working to a code of conduct, reliability, integrity, an expectation of continually evaluating own performance and improving upon this through changing practice and undertaking professional development. Many of the candidates discussed 'good practice' and how they constantly strove to achieve this. Many felt that the NVQ did help improve their professional practice and confirmed that they were indeed professionals.

A significant component of professional practice discussed by the candidates was how they reflect on their practice and critically evaluate it. The NVQ contains E units which prescribe quite explicitly that candidates should evaluate their own practice and make necessary changes. Most felt they continually reflected before they undertook the NVQ but again having units from a national standard provided confirmation that they were doing the job properly.

Benefits of gaining an NVQ

Exchange theory argues that candidates would want an NVQ because it would make them more marketable both within their own organisation and to others. The impact of NVQs for

the candidates was diffuse but extensive. They were aware of the potential gains from undertaking an award but also that the status of this award was questionable. There was a tension for the OU lecturers who were operating in an academic environment and which also offered its own non-NVQ accreditation for career development. An analysis of the interviews indicates that there were real advantages in terms of confidence gains, financial gain and in helping others to undertake NVQ qualifications.

Confidence and affirmation

The most significant gain from undertaking the NVQ was increased confidence for all the candidates and an affirmation of their practice. All noted that they felt the qualification affirmed that they were professionals who were working to a nationally recognised standard. The impact on experienced trainers was perhaps most surprising. As one assessor noted,

> I was pleased when I produced [the portfolio]. It looked good and I was glad to have been able to have done that. Even if you know you're competent no one ever asks you to prove it.

Many of the associate lecturers expected that gaining the D units could involve them in further work with the OU if it decided to introduce some of the NVQ units for staff development in the future. They were keen to put their newly gained assessor awards to use within the organisation.

Criticisms of NVQs - are they borne out by the candidates?

So far, the analysis of candidates' experiences indicates a primarily positive picture. Yet there were many difficulties associated with undertaking an NVQ which bear out much of the criticism in the literature.

Language

The most damning comment from all the candidates was their difficulty with the language of the standards, described variously as impenetrable, being completely flummoxed, learning a new language.

The costs of undertaking the NVQ have been described earlier in terms of the investment of time and effort, particularly emotional effort. One candidate argued that 'when you get so far into it you think in terms of the time you have invested and it seems foolish to throw it all in'. It was not easy to gather evidence, when interpreting the standards required much time and effort. Virtually all the candidates stated that the cost in terms of emotional stress was particularly high. One associate lecturer argued that the programme was a 'character building survival course'. The requirement of persistence to cope with the stress of portfolio building and language interpretation may be peculiar to NVQs, although most candidates noted that they encountered difficulties with completing traditional qualifications. Yet traditional qualifications were seen to be less emotionally draining and as one candidate pointed out, only 40 percent is necessary to pass an A level. Gaining the NVQ requires 100 percent achievement of the units. It also requires evidence of personal practice which is more demanding than writing exam answers as it puts one's own professionalism 'one the line'.

NVQs in Academe

The feasibility study in the OU provides evidence that it is possible to integrate higher levels NVQs into an academic context as a qualification structure and to apply training and development standards to an academic setting. This accords with recommendations by CVCP (1997) that there is 'particular scope for integrating competence-based approaches to education in postgraduate and post-experience courses and continuing professional development'. This is despite the way in which higher education institutions 'jealously guard

their autonomy with respect to the award of their degrees' (Randall, 1997,p13). Randall suggests that the solution lies in 'multiple accreditation' and this may address the issues of status raised by the candidates. If membership of a professional body requires evidence of both professional competence and an understanding of the theoretical context in which practice is located, then the combination of higher level NVQs with traditional academic qualifications may be a way forward. This suggests that one qualification on its own is not sufficient to meet the challenges of continually changing skills for the next century. It enables the academic institutions to maintain their power in defining what counts as knowledge which is worthy of accreditation. However, the polarisation of knowledge and skill, vocational and academic is perhaps long overdue for diminution and multiple accreditation may prove to be the vehicle by which this is achieved.

Conclusion

Analysis of the impact of NVQs on stake holders must include individuals, employers, colleagues and professional bodies. This study shows that despite the scathing criticisms of the competence based NVQs, there are gains for the stakeholders. the model of human capital theory, the consumption and investment benefits for individuals can be demonstrated. However, the exchange use and value of the award is problematic. Individuals can see the benefits for their organisation. Candidates who are now qualified to NVQ Level 4 in Learning Development profess a commitment to their practice and an awareness of the need to continually update their knowledge and skills. Their approach has characteristics of flexibility needed by a workforce ready to meet challenges of the next century. The question remains, will the OU and other HEIs be able to recognise the valuable contribution these professionals can make, particularly in their role of teaching and training others?

References

Armstrong, P., (1995) Raising Standards: A creative look at competence and assessment and implications for mainstreaming in university adult education *SCUTREA Conference Papers* University of Manchester, pp6-11

Ashworth P., and Saxton, J., (1990) On 'competence' *Journal of Further and Higher Education*, 14 (2) pp3 -25

Barnett, R., (1994) *The Limits of Competence: Knowledge, Higher Education and Society*, Buckingham: Open University Press

Bartram, D., (1996) The involvement of Higher Education in the delivery of S/NVQs A stimulus paper for a series of NCVQ and SCOTVEC workshops, London: NCVQ/SCOTVEC

Beaumont, G., (1995) *Review of 100 NVQs and SVQs* Report submitted to the Department for Education and Employment, London DfEE

Becker, G., (1993) *Human Capital: A Theoretical and Empirical Analysis with Special Reference to Education*, 3rd Edition, Princeton NJ: Princeton University Press

Blaug, M., (1992) *The Economic Value of Education: Studies in the Economics of Education*, Aldershot: Edward Elgar

Burke, J., (Ed) (1995) *Outcomes, Learning and the Curriculum: implications for NVQs, GNVQs and other qualifications* London: Falmer Press

Carr, D., (1993) Questions of Competence, *British Journal of Educational Studies* 21 (3) pp253-271

Child, B., (1996) ' National Vocational Qualifications: is policy supporting the principles of lifelong learning?' *Research in Post Compulsory Education*, 1. (2) pp237 - 251

Chown, A., and Last, J., (1993) Can the NCVQ Model Be Used for Teacher Training? *Journal of Further and Higher Education*, 17 (2) pp15-26

Committee of Vice Chancellors and Principals (1997) A Strategy for Vocational Higher Education, *Competence and Assessment* No29 pp10-26

Dearing, R., (1997) (Chair) , National Committee of Inquiry into Higher Education (1997) *Higher Education in the learning society: Report of the national committee* , Norwich: HMSO

Ecclestone, K., (1996) The Reflective Practitioner: Mantra or a Model for Emancipation? *Studies in the Education of Adults*, 28 (2) pp146-161

Ecclestone, K., (1997) Energising or Enervating: implications of National Vocational Qualifications in professional development, *Journal of Vocational Education and Training*, 49, (1) pp65 -79

Edwards, R., and Usher, R., (1994) Disciplining the Subject: the power of competence, *Studies in the Education of Adults*, 27 (1) pp1-14

Eraut, M., (1994) *Developing Professional Knowledge and Competence* London: Falmer Press

Fuller, A., (1994) New Approaches to Management Development: Perceptions of Use and Exchange *The Journal of Management Development* 13 (1) pp23 - 34

Fuller, A., (1995) Purpose, Value and Competence: contextualising competence based assessment in the civil aviation sector *British Journal of Education and Work*, 8 (2) pp60 - 77

Garland, P., (1995) Living with competence: certificate in education programmes and the inclusion of national standards, *SCUTREA Conference Papers*, University of Manchester, pp63-68

Gipps, C., (1993) Policy-Making and the use and misuse of evidence, *British Educational Research Journal*, 19 pp 31-41

Gokulsing, M., Ainley, P., and Tysome, T., (1996) *Beyond Competence*, Aldershot: Avebury

Gonczi, A., (1994) Competency based assessment in the professions in Australia, *Assessment in Education* 1 (1)

Higher Education Quality Council (1995) *Vocational Qualifications and Standards in Focus London:* HEQC

Higher Levels Strategy Group (1995) *Higher Level Vocational Qualifications: A Government Position Paper*, HMSO

Hodgkinson, P., and Issit, M (1995) (Eds) *The Challenge of Competence: professionalism through vocational education and training* London: Cassell

Hyland, T., (1993)Professional Development and Competence-Based Education, *Educational Studies*, 19 (1) pp123-131

Hyland, T., (1994) *Competence, Education and NVQs: dissenting perspectives*. Cassell: London

Hyland, T., (1996) (a) Access, credit and the learning society *Journal of Access Studies* 11 pp153-164

Hyland, T., (1996) (b)National vocational Qualifications, Skills Training and Employers' Needs: Beyond Beaumont and Dearing, Journal of vocational Education and Training, 48 (4) pp349-365

Hyland, T., (1998) De-Professionalising Teaching: putting ethics back into post-school education *Adults Learning*, 9 (5) pp9-12

Jessup, G., (1991) *Outcomes: NVQs and the emerging model of education and training* London: Falmer Press

Lindley, P.A., (1996) Continuing Professional Development in The British Psychological Society: The differing needs of the professional and the professional body in D. Bartram (1996) *op cit*

Little, A., (1997) The Diploma Disease twenty years on: an introduction *Assessment in Education* 4 (1) pp5-21

Malcolm, J., (1995) The Competence of Worker Bees: the implications of competence based education for educators of adults, in M. Collins (Ed) *Educating the Adult Educator: the role of the university* Saskatchewan: University of Saskatchewan

Marshall, K.S., (1994) NVQs *International Journal of Lifelong Learning*, 13 pp43-49

McAleavy, G., and McCrystal, P., (1995) Managing the implementation of a Collaborative Competence Based Teacher Education Course in Further Education, *Journal of Further and Higher Education*, 19 (1) pp84-93

Morgan, A., (1997) National Vocational Qualifications in a Business Studies Degree *Journal of Vocational Education and Training*, 49 (2) pp181-195

National Committee of Inquiry into Higher Education (1997) *Higher Education in the learning society: Report of the national committee* , Norwich: HMSO

National Council for Vocational Qualifications, (1997)a *Assessment of NVQs and SVQs*, London: NCVQ\SCOTVEC

National Council for Vocational Qualifications (1997)b *The Common Accord*, London: NCVQ

Norris, N., (1991) The trouble with competence, *Cambridge Journal of Education*, 21, pp331-341

Randall, J., (1997) National Vocational Qualifications in Higher Education - A possible model *Competence and Assessment* No 29 pp10 - 14

Rivis, V., (1996) Setting the standards: implications for higher education of the introduction of occupational standards for advice, guidance and counselling *British Journal of Guidance and Counselling*, 24 (1) pp53-66

Schon, D., (1983) *The Reflective Practitioner*, London: Basic Books

Schon, D., (1987) *Educating the Reflective Practitioner: Towards a new design for teaching and learning in the professions*, San Francisco: Jossey Bass

Seagraves, L., Kemp, I.J. and Osborne, J. (1996) Are academic outcomes of higher education provision relevant to and deliverable in the workplace setting? *Higher Education*, 32 (2) pp157 -176

Taylor, M., (1996) Accessing Higher Educational Awards through National Vocational Qualifications in Management, *Journal of Vocational Education and Training*, 48 (3) pp295-309

Tight, M., (1995) Education, work and adult life: a literature review *Research Papers in Education* 10 (3)pp383-400

Tomlinson, P. (1995) Can Competence Profiling Work for Effective Teacher Preparation? Part 1: general issues *Oxford Review of Education*, 21 (2) pp179 -195

Universities' and Colleges' Staff Development Agency (1995) *Feasibility Study the Application of Vocational Qualifications to Staff Development in Higher Education*, Sheffield: UCoSDA

Winter, R., and Maisch, M., (1996) *Professional Competence and Higher Education: The ASSET Programme* London: Falmer

Wolf, A., (1995) *Competence Based Assessment*, Buckingham: Open University Press

Mirror images: reflective practice in the training of adult educators

Cheryl Hunt, University of Sheffield, UK

Introduction

Five years ago, I thought I knew what reflective practice was. I introduced a module to encourage such work into several courses for mid-career professionals. One of its objectives was that participants should be able to re-view and critique their own educational practice in the light of academic theory, and *vice versa*. Since then I have struggled, with students and colleagues alike, to determine how best to facilitate and assess this - and, indeed, how, exactly, to define and 'do' reflective practice in various settings. Inevitably, perhaps, engagement with my own and others' reflective practice 'for real' has proved to be more complex than I originally envisaged. I no longer claim to know exactly what reflective practice is but I now have a better understanding of what it does!

I suspect that, by its very nature, reflective practice can only be understood properly through direct experience. There is, nevertheless, a vast array of literature on the subject of reflection and reflective processes. I will begin by drawing attention to some of this in order to provide a framework for the rest of the paper which focuses on the development of a module entitled *Becoming a Reflective Practitioner*; how this has been perceived by students who are themselves adult educators and trainers; and what issues it has raised for tutors who facilitate this module as part of a Masters degree.

What is a reflective practitioner?

The notion of 'the reflective practitioner' was popularised by Donald Schon. He wrote his seminal text on the subject because he wanted professionals to recognise the importance of being able to articulate what it is they do. At the root of Schon's work is an attempt to develop an 'inquiry into the epistemology of practice' which asks questions like:

> What is the kind of knowing in which competent practitioners engage? How is professional knowing like and unlike the kinds of knowledge presented in academic textbooks, scientific papers, and learned journals? (Schon 1983: *viii*).

It is based on the view that the development of a taken-for-granted 'theory of action' in professional practice is an inevitable consequence of the impossibility of developing a new response to every new situation by working through from first principles but that, when asked to articulate their practice, professionals generally do so in terms of 'espoused theories' - the text-book theories they were taught during their initial professional training. In other words, they fail to address the underlying assumptions they have learned through experience - what, in earlier collaborative work, Argyris and Schon (1974: 8) referred to as 'theories-in-use'.

Put simply, a reflective practitioner is someone who actively seeks to uncover and work with such assumptions in order to enhance her/his professional practice. The purpose of this paper is not so much to contribute to theory about what 'kind of knowing' is thus created as to stimulate debate about how this uncovering process can be safely facilitated and contained.

The concept of reflection itself is well-established in academic literature, most notably as a necessary stage in the experiential learning cycle (Kolb 1984; Boud *et al* 1985). It is embedded, too, in the work, contemporary with Schon's, of Mezirow (1981) on perspective transformation and of Boyd and Fales (1983) on reflective learning. The latter is defined as:

> ... the process of internally examining and exploring an issue of concern, triggered by an experience, which creates and clarifies meaning in terms of self, and which results in a changed conceptual perspective (Boyd and Fales *op.cit.*: 100).

I find this a useful description of the process that I believe should underpin reflective practice; it also foreshadows the conclusion reached by Atkins and Murphy (1993: 1191) in their review of much of the literature on reflection that 'involvement of self' in the reflective process and the acquisition of a changed perspective are the 'crucial aspects which distinguish reflection from analysis'.

In attempting to facilitate and assess the reflective practice of fellow adult educators and trainers within an academic setting, it is certainly for these 'crucial aspects' that I now look. However, I also recognise the point, which Brookfield (1995: 215-217) argues forcibly, that if it is properly to enhance professional practice, reflection needs to move beyond personal understanding and change and into the wider world of, at least, the educator's own institution/organisation.

Individuals and organisations

There is a fine line between the concepts of reflective practice and organisational learning and change. Although I try to keep it clearly in view there are pressures on both sides of the line which often make this difficult.

As Bright (1996: 163) points out, many professional groups have now adopted the notion of reflective practice as a key element of their training programmes but this may represent merely a 'superficial and token acceptance' of its value rather than a 'genuine and committed awareness of what it involves and a serious attempt to implement its principles fully'. In consequence, while mission statements and policy documents may proclaim the importance of reflective practice, little time or encouragement may be given within an organisation to support it.

This poses a problem for me in working with those who teach/train in such organisations. They are usually very familiar with the rhetoric of reflective practice and may well be charged with facilitating it, often *via* a competency route requiring the completion of checklists and rigidly-defined tasks. Such familiarity can breed contempt, or at least indifference, making it difficult to encourage the tutor-practitioner to take anything other than a reductionist approach to reflective practice. Indeed, attempting to place emphasis on the self and the possibility of a changed personal perspective in this framework can sometimes be more difficult than to introduce such notions into organisational contexts where reflective practice is unfamiliar. In the first case a sense of 'Oh, we do that already' can be stultifying; in the second, a complete lack of comprehension by employers and peers can be inhibiting.

In either case, there seem to be a couple of key questions: should a practitioner be encouraged to undertake the kind of 'work on the self' which can lead to a changed personal perspective if the organisational perspective in which s/he is employed seems fairly rigidly fixed?; and, as a facilitator, what are my responsibilities if I encourage someone to turn the light of enquiry onto issues which may be deeply embedded in a personal belief system that s/he has not hitherto explored? The logical outcomes of pursuing either of these tracks to their limits could be departure from an organisation, or therapy (see Hunt 1998, for further discussion).

I will say more in a moment about the ethical minefield that seems to exist around the facilitation of others' reflective practice. First, it may be helpful if I describe the background

to, and practical parameters of, my own work as a facilitator of reflective practice within Masters degree programmes.

Becoming a Reflective Practitioner

Rationale for the module

Currently, the Reflective Practitioner module is part of five different Masters degrees. I began to develop it with a small group of colleagues in 1993 having been recently appointed as Director of an MEd in Continuing Education. This course had been in operation for more than fourteen years, primarily in a part-time day-release format, but had just been made available through text-based distance learning materials. (Soon afterwards, the decision was taken to offer it *only via* distance learning: approximately sixty distance learning students are currently registered.)

A key espoused value of the course has always been to encourage students to link theory and practice. Originally, much of this was done through the medium of weekly seminar sessions which drew extensively on students' own experiences as both educators and learners. Assessment was entirely by coursework: usually written assignments based on discussions which had taken place during the term, enhanced by students' further independent exploration of the relevant academic literature.

With the advent of the distance learning format, I wanted to establish a process that would have the same effect as the weekly meetings in encouraging students to bring their own experiences to the foreground, explore them in the light of academic theory, and critique each in the light of the other. I also wanted to create a mechanism with which to reward this linking process. To some extent this was included within the existing marking criteria for each assignment - but it could too easily become occluded by the other criteria, especially where a student's writing style and/or grasp of theoretical issues was particularly good. The decision to award ten credits for successful engagement in reflective practice was made with these factors in mind.

Design and development

Initially, I envisaged a module which would operate on the same principles as the forty-credit dissertation undertaken in the final two terms. Students receive a small *Handbook* containing guidelines for working on a dissertation - but the mainstay of their support is a designated supervisor to whom they can turn for advice and on-going feedback. Each student can expect approximately ten hours of tutor time during this period and also attends two day-schools in Sheffield.

The reflective practice module was designed to run throughout the taught part of the MEd which precedes the dissertation (*i.e.* the first four terms). Students were assigned to small groups of eight with a designated personal tutor from whom they might each expect approximately two hours supervision per term. To provide a common framework for reflective practice, we devised a four-stage process based on 'critical incident technique' (Flanagan 1954) which required students to select one 'practitioner incident' on which to work each term (four in all - though this has since been reduced). The process encompasses description, analysis, illuminating the incident through literature, and thoughts for the future. The written accounts of the first three incidents were to be 'rough' and sent to tutors for formative comment. The fourth was to be 'polished' as a final submission which could also be read by other tutors/examiners, and accompanied by an overview of the learning points students had extracted from reflecting on their four incidents.

We used the term 'practitioner incident' to try to get away from the idea that a crisis is a necessary preliminary to reflection. Students subsequently said they would have had no

problem in identifying enough crises in their working lives! Nevertheless, although crises often do prove to be a trigger for reflection (or, more often perhaps, if not handled effectively, for dysfunctional circling thoughts and mental recriminations), we also wanted to encourage reflection on events which had gone well, or even those which had left students feeling slightly puzzled and wondering, 'What was really going on there?'

This question is one which we have since frequently asked ourselves as tutors. Indeed, questions about what we had become engaged in began to surface even before the first week in October when we hoped to introduce the module. Initial discussions about the development of the module had taken place in May; by June we had worked out the procedures for the practitioner incident and assessment - but we had also begun to wonder whether more explanation would be needed about different processes of reflection, the conceptual base of reflective practice, and the kinds of ethical questions the practice raises.

In July, with only two months in which to accomplish our task, we decided that the brief set of guidelines - which we had originally thought would be enough to launch students into the accredited process of reflective practice - would be inadequate. We were now committed to producing a full set of materials which would be similar to our other text-based distance learning modules. From thinking *about* reflective practice and its part in an academic programme, we had become actively *involved in* reflective practice ourselves and this was already influencing our future practice, with grave implications for our time.

Involvement in reflective practice continues to be an integral part of our work as tutors on the various Masters programmes: we meet regularly as a reflective group (Hunt *et al* 1994) and written materials contained in the module are updated annually in the light of our discussions and student evaluation of the module. Ironically, the more actively we attempt to articulate our own practice so that both it, and our expectations of them, are made transparent to our students, the less time there seems to be left for our own unhurried, individual reflections. Nevertheless, I cannot now envisage how it would be possible for someone to facilitate reflective practice for others without also being involved in it her/himself: to be able to hold up a mirror successfully for someone else, it is necessary to know first how the effects of angles, light and movement affect one's own image!

Unfortunately, the process of acquiring such knowledge is not always easy, nor is the image one sees always flattering. In seriously engaging with the process I have found it necessary to review and clearly articulate my own practice in a way which has challenged some of the more comfortable 'taken-for-granteds' of my professional practice and personal self-image. When evaluating the module, many students have made similar observations about the personal as well as the professional development to which it has given rise: acquiring a greater ability to live with uncertainty and change is often presented as an indicator of this. In identifying key 'competences' they feel have emerged from their work on the module, students have referred, for example, to:

- 'An open mind, flexibility, confidence to ask advice - admit you were wrong.'
- 'The courage to look more closely at me and my role/influence in events.'
- 'The ability to live with (and encourage) uncertainty and the anxiety this can create in the short run in a world where being one who **knows** seems so important.'
  (May 1997, student evaluation)

As I tilt the mirror for my students, I have to be constantly aware of the potential 'uncertainty and anxiety' this may cause them in a professional world which is often already full of both. For me, the most problematic factor is that, at what I would now call its best, reflective

practice can cause practitioners to engage with professional issues not just intellectually but at every level of their being: to engage in a deeply personal way in which knowledge derived from the emotions and the physical body is as important a part of the data to be worked on as that which comes from the purely cognitive domain (see Hunt 1997, for an example of such knowledge in action).

Assessment and evaluation

Assessment for the module continues to be based on a final, written, assignment consisting of one polished practitioner incident and a critical commentary on learning points derived from work throughout the module. No grades are involved: the assignment is deemed to be either of a pass standard or 'not yet complete'. When asked about this as part of the final evaluation of the module students have so far been in full agreement with this form of assessment, occasionally adding their own riders like 'I think this kind of material is impossible to grade - it can be very personal and it might be difficult to accept a grade for what your own thoughts/ feelings were in a particular situation'.

How to assess, even in such a minimal fashion, an assignment which draws so heavily on personal thoughts and feelings is something with which tutors continually struggle. We constantly try to clarify what we ask students to do, and what we then do ourselves. The guidelines to students for structuring incidents have been made explicit from the outset. We have subsequently added further written information: an account of our rationale for introducing the structure (since an imposed structure might in itself be regarded as inappropriate when students are dealing with such personal material); and a summary of the lengthy tutor group discussions, which took place after the first pilot run of the module, on what we should be looking for in the critical commentary.

In giving feedback on rough incidents we try to tilt the mirror to enable students to see themselves and their practice from as many different angles as possible - ours, their employers', colleagues' and students', and in the context of appropriate academic literature. We then expect to see something of these additional perspectives captured in the final assignment. Wherever possible our emphasis is on the positive - on celebrating what is good and encouraging development and change where this seems desirable. Finding the proper locus of problems is also important: too often professionals seem to regard themselves as personally responsible for managerial/organisational difficulties.

It is not an easy task to move from the role of critical friend, which we try to adopt throughout the course, to that of final assessor with all that that implies within the formal structure of a university and its requirements to uphold standards, assure quality and so on. However, I suspect that this role-switch may be much more of a concern to us as tutors than it is to our students. It is not a topic that has aroused much comment in the annual evaluation of the module where the majority of students indicate that they regard their tutor as 'an interested party offering a different perspective'; with a liberal sprinkling preferring to label us with our own concept of 'critical friend', or as 'outsider to an internal journey'.

I was much taken with one student's search for a description of the tutor-student relationship during the most recent evaluation. S/he wrote 'I think if there were an intellectual equivalent to the Celtic concept of "anancara" ["soul-friend"] as one who comes a certain distance of a journey but allows you to go the last lap alone it would be the term I'd choose'. I am just not quite sure how the next Teaching Quality Assessment will cope with rating tutors on a soul-friend scale!

On a more serious note, it surprises and humbles me that so many students do seem to allow tutors a glimpse into their very souls, into the deepest levels of their thoughts and feelings.

Not all do, of course, and that is fine: for ten Masters level credits soul-baring is *not* an essential requirement. When it does occur, however, it places an enormous responsibility on the tutor (see Hunt 1997). At a purely pragmatic level it is difficult to know how to allow for the personal struggle with certain issues that we see students go through during the course when their final assessment is based on a single 'polished' assignment (*i.e.* 'sanitised' for a wider readership). We have to be very aware of the boundaries of what we know, how we know it, and what students can and cannot expect of us within our roles as academic tutors.

Conclusion

Five years ago I set out to find a way of encouraging students to make direct links between their own learning, their practice as educators, and the theories which abound in educational literature. I sometimes feel as though a process which once looked fairly straightforward has been about as simple as opening Pandora's Box! In my darker reflective moments I sense that I have unleashed forces that I barely understand and over which I have no control. At other times I find it ironic that we should try to distil such forces into the artificial shapes of assignments, credits and degree programmes. I wonder, too, what the reactions of employers who fund the studies of some of our students would be to some of the issues and potential outcomes they consider. I take comfort, however, from the overwhelmingly positive feedback from students about their experience of the *Becoming a Reflective Practitioner* module. I will leave you with some of their comments.

Asked about the process of reflecting through writing which the course encourages, students' reactions included:

- 'It was useful but I hated it.'
- 'It was useful. It captured the image on screen so I could view it again, mull it over and re-write it with new insights.'
- 'Although I was cynical to start with the practice helped in looking at the incident in a systematic and thoughtful way and uncovered many facets which I was unaware of.'
- 'It was very disciplined. In some ways that helped as I'm inclined to be rather unfocussed, at times though it was restricting - I was experiencing more ideas/images than I could express coherently, sometimes I lost thoughts while trying to explain them.'

(March 1998, student evaluation)

The following comments (reproduced with permission) about both the reflective writing process and how this had helped her professionally were included by a lecturer-practitioner in General Practice medicine in her critical commentary:

> It has been very different to write down and return to issues. This has made them more personal to me than when they are shared more or less spontaneously in a group. It is possible to reflect more deeply on an issue, and on its implications for me as a practitioner, than I have done through pondering it alone or with peers. I also have an "audit trail" of writing and rewriting, which enables me not to lose sight of how I first thought of an incident, and it has been remarkable to be able to see how differently I've come to understand "what was really going on for me" and also for others in the situation.
>
> Over the last year I feel I have become more clearly a teacher as well as a doctor, and I think that change has been due to reflection on processes I had previously taken for granted. I can now see what the role of "teacher" means

> to me, and I can assume and maintain this role with far greater ease than ever before. I can do the work better since I can see clearly my responsibility to maintain the boundaries. There are also useful similarities and differences between my two roles of doctor and teacher, and I have found it helpful to have the two clearly in view.

For myself, I may no longer be sure exactly what reflective practice is - but, thanks to the insights students and tutors alike have allowed me into themselves and their work, and the tilting of the mirror they have provided for me, I do now have a better understanding of what it can do. I know exactly what one student meant who, when asked to draw a sketch or supply a metaphor to illustrate reflective practice, wrote:

> I can't draw at all but if I could I would draw a human face with a third eye. This eye sees what the other two do but in addition it sees beyond normal perception - not just "I see" but 'I see why'.

References

Argyris, C. and Schon, D. A. (1974) *Theory in Practice: Increasing Professional Effectiveness*, San Francisco, Jossey-Bass.

Atkins, S. and Murphy, K. (1993) 'Reflection: a review of the literature', *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, 18, 1188-1192.

Boud, D., Keogh, R. and Walker, D. (eds) (1985) *Reflection: Turning Experience into Learning*, London, Kogan Page.

Boyd, E. M. and Fales, A.. (1983) 'Reflective Learning: Key to Learning from Experience', *Journal of Humanistic Psychology*, 23 (2), 99-117.

Bright, B. (1996) 'Reflecting on "Reflective Practice"', *Studies in the Education of Adults*, 28 (2), 162-184.

Brookfield, S. D. (1995) *Becoming a Critically Reflective Teacher*, San Francisco, Jossey-Bass.

Flanagan, J. (1954) 'The critical incident technique', *Psychological Bulletin*, 51, 327-358.

Hunt, C., Edwards, C., McKay, A. and Taylor, W. (1994) 'The dance of the tumbleweed: reflections on establishing a reflective practice tutor group' in Armstrong, P., Bright, B. and Zukas, M. (eds) *Reflecting on Changing Practices, Contexts and Identities, Papers from the 24th Annual Conference*, Standing Conference on University Teaching and Research in the Education of Adults (SCUTREA), University of Hull, 53-55.

Hunt, C. (1997) 'Shadows in the swamp: dialogues in reflective practice' in Armstrong, P., Miller, N. and Zukas, M. (eds) *Crossing borders, breaking boundaries: research in the education of adults, Papers from the 27th (International) Annual Conference*, Standing Conference on University Teaching and Research in the Education of Adults (SCUTREA), University of London., 235-239.

Hunt, C. (1998) 'Learning from Lerner: reflections on facilitating reflective practice', *Journal of Further and Higher Education*, 22 (1) 25-31.

Kolb, D. (1984) *Experiential Learning*, Englewood Cliffs New Jersey, Prentice Hall.

Schon, D. A. (1983) *The Reflective Practitioner: How Professionals Think in Action*, New York, Basic Books.

Acknowledgements

My thanks are due to all the students and staff who have worked on the *Becoming a Reflective Practitioner* module at the University of Sheffield for tilting mirrors and providing new eyes; and especially to Alison McKay and Hazel Hampton for their *anancara*ship.

When is staff development not staff development? when it's training.

Ann Jackson, East Riding of Yorkshire Council, UK

Context

Adult Education within Local Education Authorities in England is under siege. The past decade has seen mounting financial pressures on local authorities, and non-statutory education has consequently suffered while efforts are made to shore up the statutory sector. Local government reorganisation has in many areas of the country seen large adult education services fragmented, re-structured or dismantled, and the new single-tier authorities struggling to find both direction and cash. Those adult education services which remain are increasingly expected to be financially self-sufficient, and are consequently highly dependent on the Further Education Funding Council, to which they bid as external institutions through local colleges. Their marginalised status is graphically illustrated by this arrangement, which was tacked onto government legislation as an after-thought.

It is, then, as the Office for Standards in Education (OFSTED) noted in a recent report on Adult Education and Youth Work in Local Authorities, a time of 'fragmentation and change' for such services. (OFSTED, 1996, 15). The report goes on to point out that in such times, professional support and development for staff is more, rather than less, important. Nevertheless, the returns to a survey which I carried out during 1995/6 showed that staff development had indeed been a casualty of change and financial pressures in local authority adult education throughout England.

> Never enough funding and always uncertainty about the continuity.
>
> Very little resources are available due to huge cut backs by the LEA.
>
> Budget cuts in recent years have had a major impact on resources for staff development and training.
>
> Basically money is tighter and we have fewer managers/ organisers/ trainers to develop and run staff development opportunities.
>
> I am sorry not to have replied earlier but it has been an extremely stressful year. I regret that I do not have the actual figures you require as changes are constantly happening.

Faced with such pressures, local authority adult education providers are now tending to see staff development more and more in terms of training programmes, which are in the main competence based, and which are linked to Further Education Funding Council (FEFC) funding criteria. Some respondents to the survey saw benefits deriving from this situation:

> FEFC funding for courses is beneficial in some aspects.
>
> FEFC funding is leading to improvements in modularisation of courses.

Certainly, it has led to relatively clearly identifiable progression routes for staff seeking qualifications. It has also meant that Services can meet Quality Assurance criteria to satisfy OFSTED and FEFC requirements. The situation may therefore be organisationally justified,

but what evidence is there that it is meeting the needs of recipients in terms of professional development and support?

This paper reports on a small-scale case-study involving fourteen part-time tutors working for Humberside Adult Education Service, which itself became victim of local government reorganisation in 1996. These tutors belong to the army of 'front liners' (Knowles 1973) on whom so much of adult education in this country depends. As a former part-time tutor who now managed and trained such staff, I recognised that decisions about the staff development and training made available to them are usually reached without reference to the part-time tutors themselves. In an educational sector which extols the value of experiential learning and sees learner development in terms of increasing autonomy, it seemed a contradiction to exclude the voices of the part-time tutors in decisions about their own learning and development. By adopting an action research approach, therefore, the case-study enabled the participants to explore experientially techniques of professional support and development and to evaluate those techniques.

However, to build up a full picture of the part-time tutors' perceptions of the support and development opportunities made available to them, it was also important to listen to their reactions to the training which they experienced external to the case-study. A series of one-to-one interviews was therefore set up between myself and the participants eighteen months into the two and a half year period covered by the study. During these interviews, a series of themes emerged which suggest that there were substantive and qualitative differences between their perceptions of training and of staff development.

Humberside Adult Education Service showed a considerable commitment to supporting part-time tutors on certificated courses leading to teaching and/or training qualifications. From my survey of provision in Local Education Authorities across England it was clear that no other Service which responded provided more support. Programmes available included the initial teacher's certificate accredited by the Yorkshire and Humberside Association for Further and Higher Education (YHAFHE), the City and Guilds 730 series of qualifications for teachers in Adult and/or Further Education, including the competence - based 7306, the City and Guilds 9285 qualification for teachers of Adult Basic Skills, and the Certificate in Education (Cert Ed) and Post Graduate Certificate in Education (PGCE) specifically designed for those who teach in the post - 16 sector. In addition, the Service provided further programmes which led to National Vocational Qualifications (NVQ) based on the Training and Development Standards, such as the Assessor Award, the Internal Verifier Award, and the full RSA 520 suite.
There was also a limited programme of short courses, usually one-off non-accredited sessions, which the Service's staff development officer devised, and which were primarily designed for part-time tutors.

The training and development opportunities referred to so far were available at no cost to part-time tutors in the Adult Education Service. All the programmes were provided in-house, except the Cert Ed./ PGCE. In this instance, the Service bought into a locally franchised scheme validated by the Universities of Huddersfield and later Nottingham Trent. Participants in the case-study made considerable use of the staff development programme, with seven having completed the initial certificate, three having embarked upon or completed the City and Guilds 730 qualification, and three achieving either the Cert Ed. or PGCE. Five took part in the short courses offered during the life of the project.

Methodology:

The one-to-one interviews were set up well into the case-study at a point when a very open and frank relationship had been established within the two case-study groups and in previous interviews which I had held with each participant. The action research approach had encouraged the sharing of problems of practice, both with each other and myself, as had the evolution of the case-study groups into peer support groups. The phenomenological and constructivist rationale underpinning the project recognised the importance of the perceptions of the part-time tutors themselves as to the value of the experiences based within the case-study and also the professional and personal value of the training and staff development they had undertaken external to the project.

A situation had been set up, therefore, in which the part-time tutors were likely to feel able to be honest about their perceptions. However, there is a potential methodological difficulty, in that it could be argued that responses concerning the value of membership of the case-study groups could well be coloured by the part-time tutors wishing to give the 'acceptable' answer to me as interviewer/ researcher/ study participant/ line manager, and therefore may be inappropriately positive. That possible methodological contaminant is minimised by my also having responsibility for designing and/ or delivering much of the Service's teacher training programme. I had thus been directly involved as tutor and/or mentor for six case-study participants when they had taken part in that programme. That involvement did not inhibit the tutors concerned from being very open about difficulties and problems.

We agreed a schedule of open-ended questions which ensured that the same ground was covered during the interviews. However, the tutors were free to expand and digress, and probing from myself helped to follow up issues.

Outcomes

When I embarked upon the research project, I did so with an assumption that staff development was an all-embracing term which included, but went beyond, training. However, these one-to-one interviews in particular showed me that this was not a universally held view.

While all of the case-study participants perceived the activities undertaken as part of the research project as staff development - indeed, the case-study group was consistently referred to as the Staff Development Group, later shortened to SDG, throughout - the same label tended not to be extended to the teacher training they had experienced as part of the Service's staff development programme. One tutor when asked about the staff development he had undertaken did not consider that the initial certificate came into that category at all, but agreed that if the question had specified training, he would have included it. In an exploration of why he should have regarded the case-study experiences as staff development and the initial certificate as training, some interesting differences emerged. As he described his reactions to the two approaches, it became clear that he regarded the initial certificate as a necessary hurdle, with a fairly rigid, externally imposed framework; whereas the case-study group was much more loosely structured, exploratory and self-initiated, and somewhere within this contrast lay the difference for him between the terms 'training' and 'staff development'.

So what were the factors which this tutor and other participants identified as characterising training as opposed to staff development? The first theme which recurred through a number of discussions was perhaps not surprisingly the issue of assessment. Training was seen to be primarily focused on examining and judging teaching competence. Indeed, the word 'exam' was used by a number of tutors to describe their impression of the initial certificate, even though the assessment did not involve a formal examination.

> I think the YHAFHE (Initial Certificate) was more like an exam situation, although there wasn't an exam.

> I think that the YHAFHE was more like an exam, like you'd do an exam course, if you like.

This resulted in participants regarding the teacher training courses in terms of outcome - specifically that of passing or failing - rather than process. There is some recognition of the dilemma here which is highlighted by Baptiste and Brookfield (1997, p26). No matter how democratically such programmes were designed, these part-time tutors knew that the decisions about their competence were embedded in a hierarchical system. This situation is potentially disempowering and creates anxieties about weaknesses which are compounded by a 'disease model' of 'traditional professional development'. (Clark, 1992, p79). It proved particularly daunting to those tutors who were coming into adult teaching from a non-academic background and who had not extended their own formal education beyond the minimum age. They, as well as many of their students, were therefore adult returners, and even the initial certificate was seen as a significant hurdle to overcome.

In addition to the issue of accreditation, there were other structural and operational factors which proved disempowering for participants on the teacher training programmes. Courses were externally designed, and therefore aimed at fulfilling general or organisationally based criteria, rather then responding to individual need. There was usually little evidence of involving participants in negotiation over aims and objectives, or even when these were necessarily pre-determined, of their contributing to decisions about process. This situation accords with that noted by Graham et al:

> There was no suggestion from trainees on any of the courses that they had been involved in the setting of course objectives, or that they had been consulted....It is less easy to understand why trainees were not more involved in course organisation and planning. (Graham, Daines, Sullivan, Harris and Baum, 1982, p157-8)

And a decade later, little seemed to have changed.

> Seldom are teachers involved in decisions about the content and structure of the workshops they have to attend. (Thiessen, 1992, p85).

While not an absolute requirement, undertaking at least the initial teaching certificate was felt to be an obligation by most tutors, and therefore feelings approaching compulsion entered the situation.

> ...the YHAFHE was a course that you felt you had to do.

The negative impact of coercion was described by a number of participants, and the irony is not lost on Irwin Jahns:

> The compulsory nature of training....contradicts the central premise of adult education as a voluntary enterprise. (Jahns, 1981, p95).

Further barriers which these part-time tutors struggled with on the teacher training courses were the written work requirements, and the specialised language. Clearly, sometimes these two factors were linked, and both had the power to compound feelings of inferiority which

some tutors, especially those from a practical rather than academic background, tended to experience.

> ...there was a lot of work involved, writing, paperwork. I mean, I spent hours, literally hours and hours writing on the YHAFHE. And I mean I used to sit up sometimes till, you know, one and two o'clock in the morning just writing and scribbling and I just... I don't like that sort of thing. It's not my... I mean, some people love it, don't they? But that's not my thing.
>
> You know, when you try to tell somebody that this is NVQ-speak, where do you go from there?

The experience of training so far described would appear to be focused on organisational needs rather than individual needs, and Jahns confirms this view when he notes that:

> Training is one of several social control mechanisms in an organisation. One of its primary functions is to socialise individuals into the organisation and to help them develop appropriate expectations for role performance in their specific positions. (Jahns, 1981, p103)

However, it is important to recognise that the case-study participants identified much that was of value to them in the teacher training courses they attended. They acquired practical teaching skills, such as course and lesson planning, something acknowledged also by the respondents to the Graham et al survey.

They also valued the collegial support which they received from their peers in the training groups, and the importance of this contact and the consequent lessening of the isolation which part-time tutors so frequently report is similarly stressed in the Graham et al. survey (1982, p64). However, a further drawback to training courses is the fact that they are time-limited, and therefore the peer support which they have provided is suddenly taken away. In a particularly moving account of an experience of this kind, one of the case-study participants referred to the day she graduated as a mature student as one of the worst days of her life.

> Because I think when I'd done all that education, got my degree, one of the worst moments of my life was graduating, because I lost all my friends, five years' worth. And although I'd started to teach by then, and got a few friends, I was totally lost. Missed a year. Did the PGCE (Post Graduate Certificate in Education). Loads of people, loads of friends, loads of support, two years, gone. And when you've had such a lot of support from the colleagues that actually went there.... you flounder a little bit. You get lost slightly. And you go along, teaching, because that's all your training and everything's up and going. I just felt, I just needed some support from everybody else.

And the need for professional support and development to be on-going, rather than the stop-go experience of training programmes, is endorsed by Grabowski.

> Finally, continuing education in the professions must be a continuous process. Occasional doses of information or occasional learning experiences do not usually result in meaningful and lasting learning. (Grabowski, 1981, p92).

The progression route provided by the teacher training programmes was welcomed by some tutors as a way of evidencing their increasing professionalism, and was similarly valued by the Service. Nevertheless, the participants in the case-study clearly did not regard training courses as meeting all their professional development needs, and in some respects the research project addressed those needs. It was a voluntary undertaking which took place over an extended time-scale. The part-time tutors themselves were involved in the decision making about the support and development which they engaged in. Practical considerations such as venue and timing of meetings all took into account the personal circumstances of participants. The fact that the issue of accreditation was not raised until the very end of the study meant that the groups had the time to evolve a supportive yet challenging culture which encouraged the sharing of problems of practice in an atmosphere of openness and trust.

There is considerable evidence in the literature of the value of peer support and action research as methods of encouraging teacher development, (McNiff, 1988; Lomax 1995). Both approaches are seen to focus on the actual work situations and concerns of the teachers themselves, and there is an acknowledgement that teachers learn most from each other and from teaching itself.

> Teachers learn much from each other. They cite follow teachers as the most valuable source of professional development. (Thiessen, 1992, p94).

Although much of this literature has been generated from educational sectors other than that occupied by the part-time adult education tutor, there are a number of studies which specifically identify the value of peer support to such workers, and in particular the lessening of feelings of marginalisation and isolation through meetings with others who share similar situations. (Graham et al 1982; Allen, 1987; Blamire, 1989; Morgan, 1991; Summers, 1991).

And certainly there is evidence from the current study that the participants appreciated the support, reassurance and ideas which they received from each other. Membership of the groups was the most frequently identified benefit of the project, and contact with other tutors the reason most often quoted for continued involvement in the project. In addition to being the vehicle for the case-study approach, the groups had become an effective method of professional support and development in their own right. Not only were they the bases from which other staff development techniques were devised and subsequently evaluated; they provided the part-time tutors with 'the opportunity to talk to each other about their dilemmas, pains, epistemological tangles and practical confusions in a supportive community'. (Brookfield, 1994 p214). This process encouraged reflection on practice which was itself potentially developmental.

> By reflecting on their own constructs and practices, teachers can enlarge first their awareness and then their capacity to direct it more fruitfully. (Diamond, 1991, p17).

However, the study also highlighted other ways of helping tutors to critically evaluate and to work towards improving their teaching of adults. Peer observation, videoing teaching, shared evaluation and appraisal were all techniques which participants experienced, as were training sessions specifically designed to meet needs which they themselves had identified. All were very practical ways of providing on-going support and stimulating professional development for staff in normally isolated and dispersed working situations.

The tutors in this study did not reject training - far from it. They made considerably more use of the Service's staff development programme than did the majority of tutors. What they

were expressing through participation in the study was that staff development needs to be about more than time-limited, externally devised, accredited training programmes. Development doesn't happen in course-sized chunks, and nor does the need for support.

They were also expressing a need to be heard; for their experiences, needs, hopes and wants to influence the opportunities for support, development and training made available to them. It is therefore appropriate to leave the final word to one of them:

> And of course, you know yourself that if you train for some particular event, when it comes to the end of it, you may be quite glad to stop that training...whereas with education, and learning...it's something which there's no strain about it because you want to keep on doing it. Because it opens more and more doors. Training leads to a goal, doesn't it? Whereas education is the opposite. It starts from one little point and opens thousands of other little doors and connections and networks.
>
> And I think that's the tension which we're all in, that those of us who naturally feel that we're the door openers are being constrained to say, "Yes, open that door, but just go down that tunnel"...There are places for hoops and there are places for, you know, the guide.

References:

Allen C J (1987) *Supporting part-time tutors in Adult Education: The tutors' view*, M.Ed. Dissertation, University of Nottingham.

Baptiste I & Brookfield S (1977) 'Your so-called democracy is hypocritical because you can always fail us': learning and living democratic contradictions in graduate adult education', *Proceedings of the 27th Annual SCUTREA Conference*, London, pp26-30.

Blamire J (1989) 'Supporting and developing adult learning: managing in-service education and training, *Adults Learning*, vol 1, no 2, pp46-48.

Brookfield S (1994) 'Tales from the dark side: a phenomenography of adult critical reflection', *International Journal of Lifelong Education*, vol 13 no 3, pp203-216.

Clark C (1992) 'Teachers as designers in self - directed professional development', in Hargreaves A & Fullan M G (eds) *Understanding Teacher Development*, London, Cassell.

Diamond C T P (1991) *Teacher Education as Transformation*, Open University Press.

Grabowski SM & Associates (1981) *Preparing Educators of Adults*, San Francisco, Jossey Bass.

Graham T B, Danes J, Sullivan T, Harris P, Baum *The Training of part-time Teachers of Adults*, University of Nottingham. (1982)

Hargreaves A & Fullan M G *Understanding Teacher Development*, London, (eds) (1992)Cassell.

Jahns I R (1981) 'Training in organisations', in Grabowski S M & Associates, *Preparing Educators of Adults*, San Francisco, Jossey Bass.

Knowles M (1973) *The Adult Learner: A Neglected Species* Houston, Gulf Publishing Co.

Lomax P (1995) 'Action research for professional practice', *British Journal of In-service Education*, vol 21, no 1, pp49-57.

McNiff J (1988) *Action Research: Principles and Practice*, London, Macmillan.

Morgan M (1991) 'Supporting part-time women tutors', *Adults Learning*, vol 2, no7, pp207-8.

OFSTED (1996) *Adult Education and Youth Work within Local Education Authorities*, London , HMSO.

Summers J (1991) 'Part-time teachers of adults: some professional issues', *Adults Learning*, vol 2, no 5, pp140-141.

Thiessen D (1992) 'Classroom-based teacher development', in Hargreaves A & Fullan M G (eds) *Understanding Teacher Development*, London, Cassell, pp85-109.

The cultural sources of dilemmas in adult educators training in contemporary Poland

Dr Witold Jakubowski, University of Wroclaw, Poland

> The disturbing fact is that the vast majority of people, including educated and otherwise sophisticated people, find the idea of change so threatening that they attempt to deny its existence. Even many people who understand intellectually that change is accelerating, have not internalized that knowledge, do not take this critical social fact into account in planning their own personal lives.
>
> Alvin Toffler *Future Shock*

We, the contemporary people look into our future with awe rather than anxiety. The future depicted in popular fiction and s-f films reflects our very worries of what is ahead of us. This fact should not be neglected if we agree that science fiction expresses the concerns of the mass audience. Film mirrors the psychological state of the society, reflects its awes and worriers. These feelings come from, in a way, the inability to predict what awaits us in the future. 'Life is' - says Antoni Kepinski, the best known Polish psychiatrist - 'the change of unknown future into known past' (Kępiński, 1992). According to Kepinski 'the category of "future" is the essential component of all self-controlling systems, both technologocal and biological'. Future as a specific aim is built into the system; he calls it 'preprogramming'. Thanks to the feedback connection the system is constantly being informed on the realization of the program and, according to the information, can modify the program. The preprogramming is in a way the subjective future of the system, which can never thoroughly fulfill its plan. In order to carry out its plan the system has got to overcome resistance and inertion of the environment, therefore there's always divergence between what has been planned and what is being done. Besides subjective future there is objective future, which is not only a plan , but the reality that *is* happening.

It seems, therefore, that planning is always necessary in our lives and planning the education processes is a necessary element in all economical and political strategies. Reaching goals requires previous planning and stating the time of accomplishment. It is crucial that the difference between subjective future (the plan) and objective future (the realization) should not be too great.

A question may be asked: under what conditions are our efforts to predict the future successful? When can our prognosis prove right? The answers would be a great help in defining the tasks of today's Adult Educators and educational institutions.

To try to solve the problem one should think of general features of the contemporary world. What is the core, the basis of our culture? We may use here the culture typology constructed almost a quarter of century ago by the

famous American anthropologist Margaret Mead (Mead, 1978) . Let us refer shortly to her work.

The criterion of the typology is delivering certain cultural values from generation to generation and the diversity of the environment in which the socialization of the young generation takes place. From this perspective three types of culture can be distinguished: postfigurative, cofigurative and prefigurative.

In the first one the young generation is shaped after the fashion of their parents. The reality in these societies does not change a lot, or changes happen very slowly and therefore they are easy to accept. The upbringing of young generation is carried out to 'transplant the past in the present'. This kind of education can be met with in 'preliterary' or very strict - religiously or morally - societies. Conservatism and inclinations to self-reproduction are very characteristic of such societies, like Amish in the USA or in religious states (e.g. Iran).

Cofigurative cultures are characteristic for industrial societies. Migrations, new technologies and the catastrophes destroying 'the old world order' permit such societies to spring up. The experience of the older generation gained under different conditions is unnecessary or, speaking in today's terms, incompatible with what younger generation encounters in life. Young people have to learn day by day from each other.

The most developed societies, according to Margaret Mead, have just entered the third - prefigurative - stage of their evolution. In prefigurative cultures changes happen so suddenly, rapidly and violently at the same time that the attributes of the older generation like experience, routine lose their meaning, do not ensure the superiority of the elders because knowledge gets old very quickly. Future is no longer predictable as derived from past. One single generations experiences a few revolutionary changes. We see here the reverse of the traditional education - paradoxically, the youth teaches adults.

I have quoted some of Margaret Mead's theses not just to mention this distinguished though not new work, but to state which features of cultures described by the author dominate in today's Poland and what that means for the adult education?

It would not be easy to answer the question unequivocally. The post-war Polish history includes a few turning points which shaped our model of culture.

The first turning point was the political and economical disaster that happened after the World War II. Hitherto existing sociological structure was thoroughly destroyed. Polish society met, for the first time, the cofigurative situation in which everybody had to learn to act differently in a completely diffrent world, so different from what the older generation remembered from the pre-war times. Neverheless afterwards one can notice the reverse process - again the prefigurative self-reproducing structure dominates. Education system in the Polish People's Republic was created to reproduce existing

reality, no matter what it told about progress, development etc. Any changes were controlled by the rulers and no political or even economical rebuilding was possible because it would be incongrouos with ideological axioms.

The next turning point took place in 1989: the first free election and then changes in politics and economy lasting up to now.

Which culture type is most typical as far as contemporary Poland is concerned?

The structure of the society in Poland of the nineties consists of elements typical for all three Mead's models. A kind of conservatism is a feature of rural aereas and small towns. Tradition still means a lot here. Also Catholic Church, still very important in this country, reinforces 'postfigurativeness' in out-of-the-city Poland. However, 'self-reproducing' is noticed to be slowly withdrawing.

Most probably our reality resembles cofigurative culture of post-cataclysm world, but our catastrophe came from the fall of schisophreniac economical system. We all became, as Margaret Mead says, 'emigrees in time'. Not having made a move we found ourselves in the reality of the nineties, with its diffrent economical rules and other, sometimes strange features of the structure of the society.

Even prefigurattive features, characteristic for the culture of quick change, can be found in Poland. We do not isolate ourselves from what is happenning aroud us and, no matter we want it or not, we get involved in diverse technological or economical processes that take place in the world. Analizing the state of today's Europe John Field says: 'European society is changing with dramatic - often alarming - speed. Most obviously, the last two decades have witnessed the collapse of the communist regimes, the deindustrialization of western European economies, the proliferation of uses of new communications technologies (often applied as much to entertainment as business purposes), massive disruption in existing career and occupational structures, intensified movement towards European Union, the revival of old ethnic conflicts at the eastern end of the continent, an uncertain but long overdue peace on the north-western periphery, as well as the destabilisation of many established forms of social behaviour and relations.' (Field, 1995: 187)

Political changes in Poland overlap global changes. Stating that the general civilizational change as predicted in Alvin Toffler's *Third Wave* (Toffler,1997) is now taking place is not obviously a mistake.

The tasks of schools are different in the three types of cultures.

In postfigurative society school delivers information. Its goal is to give the student some knowledge and the abilities allowing them to function safely in a stable, unchanging reality.

In co- and prefigurative societies, where the reality changes quickly and knowledge about the very reality almost immediatly gets out of use, schools should work in completely different ways. Here schools are not the only

source of wisdom, are only one of the elements in the educational system. I think that those who find faults in the contemporary school do it because they reject its postfigurative features. It is still strongly stuck in the first wave. The disfunction of the school is also stressed, which means that it does not help people in their lives, both on the sociological and professional levels or in their self-development.

The school more and more frequently is criticized as an institution giving 'fake' public services (Illich, 1976). Teachers are blamed for doing 'fake' work, or filling in a time cell instead of teaching (Nosal, 1994, 296). On the other hand, teachers are said not to concentrate on education but on carrying out the curriculum elaborated by a ministry (Szulc, 1996: 89).

Critics emphasize the disaccord between bureaucratic fossilization of the education system and the dynamic development in the field of informatic technologies. In Czeslaw Nosal's opinion, being concious of new possibilities in handling the information and its divergence as compared with old curricila and conservative educational institutions prove it necessary to introduce radical changes in the educational system. 'Further cumulation of the divergence must provoke crucial changes of the teacher role (in any schools) and educational standards and lead to establishing new system rules'. The *in statu nascendi* global informatic village would for sure reject that kind of fake public services which additionaly cost much time and money.

New technological perspective and increasingly easier access to any information sharpen the teachers' work estimation criteria. Nowadays, in the world of vast computer technology progress (networks and data bases with easy access to them) teachers working in a traditional way are considered to be cranks giving fake public services.' (Nosal, 1994: 295-296).

Analizing the state of today's school Tadeusz Lewowicki says: 'Our dissatisfaction with the education system is partially connected with people's fear of the future. Some - easily or less easily imaginable - challenges of near and distant future make us seek help in education, in knowledge presented by educational institutions. On the other hand, these institutions' too strong inclination to preserve traditional education standards, addiction to old methods and work forms, too much encyclopaedic knowledge of the past and very little about the present and the way it changes, make us criticize the educational system, make us sure it will not prepare us to cope with future challenges'. (Lewowicki, 1994, 30) The fear of the future described by Lewowicki is stronger even because of the unpredictability of the future.

Unpredictability has become the characteristic feature of the contemporary world, so the diversity between subjective and objective future, or between a plan and its realization, is considered to be quite natural.

The postfigurative culture world where 'children's future is parents' past' is the most predictable one.The answer for *Que sera?* is the easiest to answer. It is easy to plan one's professional career here, to choose appropriate educational path placing one on the right grade in the social hierarchy.

Unfortunately, as it has been already stated, the postfigurative society is coming to an end. Decisions about the education in the next five years may prove very inadequate because in five years reality can change a lot. Polish students of the late eighties have had a very sad experience of this kind. The communist governement used to set 'green light' for diffrent economy branches (the branch changed almost every year) and that made young people choose supported branches when starting studies. Unexpectedly, political changes resulted with what no futurologist could predict - the political reality in which they were to make their careers ceased to exist and the new one required new, different knowledge. The most spectacular example is what happened to the graduates of Agricultural Academies. The curricula there were constructed mostly to meet the State Agricultural Enterprises' needs which were of course liquidated after the fall of communism. In 1989/90 many young people graduated from Agricultural Academies and, after five year studies, they had to seek other jobs elsewhere.

The condition described above implicates different, new education tasks, adult education included in the contemporary world. The different abilities are required of the teachers themselves. In the postfigurative societies the teacher, monopolizing knowledge , was considered first of all an expert in methods and techniques of teaching. Adult educator was expected to purposefully and conciously pass kowledge and did not differ much from children teacher. The Master-Disciple relationship was welcome. The teacher was to make his work maximally schematic or algorythmic while such attitude towards education established teacher's role as a technician 'applicating before-ready and certain definitions of reality'(Malewski, 1996:121). The ideology of dictatorial socialism enhanced such an attitude towards education. The role of the educational system was to adapt education structure to the needs of the socialist economy. The adaptation was of course fake - it was a diplomma that mattered, not real knowledge and abilities.

However, in the cofigurative culture an adult educator, usually of equal age, is a guide rather than a teacher, their task is to show methods and ways of acquiring professional competence, to widen one's knowledge.

C. Nosal writes that in future school the important education goal will be developing higher levels of intelectual competence vital in the creation process: easiness in commmunication and making up one's mind; noticing real social problems. All of it should be guided by the future education organizer (Nosal, 1994: 302-303). I think that the opinion is particularly positive when applied to adult education problem.

In the prefigurative culture, where a generation witnesses at least a few serious changes, an adult educator should be able to become an education organizer. Adults ought to learn how to find information themselves, they should become able to change profession when necessary. It is crucial because professions do age and die as a result of introducing new technologies.

Education students more and more often maintain that teachers do not have to (nowadays they even cannot) be experts in their fields but should become

guides in the huge world of information. It corresponds to M. S. Knowles's definition of an adult educator:

> The adult educator is someone responsible for helping adults in the process of learning. These are adult educator's main tasks: '1.) helping the lerners diagnose their needs for particular learnings within the scope of the given situation (the diagnistic function); 2.) planning with the learners a sequence of experiences that will produce the desired learnings (the planning function); 3.) creating conditions that will cause the learners to want to learn (the motivational function); 4.) selecting the most effective methods and techiques for producing the desired learnings (the methodological function); 5.) providing the human and material resources necessary to produce the desired learnings (the resource function); 6.) helping the learners measure the outcomes of the learning experiences (the evaluative function).
> (Knowles, 1972, 21,22)

After 1989 in Poland many forms of adult education were created, most of them private, independent of the state (in October 1989 in Wroclaw there were 18 state and 25 non-state colleges). Non-state schools were the answer for the necessity of delivering really modern knowledge, which was not included in the conservative curricula of the state school.

It is interesting that objectively great social needs for competent adult educators does not mean students are willing to study andragogics. At Wroclaw University newly modernized curriculum (in use from 1991) after 2,5 year make students choose one of the subbranches: Andragogics, Social Pedagogics, Resocialisation, Guidance.

The andragogics curriculum concentrates on both theoretical and practical problems concerning adult education. The theoretical part consists of general andragogics, social studies methodology, education studies methodology, adult didactits, labour sociology and communication theory. The other branch includes rather methodical or practical subjects: knowledge dissemination methodics, professional advancement methodics, unemployee psychological-educational treatment methodics, advertising technics, basic informatics, assertivity training and organization and management theory elements. Student are also obliged to have some practise in adult education institutions.

During the first years university was not able to complete the andragogics group due to the lack of interest amongst students. Last years uch group was created for the second time, unfortunately only in extra-mural division (for working adult students). The possible explanation may be connected with the fact that young student starting their college associate education with teaching children while adult students understand modern educational practice and easily see andragogics merits.

These difficulties resulted in creating in 1996 at Wroclaw University the Post Master Degree Studies Centre for Managers of Adult Education. The curriculum includes three semesters. The purpose of the Centre is to give students appropriate qualifications in organizing diverse adult educational

forms. The Centre educates first of all staff managers for different business enterprises, adult education organizers and also local and central administration staff. Besides general subjects (adults in modern world, adult education systems abroad) also the curriculum includes lectures and seminars on psychlogy (adult psychology, social influence psychology), didactics (modern adult education techniques and methods), economy (organization and management theory, educational services promoting and advertising, economy and law basis of education) and educational workshops (creating and managing of small task group, assertivity training). The curriculum includes practise in adult education institutions too.

Students are mostly members of personnel in adult secondary schools and in Adult Additional Education Centre. There are also personnel education managers working for bigger firms and enterprises. This paper was written during the second semester only, so more detailed coclusions cannot be yet made.

References

Field J (1995) 'Active Citizenship, Adult Education: Reflection from Poland', in Bron M. And Malewski M. (eds) *Adult Education and Democratic Citizenship*, Wroc³aw: Wydawnictwo Uniwersytetu Wroclawskiego, p.187.

Illich I (1976) 'Spoleczeństwo bez szkoły' ('Deschooling Society'), Warszawa: PIW.

Kêpiński A (1992) 'Lêk', Kraków, pp.14-15.

Knowles M. S (1972) 'The Modern Practice of Adult Education. Andragogy Versus Pedagogy., New York: Association Press, pp.21-22.

Lewowicki T (1994) 'Przemiany oœwiaty', Warszawa, p.30.

Malewski M. (1996), 'Metodologiczne problemy badań nad oœwiat¹ doroslych i nauczaniem doroslych' in Wesoowska E A (ed) *Nauczyciele edukacji doroslych*, Toruń: Adam Marszalek, pp.120-21.

Mead M. (1978) 'Kultura i to¿samoœæ. Studium dystansu miêdzypokoleniowego.' ('Culture and Commitment. A Study of the Generation Gap'), Warszawa: PWN.

Nosal C (1994) 'Ksztalcenie umyslu - na progu edukacyjnej rewolucji', in Brzeziński J and Witkowski L (eds) *Edukacja wobec zmiany spolecznej*, Poznań - Toruń: EDYTOR, pp.295-96.

Szulc B (1996) 'Nauczyciel w procesie ksztа³cenia - ucieczka od gier', in Weso³owska E A (ed) *Nauczyciele edukacji doroslych*, Toruń: Adam Marszalek, p.89.

Toffler A (1971) 'Future Shock', Toronto - New York - London: Bentam Books, pp.20.

Toffler A (1997) 'Trzecia fala' ('The Third Wave'), Warszawa: PIW

Training art tutors for adult education

David J Jones, University of Nottingham, UK

There are large numbers of adult students attending classes in fine art. They attend either history of art classes, art appreciation classes or practical creative art classes. Tutors in these creative art classes are often professional painters and approach the task of teaching by using their own practice as a model to be emulated by the students. As a consequence, students often end up producing paintings which are similar to those produced by the tutor. This reflects the approach of the old atelier system of training where artists learned by following the practice of the master. It means that success is judged on the basis of how closely the paintings of students resemble those of the teacher or, to put it another way, how far the work of students conforms to the aesthetic preferences of the teacher. This paper examines value systems in the arts and proposes that teachers, as part of their training, should be encouraged to adopt values which are educational rather than aesthetic.

Many of the issues which confront teachers of these classes, to a large extent, result from a shift in values which has been characterised as post-modern and which must now inform training courses for tutors. I will begin by looking at the different ways in which people engage with the arts and go on to outline the changes in the way in which we view aesthetic values which have taken place since the war. The implications of these changes for adult educators and their trainers are then discussed

Engaging with the Arts

In adult education, and, indeed, within education and society generally, people engage with the arts in one of three ways; they are either creators, participants or appreciators. I have written about this more fully elsewhere (Jones:1988) and, therefore, it will be sufficient here to give a brief outline of these modes of engagement.

Creative engagement

Those adult education classes which seek to help adults to develop as creative artists require them to become more perceptive; to learn to use materials, media, in a novel and personal way; to develop an ability to become involved in the creative process; and to learn about the nature and distinctive characteristics of the arts.

Participative engagement

Participants in the arts are those people who are not the original creative artist nor merely appreciators; they are the actors and directors, dancers and dance directors, musicians and conductors who stand somewhere between the creator of the work, the playwright, choreographer or the composer, and the audience for the work. They have a crucial central role, which is something less than original creator of the work but something more than audience/appreciator of the work.

Appreciative engagement

For people who wish to learn how to enjoy and appreciate the arts there is a need for them to become more perceptive; to try to perceive artefacts and other cultural expressions in an appropriate manner. I have demonstrated elsewhere (Jones : 1988) that perception itself is culturally determined. What the appreciator must do is to try to view the work of art in a way which resonates with the way in which the creator perceived the work.

Additionally appreciators want to know about the artist, about the social, political and economic context in which the artist lived when the work was created as well as about the life, loves and relationships which influenced the artists life and art.

Changing Values

Within the tradition of adult education in the 20th century, tutors saw it as their role to impose a sort of cultural[1] value system on the artistic life of the country. They identified and maintained a canon of great and good work and persuaded us that every educated gentleman, and it was mainly men in those days, should be familiar with this canon. The job of adult educators in these matters was to pass on this knowledge and these values from one generation to the next. They saw themselves, together with the great national galleries and museums, as the guardians of our cultural heritage.

There was always a certain internationalism about. The study of other cultures was legitimate but it was approached very much in the same way as the study of British culture. It was about what we then called classical art, music and literature. It was to do with identifying, understanding and appreciating the canon of great and good work from these other cultures.

There was a strand in adult education ideology which saw the role of the tutor as making these great works of art accessible to a wider public. The term accessible, which occurs often in the literature on adult education and the arts, did not just refer to the physical act of being able to gain access to see these paintings; it also meant accessible in the sense of understandable. It was felt important that people should not only be able to gain physical access but also be able to understand and appreciate the works which confronted them. Enabling the population at large to do this was seen as one of the roles of adult education, particularly in the universities, which contributed to the liberal tradition in adult education.

It was this tradition which led to the establishment of the Arts Council of Great Britain, described by Shaw (1987:29-30) as follows:

> The historic moment when a British government more fully realised the good influence which aesthetic experience could have on the minds and hearts of the people came early in the Second World War. A group of enthusiasts started a modest programme of arts provision in blitzed and blacked-out Britain and sought to persuade the government that the arts could have a valuable influence on the morale of the people. The government was convinced by their arguments and Britain's first major venture into government subsidy of the arts was soon under way. The people responded enthusiastically as plays, concerts and art exhibitions were organised throughout the country in places where there had been little or no provision, even in peace time. Sybil Thorndike, the great actress, led a tour of *Macbeth* which took in mining villages in Wales. Joan Cross, a leading opera star, led on tour performances of a small scale version of Mozart's *The Marriage of Figaro*, which were seen by thousands of people who had never experienced

---

[1] I use the term culture, primarily, in the way Raymond Williams (1986:11) defines it as referring to the arts of literature, music, painting and sculpture (Fine Art), theatre, film, dance and, increasingly, photography. At times I will also use the word in what Williams (1986:11) calls the anthropological sense which refers to the beliefs and values, indeed the whole way of life of a social group. The context will make it clear in which sense I am using the word. It should be remembered, however, that Williams (1983:87) believes that culture is one of the most complicated words in the English language.

> live opera before - including me. The organisation behind this movement was the oddly named Council for the Encouragement of Music and the Arts - why "music and the arts" as though music was not an art? The body soon became widely known by its initials, CEMA.... All parties agreed that the experiment had been a great success and should be put on a permanent basis after the war.

On 9th August 1946 CEMA became The Arts Council of Great Britain, established by Royal Charter. In February 1947 the Council was granted a new charter in which its objects were laid down as:

a) to develop and improve the knowledge, understanding and practice of the arts;

b) to increase the accessibility of the arts to the public throughout Great Britain;

c) and to advise and co-operate with Departments of Government, local authorities and other bodies on any matters concerned, whether directly or indirectly with the foregoing objects.

The Arts Council joined the other agencies who saw their task as to preserve and celebrate our cultural heritage. Adult education was at the forefront of this movement.

This sort of adult education and promotional work assumes that it is possible to objectively identify the aesthetic merit of a work of art. More and more this notion began to be questioned. The idea that there was one set of universal values was challenged and, eventually, in its place a more relative approach to aesthetic value was proposed.

After the war the priorities gradually changed. In the 1960s art students began to complain about the nature of their specialist education in the Colleges of Art. There were student riots at Guildford and Hornsey Colleges of Art with the college management deploying police and guard dogs to try to quell the unrest.

At the same time, groups of creative people up and down the country began to set up Arts Labs to experiment with new kinds of artistic production. There was a great surge of creative activity which led London to be characterised as the centre of the swinging sixties.

Another important development at this time was the founding by Richard Hoggart, who had been a contemporary of Roy Shaw when they were both extra-mural tutors in Yorkshire, of the Centre for Contemporary Cultural Studies at the University of Birmingham. Hoggart (1992:77) describes his response to the Vice-Chancellor's invitation to accept a chair in English Literature at Birmingham as follows;

> ...Finally, and as to the post-graduate side of the job, I said I would not be greatly interested in gathering the usual disparate group of graduate students. I would like to set up a post-graduate centre in what I described as contemporary cultural studies.

Hoggart is a great believer in the canon and it is hard to think that he intentionally moved away from the university's traditional role in maintaining cultural values. However, one of the effects of setting up this institution was to do just this. For the first time a university was inviting students to view the field of literature more broadly, to consider contemporary culture and to explore the value systems which were implicit in contemporary cultural works.

At the same time, throughout the country, there was a move towards the setting up of numerous community arts projects. This was seen very much as challenging the status quo. The argument was that the majority of arts subsidy was being spent on what were known as the high arts and that these arts meant nothing to ordinary people. Community arts practitioners set up arts projects in the slums and housing estates of Britain and invited the people there to develop, and more importantly to value, their own art forms. Their work, like that of many adult educators of the time, was to involve ordinary people in the creation of works of art by for and about themselves.

Alongside this, the members of ethnic minorities in Britain, rate and tax-payers like the rest of us, were demanding their share of the arts subsidy. The staff members of the arts funding organisations felt ill-equipped to deal with these issues, having been schooled, as they were, in mainly European art belonging to what Kelly (1984:88) refers to as the aristocratic or court tradition, the art of a powerful ruling class. This is how he explains it.

> What had happened was that the interests of one group within society, that powerful group which ruled the Empire abroad and the factories and land at home, had come to set the standards of what it meant to be a cultured person. The tastes of this person were connected to what, in a previous era, had been the court arts; and they were located here for a variety of reasons, some of which were to do with education, and some of which were to do with aspirations of a newly ascendant group to legitimise itself socially. The tastes of the working classes, as a class, were largely drawn from what had previously been the folk arts.

Higher education institutions which promoted this form of art did little to equip their graduates to deal with the arts of a multi-cultural society. It was left to adult educators and community artists to take on this task.

Two writers, in particular, challenged this prevailing dogma. Naseem Khan, in 1976, published the book, *The Arts Britain Ignores - The Arts of Ethnic Minorities in Britain*. This book brought to our notice, to many of us for the first time, the rich diversity of art being created and enjoyed by ethnic minority groups within our own country.

Ten years later Kwesi Owusu (1986:45) pointed out how black African art had been ignored by the history books. Worse than this, he accused art historians of appropriating black African art and depositing it in a white European history.

> An idea that sustains much of racist mythology in popular consciousness is the lie that black people have barely made any contribution to the process of world civilisation. In European historiography, this has been maintained by a persistent attribution of African achievement to outside inventors. When Carl Mauch, the German geologist, stumbled over the ruins of Great Zimbabwe in southern Africa, he claimed that he had discovered the legendary land of Ophir from which sandalwood was taken for the temple of King Solomon of Israel.
>
> The case of Egypt is perhaps the most celebrated, for even today few Europeans know that it was an African civilisation. In education and in cultural media generally, Egypt is lifted out of African history and added to Mediterranean or near-Asian history..... If the philosophers of the European renaissance succeeded in establishing Greece and Rome as the original basis of Western Civilisation, they did so by poignantly ignoring the source of much of that wisdom in the land of the African pharaohs.

This reassertion of the cultural values of the ethnic minority groups in Britain was yet another development which challenged the supremacy of the canon. Indeed, what has been outlined above is the gradual move from a position where the cultural scholars of Britain saw cultural values in absolute terms, to a position where values were seen as relative. It gradually became clear that one could no longer sustain a position where one set of cultural values predominated.

The history of art is littered with examples of one style or genre being superseded by another. There are fashions in the arts. No one set of values pertains to all the products of creative endeavour. Evidence like this eventually led to a challenge to the canon. Values had to be seen as relative.

This development in the arts paralleled the development of what we now know as postmodernism. Lyotard (1984) identifies one of the major characteristics of post-modernism as the end of the grand narrative. The developments outlined above have come to be seen as the end of a particular grand narrative which was the overarching meta-theory of aesthetics and cultural development accepted as the history of European art. These grand narratives are to be replaced by local narratives, explanations and cultural value systems which are relative to the communities in which they are found. There is to be no one history of art but many histories; no one value system but many value systems.

This development is reflected in the recognition accorded to both popular and community art. In describing the characteristics of post-modernism, Sallie Westwood (1988:52) describes the situation thus.

> The first and major premise is the breaking down of the barriers constructed between "Art" and popular culture. Secondly, the objective is to deconstruct the barriers between different art forms.

In this ideological context, artists were not seen as special sorts of people, but rather as ordinary people doing their particular job. Creative activity became increasingly seen as a universal potential, available to all. Adult education, in its many forms and through a multitude of providers, was seen as providing access to each individuals creative potential.

Training for Adult Creative Education

How then, are adult educators and their trainers to react to a situation where values are relative, where a television soap opera is accorded the same status as Macbeth and pop music is seen as being on the same level as so-called classical music?

One of the ways in which educators came to terms with this new order was to introduce more creative classes. If artists were made and not born, then surely adult education had a role in teaching ordinary people how to operate as creative artists. Adult education was no longer seen as merely the repository of cultural values but also as the engine which might drive cultural values forward. By offering classes in sculpture and painting, in musical composition and creative writing, educators began to find their place as an agent of cultural development. But this created problems. In a system where values are relative and constantly changing, how does an adult education creative art tutor know if their students work is any good?

Adult educators can contribute to the cultural life of the community in two ways. As has been explained above, they can provide classes which can *reinforce* cultural values by making the canon of what are considered to be great works accessible to a wider public

audience. On the other hand, they can *develop* cultural identities by involving people in creative work and also by re-evaluating cultural norms and the value systems which underpin them. It is part of the role of trainers of adult education tutors to make these choices explicit. Further, trainers need to recognise that some of the conceptual frameworks used in educational planning are not appropriate for tutors teaching creative classes.

These problems, in large part, derive from the pedagogic practice of specifying learning outcomes for a particular course and using these as criteria for assessing student performance. Students will or will not have achieved the specified learning outcomes by the end of the course. It does not matter whether these are specified as learning outcomes or as competencies. Such a conceptual framework cannot easily cope with a learning process which involves continuous development over a long period of time and where excellence is achieved through repetition. One gets better at painting by doing more painting. The aims and objectives of a level two module in fine art could well be identical to the aims and objectives of a level one module. Indeed, it could be argued that the descriptor level is better used to describe the stage of development of the student rather than a spurious characteristic of the module.

Suggestions for a way forward.

What is needed here is nothing less than a reconceptualisation of adult education practice which will inform training courses for those involved in this work. It is beyond the scope of this paper to present detailed plans, indeed, at this stage I have none to offer. What I can do is present some first thoughts on the issue.

An alternative way of identifying educational outcomes needs to be developed. The current approaches, rooted in behavioural psychology, are not helpful in certain subject areas. I have quoted examples above from the arts but areas such as health education, sport, counselling and language teaching may encounter similar problems. In all these areas, the educational development of the student is a continuous process. There does not come a point where one can say it is finished, they have learned what they needed to learn. There may come a point where learning becomes autonomous, where the individual no longer needs the help of a teacher, though even this is questionable.

What is needed is a way of identifying the learning that is to take place which does not assume that, having reached a certain point, the task is accomplished. I would like to explore the idea of identifying educational benefit as the basis for planning educational activities.

One can ask the question, what is the expected educational benefit of this course?. This leads us into a position of relative values. It becomes possible to say that a student will become more proficient, more able, fitter, more perceptive than they otherwise would have been. The idea is to move away from absolutes, competencies, observable learning outcomes, to a position where one can say that a student is better at doing something than they were previously. Whether or not it is possible to quantify how much better they are is again questionable.

The idea of educational benefit can also encompass more traditional forms of learning outcome. It does not preclude a teacher from saying that the educational benefit will be that they have learned certain facts or computational processes, developed certain attitudes or demonstrated abilities in terms of particular psycho-motor skills. What this terminology does is make it easier for the teacher to identify process as an acceptable learning activity.

These proposals represent first thoughts on the development of a new scheme. It is necessary to explore the idea further and begin to look for modes of evaluation and assessment which

could, for instance, articulate with CATS and APEL procedures. It becomes necessary for trainers and teachers to develop ways of recognising development which are more useful than the reductionist approach of identifying everything in terms of competencies. A student teacher needs to ask the question what evidence do I need in order to decide that progress is being made?

What is being suggested here is that the focus of evaluation moves away from a fairly subjective aesthetic judgement about the work produced by the student to a more rigorous collection of evidence of development. Evidence for making any assessment can come from three sources. It can come from looking at what students produce; it can come from watching them work; and it can come in the form of verbal evidence, either written or spoken in interview or discussion. What the teacher must do is decide which forms of evidence are appropriate for deciding if students are developing.

Structures for the organisation and accreditation of courses will need to be more flexible. It may be that it is impossible to develop a structure which is adequate for all subject areas. We may need several different schemes. Consideration needs to be given to the ways in which we attach credit to a particular educational activity.

If these ideas are carried forward, then it should become possible for adult education to become more fully involved in cultural development. Institutions will be able to recognise the different cultural values which derive from different contexts. The system of organising and accrediting courses will be seen as dynamic rather than static; it will be flexible rather than rigid and it will allow adult educators to provide for the cultural education of adults in a way which is more consonant with the demands of a post-modern world.

References

Hoggart, Richard,1992, *An Imagined Life, (Life and Times, Volume III: 1959-91)*, Chatto and Windus, London.

Jones, D. J., 1988, *Adult Education and Cultural Development*, Routledge, London and New York.

Kelly, T., 1970, *A History of Adult Education in Great Britain*, Liverpool University Press, Liverpool.

Kelly, O., 1984, *Community, Art, and the State: Storming the Citadels*, Comedia Publishing Group, London.

Khan, Naseem,1976, *The Arts Britain Ignores - The Arts of Ethnic Minorities* in Britain, The Community Relations Commission, London.

Lyotard, J. F., 1984, *The Post-modern Conditions: a Report on Knowledge* University of Minnesota Press, Minnesota.

Owusu, Kwesi,1986, *The Struggle for Black Arts in Britain - What can we consider better than freedom.*, Comedia, London.

Redcliffe-Maud, Lord, 1976, *Support for the Arts in England and Wales*, Calouste Gulbenkian Foundation, London.

Segall, M.H., Campbell, D.T. and Herskovitch, M.J., 1966, *The Influence of Culture on Visual Perception*, Bobbs Merrill, Indianapolis, New York, Kansas city.

Shaw, Roy, 1987, *The Arts and the People*, Jonathan Cape, London.

Westwood, S., 1988, *Constructing the Future: A post-modern agenda for adult education* in Westwood, S. and Thomas, J.E., (Eds.)*The Politics of Adult Education*, National Institute of Adult Continuing Education, Leicester.

Williams, R., 1983, *Keywords*, Fontana, London

Williams, R., 1986, *Culture*, Fontana, London

Adult educators for voluntary groups in the Polish transformation period

Ewa Kurantowicz, University of Wroclaw, Poland

Introduction

In the times of sudden changes in society, culture and politics the education of individuals and social groups is being done in the street". This means, that the emancipation of the society usually begins outside of official structures, programmes and educational institutions. When the great change" in the society is established to some extent, then the educational institutions start to involve into this process of establishment. This is where the Polish higher schools are now, trying to create new programmes, majors, specialisation for new generation of students. The university staff, who offers new programmes to their students, usually relies on:

- results of researches about the needs of the new labour market (new institutions, places of work, jobs, etc.),
- changes in social reality where new, unknown problems appear (unemployment, the homeless, poverty etc.) and there appear a need to educate new specialists,
- appearing social needs dealing with the new way of education, which are proposed by participants of different educational forms and the students themselves.

The period of social-cultural transformation is very rich in new and unpredictable phenomena, which require different methods of university education. To such fundamental changes, that happened in Polish society, there belong open public sphere. The possibility of public expression of interests and needs typical for different groups and communities and the possibility of free action to realise them, what democratic society enables, have shown very interesting sphere for the researcher of educational problems and for the professional - organiser of educational forms.

The next part of the article concerns with the analysis of social changes in local sphere considering consequences of practical character for adult educators' training for voluntary groups. I think that the basic question for this article is: Do the voluntary groups need professional adult educators, if they exist as a rank-and-file citizen initiative - without any help from the government and representatives of educational institutions?" Will not such interference into the voluntary groups activity destroy their most important feature: the **independence** of local voluntary groups?

Voluntary Groups in the Local Public Sphere and Training of Adult Educators

Where do we come from?

Polish society is burdened with the experience of PRL (Polish People's Republic) period also in the process of creating local public sphere. It might be seemed that the PRL's prohibition of creating open public sphere in centralist society, enables us now to make it from the beginning without any experiences and burdens in that sphere of social life, after 1989. This naive assumption falls down very quickly, when we look at the local public sphere being created after 1989, where the formal barrier (legal) has been abolished by the Polish legislators. It is not enough to guarantee the freedom of association for dynamic development of local public sphere. According to PRL period the number of non-governmental organisations has risen up a lot (The researches done during 1991 and 1992 in Wroclaw show that the number of local groups has doubled; now there exist about 1000 local associations).

However, there are some other barriers (out of legal ones) that influence the quality of created public sphere. I will try to present this problem in a few thesis, because it has a big importance

for training the educators dealing with stimulation and development of local communities.

The basic theoretical assumption for analysis of interactions between microstructures (small groups) and macrostructure (society) is the statement about three levels of social reality (big social systems and social groups; small groups; acting individuals) (Szmatka 1980: 142) and the statement about two levels in the process of communication. This process has a mediating part of small groups in communicating between the individuals and the macrostructure, and vice versa macrostructure with the individuals (Szmatka 1989: 329). The small groups are a kind of a filter" through which the social communication comes.

Next to the presented above social function of small groups, the local voluntary groups also initiate changes in the society and within its own members. This educational role of small social groups, acting in the public social sphere, has been the subject of my researches (Kurantowicz 1995, 1996). What were the reasons that restrained the realisation of these functions during the centralist system? What conscious or educational barriers did we inherit after the former Polish system, that make the quality development of voluntary groups in local public sphere difficult?

1. For the monocentric order based on centralist structure there are essential the following assumptions (Gokowski 1995: 31-40): 'there is one centre of decisions that is directing the behaviour of the community members' and that 'the social life is regulated by central decisions thanks to organisation controlling their obeying' (Ossowski 1967: 173). So the control and decision element of all social behaviours is in 'one centre of authority'. E. Hankiss has described such structure as neofeudal with a vertical character, that may be graphically presented at the up side down bunch of grapes (Hankiss 1986: 107-109). This structure limits the possibility of communication between the people being down the structure, so it limits the possibility of creating local communities, to which local social groups belong.
What is the role of small groups in the monocentric order? First of all they are able, because of the loyalty of their members (gained by realisation affective needs of individuals), to support the broader social system under the condition that microsystems are accepted by the macrosystem. An example of this may be a collective body presented by the authors as the highest form of development of a small group, where the idea of unanimity of microsystem was realised by a syndrome of group thinking" of the collective body. This role of a small group does not fulfil its educational part against macrostructure. The natural need of individual defence of freedom in the collective body causes the vanishing of identification with microsystem, and finally the break-up of monocentric order, if this system does not have enough power to use repressive means and control groups and individuals.

2. From the other hand the monocentric country was the initiator for creating intermediate structures in participating of small groups in social life. But the total control of these groups did not allow for subjective existence of a local group, what is connected with the chance of influencing the social reality. As the sequence of lack of local groups' subjectivity there was a social gap that was discovered during researches done by S. Nowak in the 70's. These researches have shown the social gap between 'the level of original groups and the level of national consciousness'. That meant that the individuals' identification with small groups was present only in private sphere of individuals' life (family, friends) but microsystems (and bigger organisations, associations, labour associations) excluding privacy of respondents, being in public sphere of individuals, were not described - according to Stefan Nowak - as **WE** (Nowak 1979: 155-173; 1980). The communication between macrostructure and microstructures has been disturbed not only because of the lack of voluntary groups involvement in public sphere, but also because of specific syndromes of behaviour of original groups against macrostructures. As the example we may give a theory of 'familiocentrism' or 'amoral familism' that is still influencing

negatively involvement of small groups in public sphere (Tarkowska Tarkowski 1990). The main source of this disturbance was in centralist structure of Polish society during the Nowak's researches and the authorities' policy against citizens' groups. Similar social gaps have been discovered in other societies (Fukuyama 1997).

The authorities' ubiquitousness in monocentric system causes that original groups (family, friends) are concentrated on defence individuals against unfriendly society". They create, widely described in literature, the division onto **WE - THEY**, treating wider social system as the enemy and small family group as the securing system against the society. This, very clear barrier between privacy and publicity of individuals' and original groups' life in monocentric system, has caused development of familiocentric countries, and this caused a dislike and a fear to create horizontal communities in public sphere, when there is such possibility with the change of social order into polycentric.

3. The monocentric order very often used veiled, humanistic" language of propaganda, calling to freedom, justice, citizens' participation etc., but always within frames described by the Centre (Strzelecki 1989). J. Strzelecki analysing language of real socialism in Poland is showing very clearly a language manipulation of symbols (humanistic) to make an impression that only the Centre has monopoly on reliability, effectiveness in postulates realisation, and the good will of the authorities is unquestionable. This language of propaganda has caused that phrases like: citizen, social activity, social activist make people laughing and sometimes even aggressive. That is why in colloquial and scientific language there appear new phrases like: leader, citizen's activity etc. Used by socialist propaganda with difficulty, they enter again to everyday language.

In PRL times educators' training for groups acting in local society and realisation of activisational programmes of the social sphere, also had 'centralist' character. This meant that educators' training concepts were based on the existing social order, i.e. monocentric social order. The sequence of such educators' training was equipping them with knowledge and techniques which facilitate direction of local groups and communities onto realisation of macrostructural aims. The condition of effective educators' work in local groups was the standardisation of educators' role (Malewski 1996: 121). M. Malewski is presenting three groups of methods to get this aim: ideological methods (concept of socialist growing up), so called 'professional' educator's qualifications transferred during the training process (didactic based on a 'banking', transmission concept of training), administrative means of controlling pedagogical process (pedagogical supervision didactic documentation) (Malewski 1996: 120-122).

The next element of educators' training was propagated 'supremacy' of their competencies over competencies of local groups' leaders. This has caused many conflicts, which made communication between educators and leaders impossible. Social activists (leaders of voluntary groups) during PRL, had possibilities to be educated and trained in different educational forms. But this had only one aim: to prepare the leaders 'to help the instructors <educators> in individual educational and cultural institutions to organise and lead the activity' (Aleksander 1996: 187).

In some groups of activists (leaders) this aversion against educators is still present today. The change of looking at the educators by the social activists was possible because of promotion in social practice another role of adult educators. They are not legislators or the only experts any more but are advisors 'facilitators' for groups acting in public sphere. The direct reason of this may be that educators (of higher, secondary and primary schools) themselves are leaders of such new groups (Kurantowicz 1996). This social group is most often engaged in social activity. This is possible because of social-political transformation in Poland (concept of citizens' society) and because of (a bit slower) changes in concept of educating of social life animators.

Where are we?

The polycentric order is a chance for small voluntary groups to influence macrosystem. Mainly because of the reasons, that its existence is based on the following rules: 'group behaviour is a result of influencing different decision centres, individual and group; members of communities are motivated by themselves or by smaller units that are part of analysed community' and 'social balance is gained because of < natural rights > interaction, as a result of individual, not co-ordinated decisions, with respect to some rules of the game (norms of interaction)' (Ossowski 1967: 173-175).

Beside the essential difference between monocentric and polycentric systems - that is existence of many subjects having a possibility to decide and control their own interactions - is the attitude of macrostructure towards public sphere. It (i.e. public sphere) is not possessed by one centre of decision, but is accessible for all social subjects (at least potentially). Microsystems may appear in public sphere, what enables the existence of two direction communication process. The influence of small groups onto macrostructure may be described as a step of introducing the problem for wider social groups (process of 'publishing', promoting the problem) and a step of emancipation in wider social system (initiating of changing process: in the consciousness of non-members; in local structure or authority centres; in the present law system or changes gained by a group in all social spheres, outside a group).

Next to the factor connected with democratisation of social life there is the second one, determining influence of small group onto macrosystems, is a kind of a social status, which is gained by citizens' group in local society. It may be predicted that a high status will enable them to have bigger educational influence on macrostructures. How is the group able to get that status? It seems that mainly by getting a support of majority of local society for realisation its aims, a group strengthens its status in macrostructure and its educational potential.

On the basis of researches I think that now the most important aim for voluntary educational groups is practical experience, and that polycentric order is a chance not a guarantee of development of local communities and citizens' groups. The polycentric order does not exclude adaptation processes, not developing, if the citizens' groups resign from recognising domination systems and from discussion within local communities.

Creators of postmodernism speak about predominant structures, authorities' structures in polycentric order but not those outside - macrostructural - against individuals and groups, as I have been analysing so far. They claim that authority structures (predominant systems) are decentralised 'invisible because its extrovertism: in language, emotions, body constitution, in all kinds of grammar communications (like mass media, popular culture, consumption etc.)' (Szkudlarek 1993: 184). Small groups in polycentric system may, in different ways, express their attitude towards predominant system, e.g. by such behaviour as:

- emulation - aspiration of a group to resemble macrostructure, to get higher status in macrostructure, by using the same norms, aims consistent with 'social expectations' etc. Emulation leads changes but only within the microsystem.
- mimicra - it is also aspiration of small groups to resemble macrostructure but only to 'survive'. Group is not against macrosystems, it 'hides', it wants to be 'invisible'. It stays on the same level of the status. Again the group is being changed, not the macrosystem.

- restrain - these are activities that are against domination but with the use of swapping the meanings, i.e. 'giving the positive meaning to what is considered in predominant culture as negative' (Szkudlarek 1993: 122). Small groups restrain counteract against macrostructure, but still within barriers accepted by macrostructure. The gained status has an antistatus character, because of describing such groups as marginal, wandering ones. Macrostructure

often uses such groups to give itself credibility, that it is constantly being changed. But these changes are evoked by and within macrostructure itself, within accepted by it barriers. As an example there may by counterculture groups which propagated 'style of life different from the whole society'. This has caused an absorption of some counterculture's elements by macrostructure, but only those, accepted by predominant system (macrostructure was especially interested in those elements that could be used on sell-demand market). So small groups using the method of restrain, revolt against macrostructure, do not gain high rank in macrostructure, and so do not have a lot of influence on the society, and (sometimes) only simulated by predominant system.

Is there any chance for small groups to get higher status in predominant system - subordination, that is permanent? Is there any chance to counteract to polycentric order's traps? Postmodernism proposes to accept spheres of 'given' freedom (i.e. won by groups but foreseen for predominant system) for a small group by macrosystem - negative freedom and to make it a starting point for creation positive freedom spheres. Educational project of H. Giroux leads to freedom by the empowerment, affranchisement of positive aspect of freedom, and so to give them educational power by critical questioning of existing social forms, and not only adopting them with the use of methods: emulation, mimicra and restrain.

The status of a small group increases if they have a chance to create 'discursive practices' (questioning, rejecting, unmasking) against predominant system. The place to have such discussions are public spheres and understood as 'concrete system of learning conditions, and so people may gather and talk, get engaged in dialogue, share with their stories - fight together within social relations, which rather strengthen than weaken possibilities of active citizenship' (Szkudlarek 1993: 142). According to Habermas discussion of public sphere groups should be ended with agreement - unanimity worked out, but opened onto a better argument (Grondin 1993). Different position is given by N. Fraser, who claims that most important for social sphere is its distraction, breaking out new and new groups of interest, what, according to the author, should stop domination of one kind problems in social sphere, by excluding the others (Fraser 1992).

How should educators for local communities and groups, having different problems, be trained? The appearing nowadays problems in acting voluntary groups may be a fulfilment of those problems (Kurantowicz 1996) (Glinski, Palska 1997). 'Young democracy' - this term is often used to describe the social-political situation that is now in Poland. This means that the sphere of voluntary groups is still not grown-up form of social activity, but a very expansive one. The voluntary and non-governmental groups, that develop their activity is social sphere, face many problems which may be a starting point for creating university training of adult educators for voluntary groups. These problems have two basic sources. The first one is connected with local and central authority, the other one with the voluntary groups and their members.

- government administration is not prepared to co-operate with citizens' groups and very often does not treat them seriously,
- there is no financial, organisational and institutional support from local and central authorities for groups of citizens,
- dangerous steps of authorities to control public sphere by using from above methods of reformation citizen' activity- (trials to arouse political consciousness in citizens' groups),
- understanding social groups only as demanding ones, which have to be fought and are not to co-operate,
- withholding a realisation of social education at schools, where the concepts of democratic society could be created, and where the background for voluntary groups might be done.
- difficulties of leaders in gaining information about creating and leading a local group,

- lack of skills in promoting own ideas, problems, their publicising and co-operation with mass media (advertisement),
- building social background for their activities (seeking and assuring a social support for their programmes),
- loss of leaders of citizens' groups on account of political sphere (parliamentary and communal elections),
- a lack of society trust to other active groups, and so a lack of co-operation with other groups; a choice of competitive or a conflict strategy of activity against other groups,

The presented analysis shows very clearly where the training of adult educators for voluntary groups should head. There are very important educator's competencies that can help the groups to find contacts and solve their problems. Among all very different concepts of adult educator, the most useful seems to be the concept of educator as a critical analyst of social reality. Then the 'educator's duty is to analyse, together with the listeners < leaders and members of groups >, political, economic and cultural mechanisms closing people in their social spaces and awaking their subjective and emancipational tendencies' (Malewski 1996:123). As authors of this concept show, there is a danger that such educators seldom gain social approval. But a lack of this approval is very often felt by voluntary groups and their leaders, what in my opinion may cause a creation of stronger relations with adult educators.

Summary

On the basis of researches it may be said that there is a big 'demand' of voluntary groups for well prepared professionals. The will of co-operation with professional adult educators is also expressed by local authorities. A good educator may be a help in breaking through conscious barriers and with respect of voluntary groups' independence, he will be able to help, advise, support this sphere of social activities. The basic question for high schools is: how far are traditional universities prepared to change their concepts of teaching and introduce new programmes for teaching adult educators? It seems that big social pressure and a need to be present on the educational services market, forces Universities to change radically.

References

Aleksander, T. (1996) 'Kształcenie i doskonalenie kadr dla pozaszkolneq edukacji ogólnokształcacej dorosłych' in Wesolowska, A. (ed) *Nauczyciele edukacji dorosłych*, Torun: Wydawnictwo Adam Marszalek ('Training Teachers for Non-formal Adult Education' in *Teachers for Adult Education)*

Fraser, N. (1992) 'Rethinking the Public Sphere: a Contribution to the Critique of Actually Existing Democracy' in Calhouen, C. (ed) *Habermas and the Public Sphere*, London: MIT Press, 109-142.

Fukuyama, F. (1997) *Zaufanie. Kapital społeczny a droga do dobrobytut*, Warszawa: PWN *(Trust. The Social Virtues and the Creation Qf Prosperity).*

Glinski, P. and Palska, H. (1997) 'Cztery wymiary społecznej aktywnosci obywatelskiej' in

Domanski, H. and Rychard, A. (eds) *Elementy nowego ladu*, Warszawa: IFiS PAN, 356 - 392 ('Four Dimensions for Social Citizenship Activity')

Gockowski, J. (1995) 'Polimorfizm ludzki a rodzaje ladu społecznego' in Reut, M. (ed) *Człowiek- Kultura - Edukacja*, Wroclaw: Wydawnictwo Politechniki Wroclawskiej, 31-40.

Grondin, J. (1993) 'Racjonalizacja swiata przezywanego u Haberermasa' in Krasnodebski, Z. and Nellen, K. (eds) *Swiat przezywany. Fenomenologia i nauki społeczne*, Warszawa: PIW, 309-328 ('Rationalization of <Lebenswelt> by Hambermas' *in* <Lebenswelt>. *Phenomenology and the Social Sciences)*

Hankiss, E. (1986) *Pułapki społeczne*, Warszawa: WP *(Social Traps)*

Kurantowicz, E. (1995) 'The Advocating Groups as a Forum of Active Democratic Citizenship' in Bron, M. and Malewski, M. (eds) *Adult Education and Democratic Citizenship*, Wroclaw: Wydawnictwo Uniwersytetu Wrocławskiego.

Kurantowicz, E. (1996) *Edukacja w małych grupach sfery publicznej*,, Wroclaw: (niepublikowana praca doktorska) (Education in Groups of Public Sphere; unpublished doctoral thesis)

Malewski, M. (1996) 'Metodologiczne problemy badan nad oswiata dorosłych i nauczaniem dorosłych' in Wesolowska, A. (ed) *Nauczyciele edukacji dorosłych*, Torun: Wydawnictwo Adam Marszalek.

('Methodological Problems of Adult Education and Teaching Research' in *Teachers for Adult Education)*

Nowak, S. (1979) 'System wartosci spoleczenstwa polskiego', *Studia socjologiczne*, 4, 155-173. ('Value System of Polish Society')

Nowak, S. (1980) 'Wartosci i postawy spoleczne' in Nowak, S. (ed) *Systemy wartosci a wzory konsumpcyjne spoleczenstwa polskiego*, Warszawa: IFiS PAN ('Social values and attitudes' in *Value Systems and Consumption Paterns in Polish Society)*

Ossowski, S. (1967) *O osobliwosciach nauk spolecznych*. Warszawa: PWN

Strzelecki, J. (1989) *Socjalizmu model liryczny*, Warszawa: Czytelnik (Lirical Model of socialism)

Szkudlarek, T. (1993) *Wiedza i wolnosc w pedagogice amerykanskiego postmodernizmu*, Krakow: Impuls *(Knowledge and Freedom in Pedagogy of American Postmodernism)*

Szmatka, J. (1980) *Jednostka i spoleczenstwo*,. Warszawa: PWN *(Individual and Society)*

Smatka, J. (1989) *Male struktury spoleczne*, Warszawa: PWN *(Small Social Structures)*

Tarkowska, E. and Tarkowski, J. (1990) 'Amoralny familizm czyli o dezintegracji spolecznej w Polsce lat osiemdziesiatych' in Wnuk-Lipinski, E. (ed) *Grupy i wiezi spoleczne w systemie monocentrycznym*, Warszawa: IFiS PAN, 37-71 ('Immoral Affilism - about Social Disintegration during eighties in Poland, in *Groups and Social Bonds in Monocentric System)*

110

Training adult educators for working with adults in Croatia

Ilija Lavrnja and Anita Klapan, University of Rijeka, Croatia

Designation of the Problem

One of the essential characteristics of man's essence and existence is his need for cognition, learning and education, not only as a youngster within the regular system of education, but also during the later periods of riper years and the years of professional employment, in other words during an entire lifetime. In the overall picture adult education has, throughout the history of civilization, performed an important educational function as a social need to learn and perceive. With the development of the revolution in science and technology the need for a permanent and continuing learning and training passed on from a privilege for individuals and groups to a privilege for all members of the society, for society as a whole, for a 'learning society'. This is particularly well grounded for the twentieth century and the odds are that the degree of actuality of the idea will be manifested even to a greater extent in the forthcoming century. Adult education as a sphere of human practice and a subject of scientific research has in recent decades undergone such an expansion that in worldwide proportions it has turned into a socio-pedagogical (andragogical) movement that distinctly designates the professionalizing of this human activity which was for such a long time hidden within the educational-pedagogic and social trends as one of the aspects of a medley of problems of the cultural concepts of adult education. When the cultural concept of adult education characteristic during the end of the 19th and beginning of the 20th century was globally abandoned, there was a conveyance to the concept of permanent, lifelong education as an indispensable provision for the development of society under the new scientific and technological conditions that were changing with utmost speed, as well as of the individual who had to respond to the changes that he now faced. From such outsets adult education began to be a constituent part of the professional work and social activity of each and every individual, his needs and rights, during all the periods of his life. Thereby adult education acquires an important position in the concepts of education in all countries, both in the highly developed countries as well as in the less developed countries. However, it is a long way from the principled (even scientifically supported) recognition of the needs and rights to a permanent and lifelong education to its practical realization. Every discussion on the theoretical and conceptual issues of adult education and their practical implications on adult education of necessity include the problem of training personnel (educators) engaged in the various organizational forms and models of adult education (Savicevic 1972: 470-473). These problems are all the more urgent since they emerge very early in spite of the demands for specific training of personnel to work with adults.

As early as the 17th century, Komensky stressed the importance of a 'universal' teacher who would also be capable of teaching adults. During the 18th century numerous theoreticians and scholars dealing with adult education underlined ideas involving professional 'guidance' in adult education and in this connection mentioned the need to professionalize the training of educators for work with adults. These ideas, however, were slow to penetrate into the concrete practice of establishing institutions and models for the educating and training of personnel for work in the sphere of adult education. Only somewhere in the beginning of the 20th century in England, Germany, the United States and some other countries, were efforts intensified to organize a systematic and institutionalized training of personnel for working with adults through a system of university studies of various duration and levels or through the implementation of other ways and models. This was a strong stimulant in giving special

attention to the training of adult educators, while the form and contents of the training in the various countries depended on and still depend on numerous factors among which are in the first place the socioeconomic circumstances, the degree of democratization of the society, the level of culture and traditions, the degree and quality of democratization in education, to what extent is andragogic theory and practice developed, the position of education in the system of values, the investment into education, etc. These and other factors will determine the tempo needed by various countries, as well as on a global level, to overcome the long-standing idea that training adult educators for work in adult education is at best identical to the preparation of personnel for work with children and young people and that the cultural personnel trained for their different professions (subjects and fields) would through 'additional' education also qualify for adult education. Or that experts of various profiles (economists, jurists, engineers....) would, with or without 'additional' training, be able to successfully work with adults in various ways and for various purposes. Everything else is but a matter of 'instinct', 'talent' and 'good intent' to work with adults. Although these voluntaristic ideas have been wholly overcome amongst anyone dealing with adult education in a scientific, professional and practical sense, they still have not yet been completely surmounted, especially among those conducting educational policies who are inclined to solve the issue of training adult educators through the educational system of training personnel for the schooling system. What is the situation in Croatia in this respect?

Some Trends in Training Adult Educators in Croatia

In Croatia there never was a developed system for the training of adult educators, nor is there one today. In the process of training adult educators it may conditionally be said that various profiles of personnel could be aligned conditionally into three groups.

Appertained to the first group are teachers and educators who have worked or work on a volunteer basis, conductors of discussion groups in adult education centers, heads of committees for adult education within the framework of various societies, cultural organizations and associations, cultural institutions, national libraries and reading rooms, in other words all organizations that are voluntarily engaged in some form or model of adult education.

The second group of personnel for adult education in Croatia could include all those individuals who are in addition to their regular employment engaged in adult education. In the first place this pertains to associates in adult education centers and other schools, models and forms of adult education, associates in national libraries and reading rooms, museums, adult education centers within business organizations or public organizations, in public communications media etc. This personnel consists of diverse profiles of educators and teachers, but also other experts of various professions and vocations (economists, engineers, managers....) who carry out a part of the program of adult education.

The third group of adult educators pertains to the body of persons who represent the basis for professionalization of the profile of andragogic personnel. This is the staff that works on the forming and conceiving of adult education, who professionally direct the activities of adult education in the schools and educational institutions, adult education centers in business and public organizations, the staff that works on investigating the needs, conditions and possibilities for adult education, the staff that works on research and development of andragogic theory and practice. This group also includes researchers and university professors. This body of persons have directed their professional activities to working with adults and in the course of the past few decades they have formed the nucleus for generating the professionalization of the adult educators. In perspective they will be the backbone for the professional and scientific conception and management of the system of training adult educators. Although the development of the adult education system in Croatia augmented the interest and need for training of adult educators, a framework for the systematic training of an

andragogic personnel as an undergraduate study has not yet been constituted, let alone as a postgraduate scientific or specialized training for adult educators. In spite of the fact that the university, mainly the faculties of philosophy and teachers training colleges, have introduced andragogy departments but no programs of study, it may be concluded that the training of adult educators in Croatia has not been the subject of organized efforts on the part of the university. Of course this does not mean that the professors of andragogy were passive observers of the process on training adult educators. On the contrary, their individual initiatives and sensibility for these problems were crucial for the systematic attention given to the training of adult educators. Andragogy chairs established within the structure of pedagogy departments at faculties of philosophy and teachers training colleges did not have enough room to establish undergraduate study of andragogy and postgraduate specialized studies, even though such concepts were well formulated and conceived thanks to the enthusiasm of the professors of andragogy (Klapan, 1996, 166-168). A large part of the difficulty in establishing andragogic study lies in the fact that in Croatia the notion regarding andragogy as just one of the disciplines of pedagogy was present for a long time, hence its place was in the system and study of pedagogy. There was also the presence of the attitude that andragogy was an importation from the West and as such it was labeled as 'a bourgeois science' with all other connotations arising therefrom. Particular emphasis was placed on this after World War II when Croatia was one of the republics of Yugoslavia under the influence of the Soviet Union and when efforts were made to take over Soviet experience in adult education. The dominant concept during this period was the traditional idea of enlightenment of the people and it was considered that this could be carried out by cultural personnel and all those persons willing to work on enlightenment of the people, with emphasis on campaigns for prevention of illiteracy by means of courses for analphabets and for general and vocational compensatory education in night schools. As an act of opposition to Stalin's dictates, particularly during the fifties, substantial progress was made and there were significant achievements on the level of adult education in Croatia (Pongrac 1990:18-31). It is interesting to note that the andragogues of Croatia were the persons who realized the importance of communicating with the world and of establishing contacts with the andragogues of the developed countries of the western democracies. This was enhanced through the visits of our experts abroad, but likewise to the visits of foreign experts to our country. There was an expansion of the network of various educational institutions (workers' education centers), in-service education centers were founded within enterprises, the Andragogy Center of Zagreb was established, the magazine Andragogy was inaugurated, books and studies dealing with andragogy were published, scientific and professional symposiums on important issues and problems (of theoretical and methodological and epistemological nature, but also those dealing with conceptual issues and methodological training of adult educators) were organized. Special attention was dedicated to enhancement of training adult educators (Lavrnja & Pongrac1996:152-163). In this sense informal procedures of education were dominant, yet at the same time the foundations for the establishment of formal procedures were lain, namely, for establishment of institutionalized university training of adult educators. The motto of all these efforts was expressed in the opinion that 'the person who works as an adult educator and propagates the idea of lifetime studying must himself be a lifelong "student"', in other words must constantly enhance, supplement and refresh his knowledge. The education and enhancement of andragogic personnel in Croatia was dealt with by associations for adult education, institutions for adult education and their unions. Thus the Union of Adult Education Centers (Savez narodnih sveucilista) was founded as early as 1954 and among their primary assignments were:

- systematic work on training adult educators
- publishing of periodical 'Narodno sveuciliste' (which later grew into the magazine 'Andragogija'), and printing of other andragogic literature

- organizing of scientific and professional activities for the purpose of advancement of andragogic theory and practice.

Immediately after its establishment, the Union started systematic work on publishing the periodical, on scientific and professional activities and in particular on permanent training of personnel in adult education centers through the organizing of seminars, courses, consultations, instruction meetings and so on (Kovacic 1961: 11-82). Nevertheless, systematic effort on training adult educators began with the founding of the School for Andragogic Personnel which became an original model of informal education and qualification of andragogic personnel and whose activities, aims and impact surpassed not only the borders of Croatia and of Yugoslavia at that time, but turned into a well known breeding place of andragogic ideas and gathering place of adult educators from all over the world (Ogrizovic & Sucic1983:3-18). The School for Andragogic Personnel performed its tasks by means of a number of organizational forms. Among them a central position is certainly held by the Summer School for Adult Educators that has been in function since 1958, at first within the structure of the Union of Adult Education Centers, and as of 1973 within the structure of the Andragogic Center of Zagreb. Besides the summer school there is also the Winter School for Adult Educators. The permanent seats of the summer school were located in Porec and Crikvenica, and the school has been a significant initiator of numerous activities in training and advancing andragogic personnel throughout the year in various parts of Croatia and Yugoslavia of that time. The Winter School for Adult Educators began its work later.

Apart from its permanent seats of activity, the School for Andragogic Personnel operated in approximately more than fifty places in Croatia and more than 80 places in Yugoslavia of that time. Its program included the training of several thousand adult educators. The results of the School for Andragogic Personnel are imposing. In the analysis of the school's twenty-five years of activity (both summer & winter), more than 500 different programs were performed, some 13000 students attended, and nearly 500 experts participated as lecturers and organizers in the process of training adult educators (Ogrizovic & Sucic 1983: 18-32). With such profuse activity in the School for Andragogic Personnel it would be difficult to even approximately mention all the activities and tasks that were performed in it, from seminars, colloquiums, courses, conferences to discussions and debate clubs and forums on actual issues of adult education. It may be said with certainty that the School for Andragogic Personnel was an important nursery of innovation of the adult education process, training of adult educators in view of propagation of the meaning of education, familiarizing with the specificity of the process of teaching adults, methodical innovations, strategies, technologies and organizational forms, in addition to being a place of reflection on issues of andragogic theory and the methodology of research in andragogy. Numerous adult educators from the School for Andragogic Personnel have participated as organizers of adult education and lecturers, but also as participants acquiring experience in their own personal and professional education. The idea of a perpetual, continuing training of all personnel in andragogy began to be realized through such organizational forms. Each school for training adult educators was provided with written material in the form of instructions, popular scientific texts, manuals for working with adults, project studies, and was presented with the results of research investigations and of experience achieved through various forms and models of working with adults. Through these different work forms and facilities, the School for Andragogic Personnel closely followed all reform movements in adult education, not only in Croatia but worldwide. Due to its profuse program of activities and openness, the School attracted the attention of adult educators from all over the world. Distinguished experts, adult educators from all parts of the world (more than 800 attendants) participated in the work of the School for Andragogy. They follow the school's achievements and actively participate and convey their own profuse experiences, and likewise take part in the theoretical and methodical ideation of andragogic theory and practice. International

conferences on adult education are organized within the School's activities in which almost 200 prominent adult educators from abroad participated. To some extent this rich activity of the School for Andragogic Personnel has dwindled during the end of the eighties and during the war years from 1990 to 1995, but was reanimated within the structure of the Association of Andragogues of Croatia during 1996. It is interesting that it was precisely the School for Andragogic Personnel who initiated the professionalizing of adult educators and is wholly committed to the working program of the Union of Andragogic Societies of Croatia and Yugoslavia. A noteworthy place in the creation of a system for training adult educators without a doubt belongs to university teachers and researchers. At first they introduced andragogy departments and andragogic disciplines to the study of pedagogic sciences at the University in Zagreb and Rijeka, thereafter initiating the introduction of an andragogic major within the study of pedagogy(Klapan,1996:163-169). They also inaugurated the introduction of postgraduate andragogic specialized study for the various profiles of experts among adult educators.

Along with this came the realization of scientific research in the domain of adult education. Scientific papers are published and further activities on training of adult educators are organized. However in spite of all this, we still think that enough has not been done for the establishing of a system of adult education. After the end of the war that Croatia was engaged in and since it has gained full independence and been included among the member countries of the western democracies, there remain numerous questions regarding the revitalization of institutions for adult education, the working out of new concepts and education programs and in particular the concept of training of adult educators.

Envisaging a System for the Training of Adult Educators

Without minimizing the need for fostering informal methods of education and training of personnel for work in the domain of adult education, we are of the opinion that for professionalization of adult educators it is necessary to introduce a system of training this personnel within the structure of university studies in the form of andragogic undergraduate studies, within which the formation of fundamental andragogic personnel and basic andragogic disciplines or andragogic postgraduate studies, in combination with the study of pedagogy, sociology, study of languages and literature and other teacher profiles, would take place. It would likewise be necessary to combine the undergraduate study of andragogy with the other personnel profiles (law, economy, engineering and other vocations). Moreover, for development of andragogic personnel it would be possible to introduce selective modules of andragogic contents to the studies of other profiles who, in the course of their professional work, also intend to share in the work of adult educators. Special attention in the system of training adult educators should be dedicated to different models and forms of postgraduate expert, specialist and scientific schooling of personnel that professionally works with or intends to work with adults. In the system of adult education an important role should be given to enhancement and perpetual educating through various forms and models of consultations, courses, seminars, correspondence education, traditional models of adult education schools. This should by all means be based on development research which would be combined on a level with the development research institute for adult education. We would thereby be creating the suppositions for the professionalization of adult education and professionalization of adult educators which would contain all the fundamental characteristics of professionalization (systematic knowledge, social function, recognized status, professional code, public support and control, independent operation, continuing education, preparation and development...). Without that it will be difficult, despite all the achievements on the plane of adult education in Croatia, to catch up with the countries of the developed world.

References

Klapan, A. (1996) 'Andragogik als padagogische Disciplin in der Lehrerausbildung der Republik Kroatien' *Erwachsenenbildung in der Aufklarung,* .

Kovaèiæ, A. (1961) *Kadrovi u narodnim sveuèilištima*, Zagreb

Lavrnja, I. and Pongrac, S. (1996) 'Tendenzen der Erwachsenenbildung in Kroatien von 1918 bis heute': *Erwachsenenbildung in der Aufklarung, Wien,* Promedia, 153-163.

Matijeviæ, M. (1985) *Suvremena organizacija obrazovanja odraslih*, Zagreb

Ogrizoviæ, M. and Suèiæ, S. (1983): *Dvadeset pet godina rada Škole za andragoške kadrove*, Zagreb

Pongrac, S. (1990) *Inoviranje obrazovanje odraslih*, Zagreb, Andragoški centar

Savièeviæ, D. (1972) 'Oblici i sadr• aji andragoških studija', *Andragogija, posebno izdanje, Zagreb-Poreè, 470-493.*

An opening window for the training of adult educators - higher education

Nick Small, The Open University, UK

> We are all imprisoned by the historical experience of the country in which we live. What we may or may not do is determined by the attitudes and institutions which developed over the centuries. Adult education provision in England is no exception. (Stephens 1990: 8).

The International Context

There is a world-wide trend to extend initial training for university teachers and to make it compulsory. It is currently a compulsory requirement for tenure in Norway and some institutions in Holland. A national accreditation framework is being considered in Australia, and the issue is being discussed in Sweden. A steamroller effect is building up (Gibbs & Beaume 1997, 4-7).

The National Context

Within the two decade maelstrom of change in the education sector in Britain, two points of development of interest to trainers of adults can be observed.

One is the recommendation of the Committee of Enquiry into Adult Education (the 'Russell Committee' HMSO 1973) that there should be training arrangements for those working full time in adult education, at the local authority level, and also for their part-time staff, available through weekend courses and summer schools. "We should like to see a training programme, progressing from induction to the more advanced and specialised, available to all university and WEA [Workers' Educational Association] part-time adult tutors and active encouragement being given to tutors to take advantage of it in this as well as in the local education authority sector" (HMSO 1973 para 415). Training in this sector, had, hitherto, not been a requirement, though occasionally sessions on presentation might be offered. It was not a priority in an area perennially short of funding.

Training has generally been a requirement for those teaching in schools (minimum: two-year courses up to 1959, then three years with B.Ed. degrees developing). Graduates, till recently, have been able to teach in the schools system without further training beyond their degree. Now, apart from a variety of entry schemes, a PGCE (post-graduate certificate in education) is expected. In the Further Education area (16-19, vocational provision), "everything that does not happen in school or universities", (Kennedy, 1) a training requirement is not compulsory though this has now become a possibility, (DfEE 1997 para 5.4).

Secondly, a recent report has turned the focus to the training in teaching methods of university staff: Recommendation 48 "over the medium term it should become the normal requirement that all new full-time academic staff with teaching responsibilities [be] required to achieve at least associate membership of the Institute of Learning and Teaching in Higher Education, for the successful completion of probation", (HMSO: Dearing.)

The basis for this requirement arises from a discussion of method, numbers and teaching cost - 'we consider how students' learning time might be distributed across different combinations of three teaching methods: lectures, small groups and resource based learning (RBL)' (Appendix 2, para 3 to the Dearing Inquiry) RBL is 'differentiated into two types, given their very different costs: "external" refers to materials produced external to the university, such as

text books, commercial CDs and software; "in house" refers to materials developed in-house, such as printed lecture-notes, course ware programs, customised spreadsheets' (*ibid.*)

With growing student numbers, costs per students fall and, basing an exercise on certain assumptions, the Appendix shows RBL and IT (information technology) use can contain a reduction in small group work without increasing teaching costs excessively. Thus RBL is seen as offering 'more interactivity than books, and [can] make use of interactive programmes and communication technologies'. The outcome 'with negligible variable costs, the relatively high production costs of these methods can be amortised over large numbers of students to achieve a better cost curve, capable of with-standing expansion'. (*ibid.* para7).

It seems likely that, in a period of expansion in student, not staff, numbers, the Committee moved to consider how staff could be best equipped to cope with what might become an overwhelming tide.

In an adult trainers' conference, this raises the issue of definition. Who are the adults being trained, and who are their students? The assumption here is that those teaching over 18-year-olds are teachers of adults, given that, in the UK, the legal age of adulthood is 18. Further, within the University sector, the majority, are 'mature' students.

The numbers participating are huge in historical British terms, and can be traced to the Robbins Report of 1963 where the 'principle' was stated and accepted that places should be provided in higher education for all those qualified for and seeking them. The growth in this sector (22% 1985-90; Human Development Report 1997;208) is significant, and rapid. The participation rate is approaching 30% - remarkable, historically, but modest compared with other industrialised nations.

'The National Education and Training Targets...envisage 60% of young people being qualified to HE entrance level by 2000' (Dearing Report 1 para 7.2) with 'at least 40% of 18-year olds to enter higher education in the medium term...a realistic target for 20 years' time would be 50% of the age group' (*ibid* 7.1).

A National Proposal

The major concern of the Dearing Report was 'over the next 20 years ...create a society committed to learning throughout life' (Summary, para-2). The situation at mid-1997 was summed up over the last 20 years: 'the number of students [in higher education] has more than doubled; public funding for higher education has increased in real terms by 45 percent; the unit of funding per student has fallen by 40 per cent; public spending on higher education as a percentage of gross domestic product, has stayed the same' (Summary, para. 14). Student numbers in higher education , in 1996-7 in universities and higher education colleges were 2.8 million. Less than a quarter were young people studying for a qualification full-time (the traditional mainstay). Of those pursuing a qualification, 64 per cent were mature students and 37 per cent part-time. 'Nearly a million enrol with higher education institutions not to gain a qualification but to meet a particular skill need or fill a gap in their knowledge, or just because they want to learn' (The Learning Age, 1998 para 4.26).

With falling financial support and growing staff: student ratios, the 'Committee recommended its teaching qualification for university staff by means of the creation of an Institute in Higher Education in Learning and Teaching' (para 8.64 - 8.76 Dearing Report). Apart from obvious benefits, the aim was to 'raise the status of teaching across higher education, help the UK to become a world leader in the practice of teaching at higher levels, and emphasise the importance of learning' (*ibid*).

As the Report recognised, it was not treading virgin soil with this proposal since 'Many institutions have responded to this need [the development of staff's teaching professionalism] by establishing their own courses on teaching in higher education' (Report1 para 6.6). The Staff and Educational Development Association (SEDA) already existed and was offering accreditation systems.

Until very recently, there was no accreditation for teachers in higher education. In the early 1990's, up to 20 polytechnics had postgraduate certificate level courses, internally validated, some built on a traditional further education provision, (Cert. Ed. (FE)). Most led to no award. In the early 1990's SEDA developed an accreditation scheme for these courses, principally concerned with learning outcome. By 1997, SEDA had been adopted by over 70 UK institutions (and some abroad). Voluntary adoption of the scheme helped to persuade the Dearing Committee of Inquiry that a compulsory national scheme was possible in the UK.

Just prior to the publication of the Dearing Committee's Inquiry, the 'Booth Committee', set up by the Funding Councils and other bodies (including the higher education teaching unions) was working to develop an accreditation scheme. It issued a consultation paper ('Accreditation and Teaching in Higher Education') in January 1998. The Quality Assurance Agency (QAA) could also be drawn in on the accreditation side.

Two levels of accreditation are being considered: one for Associate Teachers, one for Accredited Teachers, (Open University internal documents.)

One Case, One Style

The position of this observer is that of a member of the Open University, a distance learning institution based in the UK. It is the largest university in the UK, recruiting older students (median age on entry 37) who study courses leading to degrees on a part-time basis. In 1995 (the latest available figures) there were 140,873 undergraduate students, and 11,797 post-graduate , with 863 full-time academic staff, and tutorial and counselling staff, working part-time, 7,621.

The concern of the OU is to recruit staff locally who can tutor courses produced centrally, and it has emphasised, more recently, the significance of supporting them through staff training provision. This is supported through Supported Open Learning (SOL) materials. The concern is to draw on the institution's experience of 25 years of distance teaching for the benefit of new staff. A Reader stresses the spirit of the institution, expanding on its mission statement, with significant chapters on face-to-face tuition, correspondence tuition and student support and counselling. This is one part of the armoury supplied to all new staff. There is also a series of 'tool kits', available on request - more than a dozen from 'Equal Opportunities' to 'Learning How To Learn' to 'Effective Tutorials' and 'How do I know I'm Doing a good job?'

New staff, selected on their knowledge and experience of the subject of a course, receive a briefing on its content from an experienced tutor or possibly a member of the group which produced and is now presenting the course. Similarly, there will be a session (usually an evening) on the implications of tutoring at a distance, possibly individually or in a group (depending on the number of new staff in the region at that time). There is a mentoring system to sustain the new tutor, usually an experienced tutor on the same course. This offers a port of first call as the new recruit begins work.

The wider world

To return to the agenda of the Dearing Report, staff training (or development) is in 'a context of change and international challenge.'

'First, academic staff need to embrace a wider concept of staff development than that implied by sabbatical leave for research, and related activities' (Report 1, para. 6.1-2). Dearing records that 'Investors in People (IIP) is cited...as a means of promoting...cultural change by which the centrality of all staff is not just understood but becomes part of the day-to-day functioning of institutions' (*ibid.* para. 6.3).

For the OU, the reputation of its work rests heavily on the quality of the teaching material , and its student support sustained by the part-time staff. A further support for staff is a monitoring system, whereby someone with greater experience of the course in question reviews the assignment grading and commenting of course tutors, to ensure a balance of marking level and advice.

Staff training: development elsewhere

The Dearing Report quotes a number of responses, favourable to some form of 'national council for teaching and learning' reflecting 'a widespread willingness to collaborate over the production of materials, and to see the dissemination of good practice in programme design' (Dearing Report 1, para. 3.36). The National Union of Students proposed 'the development of a General Council for University Teaching...to foster positive developments in university teaching and provide recognition of those engaged in increasing the quality of higher education' (*ibid.* para. 3.40).

Based on apparent support from the institutions, the Report described the function of an Institute for Learning and Teaching in Higher Education 'teaching on a more professional basis' offering 'a strong foundation of theoretical and practical research into learning and teaching processes. There is no place at present, where such a body of knowledge can develop...while higher education has increased in class sizes, reduced its teaching time, modularised , accepted students without traditional academic preparation , reformed programmes to prepare students for employment, and so on, it has done so on the basis of little evidence of the consequences and with little strategic research in place to monitor them. There is no agency to fund, commission or co-ordinate such research' (Dearing para. 8.64).

This supposes a wider remit than some form of compulsory accreditation of teaching staff in higher education, but in fact proposes three major areas for any Institute 'the accreditation of teacher education programmes; research and development in learning and teaching; stimulation of innovation in learning and teaching ' (*ibid.* para 8.66).

The fairly broad remit would include using 'the outcomes research to stimulate innovation in learning and teaching. Particular activities could include: widening the debate on the curriculum, teaching and assessment with teachers throughout higher education; encouraging...conferences, workshops and seminars designed to disseminate interesting and useful practice across the sector; and producing practitioner oriented publications' (para 8.68.)

While the Report Committee, though Government appointed, can recommend, it cannot legislate. Government response to the Report's recommendations was assumed to be in the form of a White Paper - usually an indicator of proposed policy and possible legislation. In fact, the response is in the form of a consultation or discussion paper, itself a disappointment since it conveys indecision on what could be a major policy initiative given the spadework already done by the Committee.

In fact, this 'consultation' response to proposals for an Institute for Learning and Teaching in Higher Education are supportive. Whilst re-iterating support for the Robbins principle 'that anyone who has the capability for higher education should have the opportunity to benefit from it' (The Learning Age 1998 para. 4.27), and saying that the cap on numbers, which had exacerbated problems referred to earlier, offered additional investment in 1998-99 to meet growing needs (*ibid.* and para. 4.35), concerning wider access and higher standards. The paper acknowledges Dearing's suggestions for staff development in teaching 'It dealt with staff training and development, qualifications and standards, research, information technology, and governance. The Government has already responded to its recommendations on funding and student support and our response is published in a separate policy statement alongside this consultation paper' (*ibid.* para. 4.29). This appears to refer to a document emerging on the same day as the consultation paper (*Higher Education for the 21st Century Response to the Dearing Report*, February 1998), directly responding to each Dearing recommendation, not to a paper of the same title issued on 23 July 1997.

'The Government's long term aim is that all teachers in higher education should carry a professional qualification. It welcomes the proposed institute for Learning and Teaching in Higher Education as an important step towards the achievement of that aim' (*Higher Education for the 21st Century*, 43). This is developed in response to recommendation 48, quoted earlier, and to other recommendations on related issues.

The document published with the Dearing Report on 23 July 1997 and also entitled 'Higher Education in the 21st Century' was primarily concerned with financing expansion in higher education and charging fees to full-time students, capturing public interest thereby. A heated public debate led to some amendment of its proposals, when possible effects became clear.

The more easily available Consultation Paper response to Dearing and Kennedy, *The Learning Age. A renaissance for a new Britain*, is in fact clear: A proposal for a 'recognised initial teacher training qualification' in further education is put forward (5.4). Given that a main theme of Dearing is wider access accompanied by higher standards, training in teaching is one strategy for maintaining standards otherwise subject to undermining by growth.

'The funding bodies should identify ways of rewarding the best in teaching and learning and successful outreach to the disadvantaged or under-represented. We also see the need to build up the standards and professional status of teachers in higher education. Central to achieving these changes will be the new Institute for Learning and Teaching in Higher Education, recommended by Dearing, which the Government expects to be established as soon as possible' (5.17).

A further stated situation is to 'monitor the implementation of the Dearing committee's recommendations on quality and standards within higher education' (61).

This leaves an open field. From the tone of the consultation paper, the intention of the Dearing Committee that university lecturers should undergo training for the teaching side of their work is accepted and will presumably be implemented unless there is strong opposition in the debate invited by the paper.

By March 1998, the Open University had set up a Centre for Higher Education Practice (CHEP), and was preparing courses that would lead to Part One Associate Membership of the Institute for Learning and Teaching in Higher Education (ILTHE): and a subsequent course leading to Part Two Membership and accredited teacher status. A pilot presentation from November 1998 is in prospect to iron out practical snags and problems. Thus, the institution

is moving to a Postgraduate Certificate in Teaching and Learning in Higher Education (still to be approved at the time of writing). Typically of the OU, any new initiative is a substantial financial commitment because of offering a course on a national basis, even if only internally, to part-time staff.

The proposals were a response to Recommendation 13 of the Dearing Inquiry. 'We recommend that institutions of higher education begin immediately to develop or seek access to programmes for teacher training of their staff, if they do not have them, and that all institutions seek national accreditation of such programmes from the Institute for Learning and Teaching in Higher Education.'

It had still to be decided if in the OU, new part-time staff should have to undertake such courses as a requirement, or whether it would be an option. And indeed, if such courses should be open to full-time staff who may be offered an accredited course from another department within the OU. The implication of fee-waivers for both groups would have to be considered. These courses are conceived as being additional to the briefing mentioned earlier.

This is a note of one institution's current reaction, but it is one of many, as this area of staff preparation for working in higher education becomes of very wide concern. Coping with numbers and maintaining quality act as twin stimulants.

Review

Britain is recognising its place in the international pecking order, and considering what it can do to improve that. Soberingly, 'even though the target of one in three young people entering higher education by the year 2000 has been largely achieved, international comparisons show that we cannot afford to stand still. Our ratio of new graduates to population falls behind the US, Australia and Canada, and Japan and Korea are catching up' (DfEE, July 1997, 5).

Very clearly the developments are based on economic concerns which see education as a contribution to economic improvement.

'We need to ensure that everybody - whatever their age or background - has access to lifelong learning, with education and training throughout life. We need to develop a culture of lifelong learning if we are to compete in world markets including Europe and the growing economies of the Far East' (D Blunkett, Secretary of State for Education and Employment, *ibid*, 1).

A distance learning approach is not a cheap or easy option, but one of a number of strategies within an overall national approach. The nature of 'delivery' of material becomes increasingly influenced by possibilities in new technology, and forecasts or estimates of access of potential students to computers, and their ability to use these. Market penetration of new technology is a vital element in planning for two or three years ahead, as lack of access may exclude a substantial proportion of the population.

There is Government support, even enthusiasm for this. 'Communications and information technology offers opportunities to increase the effectiveness of learning and to provide improved access to higher education' (Consultation Paper, 1998, 38). Given this attitude, one can only assume that similar methods will be acceptable in the Institute of Learning and Teaching in Higher Education.

For those training adult educators in any context, computer technology may be a helpful addition to the teaching method, and in an age of quality assurance and accountability, a

potentially vital element in knowledge dissemination. The next step is critical use of this information, with suitable analytical skills fostered. There is no simple or cheap answer.

Many of the documents quoted or drawn on in this paper pursue the aim of a culture of lifelong learning, of possibly regular re-training in mature economies rapidly changing and developing. Certainly, there is a tradition amongst many of a long-standing faith in education as a trigger and contribution to economic change. With an industrial revolution taking place, and constant up-dating and adaptation to change necessary, the future for adult trainers is bright.

Seldom has provision for adults in education or training been far from the bottom of education agenda. It is now emerging as a main, if not the, main element on many agenda. An issue for this Conference is to consider whether this sector of trainers is equal to the task before us.

> Education is the best economic policy we have
> (Rt. Hon. Tony Blair, MP, *Learning Age*, 1998: 9)

References

Higher Education for the 21st Century Department for the Education and Employment (July 1997) (DfEE)

Gibbs G & Beaume D, *International Journal for Academic Development* 1:2, 1997

The National Committee of Inquiry into Higher Education: 'Higher Education in the Learning Society' Chair: Sir Ron Dearing (1997) HMSO

Summary Report of the above, (July 1997) HMSO

Human Development Report (1997), UNDP New York

Adult Education: A Plan for Development. Report of a Committee of Inquiry appointed by the Secretary of State for Education and Science under the chairmanship of Sir Lionel Russell, CBE. ('The Russell Report') (1973) HMSO

Higher Education Cmnd 2154 *Robbins Report* (1963) London HMSO

Higher Education for the 21st Century: Response to the Dearing Report, (February, 1998) DfEE

The Learning Age, A Renaissance For A New Britain, Cm. 3790. (February 1998) DfEE

Kennedy H. QC (June, 1997) *Learning Works: Widening Participation in Further Education.* The Further Education Funding Council

Stephens M (1990) *Adult Education* (Cassell) quoted by Roger Fieldhouse 'Adult Education History: Why rake up the past?' Seventh Albert Mansbridge Memorial Lecture, University of Leeds 1997

The Open University Facts and Figures (1995/6)

Recognising prior learning and assessing current competency in the training of adult educators - does it devalue the learning process?

Tom Stehlik, University of South Australia, Australia

Introduction

As tertiary institutions strive to offer award courses that are 'client-driven', ie reflecting the needs of industry and the community and adapting to demands for more vocationally oriented programs aligned with specific growth areas, credit transfer, articulation and recognition of prior learning and experience become major issues for those involved in developing and delivering tertiary curriculum.

The literature on learning organisations also points to an increasing recognition and legitimisation of formal and informal learning processes embedded in the workplace. For strategic as well as economic reasons, tertiary institutions are now also locked into the need to recognise such processes. In particular, awards in the areas of business and management, and adult and vocational education are offering more flexible pathways and credit transfer arrangements for students with significant prior experience in industry and the workplace, as well as prior learning in other educational institutions.

While the basic principle of this may be sound in terms of equity, and acknowledges the notion that life experiences, informal and non-formal learning processes should be valued and recognised and afforded the same sort of legitimacy as formal or institutional processes, should adult educators be concerned about the possible long-term consequences of such arrangements for the quality of education, the credibility of tertiary qualifications, and the actual process of learning through life?

This paper compares examples of recognition of prior learning (RPL) and credit transfer arrangements from the tertiary sector, discusses the need for tertiary educators to be consistent in applying assessment standards to such arrangements, and outlines some of the issues confronting the VET sector and the higher education sector; in particular the grey areas where the sectors coincide. The paper also addresses the question of whether this 'new credentialism' actually hijacks real learning, and whether the learning process itself is more or less important than formal credentials which are increasingly being perceived as currency in an educational marketplace.

This paper is not so much based on the findings of a planned and structured research process, but more on the reflections of my experiences in higher education as a lecturer in post-compulsory education and a course co-ordinator of the Bachelor of Teaching (Education and Training of Adults) at the University of South Australia.

As tertiary institutions strive to offer award courses that are 'client-driven', ie reflecting the needs of industry and the community, and adapt to demands for more vocationally oriented programs aligned with specific growth areas, credit transfer, articulation and recognition of prior learning (RPL) and assessment of competence become major issues for those involved in developing and delivering tertiary curriculum.

At the same time, we have seen the emergence of a model of workplace learning (Marsick, 1988; Marsick and Watkins, 1990) which goes beyond a traditional behaviourist perspective

to acknowledge self-reflective, informal and incidental learning processes in the context of the workplace, reinforced by findings that Australian managers do not consider formal management programs to be as relevant or useful as informal and on-the-job learning events (Karpin Report, 1995).

The literature on learning organisations (Watkins and Marsick, 1993; Lessem, 1991; Senge, 1990) also points to an increasing recognition and legitimisation of formal and informal learning processes embedded in the workplace. Furthermore, what we mean when we talk about 'workplace' is now also very flexible, and can include contexts that involve unpaid, voluntary and community-based work. For strategic as well as economic reasons, tertiary institutions are now also locked into the need to recognise such processes. In particular, awards in the areas of business, management, adult and vocational education are offering more flexible pathways and credit transfer arrangements for students with significant prior experience in industry and the workplace, as well as prior learning in other educational institutions.

Therefore, those of us teaching in these areas in higher education find ourselves in an environment where students can be awarded up to 50% of a degree on the basis of the recognition of prior learning and experience, or using the preferred term now in use, on the basis of their *current competency*.

While I support the basic principle of this in terms of equity, and agree that life experiences and informal and non-formal learning processes should be valued and recognised, as an educator I have a number of concerns about the long-term consequences of such arrangements for the quality of education and the credibility of tertiary qualifications, a view that is reinforced in the words of Snewin (1996:37) who labels RPL as 'a two-edged sword if there ever was one!'

This paper discusses examples of credit transfer arrangements from the tertiary sector in Australia, the need for tertiary educators to be consistent in applying assessment standards to such arrangements, and outlines some of the issues confronting the higher education and the vocational education and training (VET) sectors, in the light of the increasing blurring of the traditional boundaries between them.

In Australia, the VET sector has been historically dominated by the publicly funded colleges of Technical and Further Education, (abbreviated as TAFE), but in the new deregulated environment TAFE now competes in an open educational marketplace with other registered providers including large manufacturing firms and industry training bodies as well as private colleges. This of course has seen a proliferation of authorities, bodies, councils and policy making groups arising in order to deal with the distribution of funds, accreditation of courses, development of policy and ratification of standards in the deregulated VET environment. However, as this paper will argue, this proliferation is also part of the problem, as it makes it difficult to see the wood for the trees. A coherent national framework for the VET/ higher education interface is still in a process of evolving, while at the same time a variety of responses, policies and practices are being haphazardly applied. It's one of those reform processes that can be likened to trying to rebuild a bicycle while continuing to ride it!

Defining the terminology and the processes.

Some of the confusion arises simply due to the different interpretations of the terminology used in the credit transfer picture.

The term *credit* is now used in Australia to describe what was once known as *status, exemption*, or *advanced standing*. The terms *RPL - recognition of prior learning* and *RPE - recognition of prior experience*, are self explanatory. An example of the inherent assumed

meanings of these terms is given in the title of a self-help manual for applicants - ***RPL means getting credit where it's due*** (Crothers, 1996). According to the Australian Vice-Chancellor's Committee Credit Transfer Project, ***credentialled prior learning*** is identified as learning from a course offered by a recognised educational institution such as a public or private provider, professional body or enterprise, while ***uncredentialled prior learning*** is identified as learning from work experience and/or life experience. This distinction is often described as *formal* versus *informal* learning, a very dubious dichotomy which tends to simplify the subtleties of any learning process, not just in adult education.

Credit transfer refers to recognised agreements or arrangements between institutions which determine the equivalence of credentials within particular disciplines or subject areas. This necessarily only applies to credentialled prior learning. Another term which has been used to describe these arrangements is *articulation*. In an interview on ABC radio on July 3rd 1997, the then Federal Minister for Employment, Education and Training, Senator Vanstone, was heard to say the following about articulation, which I paraphrase, but is more or less verbatim - 'Articulation....I don't know what it means - it's just a word someone dreamed up to describe pathways between universities and TAFE.'

If the minister was this vague about articulation, no wonder the related procedures and practices in higher education and the VET sectors are in a state of confusion! This is in spite of the fact that my dictionary (Penguin Modern English, 1987) defines articulation as *"clear enunciation"*, and further defines enunciation as *'to state formally and carefully'*. I submit that one of the big problems associated with articulation, RPL and credit transfer is that it is still in the *process* of being stated formally and carefully, and that in the meantime, decisions are being made and processes are being adopted casually and haphazardly, as typified by the minister's throwaway statement.

Perhaps the most important term to unpack is *assessment*, which is seen as being the key to the whole issue of recognising competence. Assessment is a much maligned word in education - even more so in the VET sector and especially in the current environment of competency-based education. It is often confused with *evaluation*, or *accountability* - terms which should be applied to curriculum or methodology rather than learning. Norm-referenced assessment of particular learning outcomes can give completely different results to criterion-referenced assessment of the same outcomes, and it is very difficult to keep subjectivity, bias and prejudice out of the assessment process. The term assessment has been defined as 'a measure of a student's progress or achievement' (McCormick, 1982) and the process has been described as being concerned with 'the collection of evidence' (Fletcher, 1992: 25). Fletcher goes on to make an important distinction - that the collection of evidence *within a program of learning* is 'to demonstrate that you have learned at least the required percentage of the syllabus', but that 'if the learning is also linked to an award system, a further purpose may be the achievement of formal recognition that learning has been achieved' (1992:25-26). I suggest that what we are talking about in the assessment of current competency is pretty much the latter - that our concern in collecting evidence for an award system has hijacked the more fundamental concept of assessment of actual *learning*, which is in danger of becoming secondary to this process.

The Australian Context

I now present some examples from my own experiences at the University of South Australia. This institution, which was formed in 1990 from the amalgamation of four Colleges of Advanced Education with an Institute of Technology, has a long history of links with vocational education and industry, and its in-service adult education awards have had provision for recognising prior learning and current competency since 1975.

Adult education students are generally mature age, predominantly women, and mostly already working in fields as diverse as health education, workplace training, adult literacy, community development, or teaching in a TAFE or private VET college. Their educational needs are typified by a desire to gain formal qualifications to teach in an area in which they are generally already trained, eg mechanics, textiles, health, art; or experienced, eg workplace training, management, voluntary work.
In the undergraduate degree, a trade certificate is awarded a certain amount of academic points on the basis of being a teaching subject area, and is a current competency that can be recognised. Often students have already completed a TAFE Diploma in, for example Child Care or Ambulance Studies. This is worth a certain number of points on the same basis.

These are clear examples of *credentialled prior learning*. However, in order to be equitable, the university also offers similar advanced standing to students who can demonstrate significant experience in their field without necessarily having credentials. Examples include awarding points for 'Vocational and managerial experience in retail industry & experience as a trainer in the area'; for 'Experience in secretarial / administrative area'; or for 'Experience in Finance Industry'.

These are examples of *uncredentialled prior learning* and are taken from the Faculty of Education's records which constitute a body of case law in awarding credit in such cases where there are no clear credit transfer arrangements. This database forms the only benchmark against which uncredentialled credit decisions are made, often by a single course co-ordinator but occasionally in consultation with others. Every time an application is made for which there is no precedent, a decision has to be made by judging each new case on its own merits.

This is where the whole area begins to get a bit vague, as the first obvious question in assessing uncredentialled prior learning is 'How many years of experience?', and the next question is 'How long ago was this experience gained?', not to mention 'What was the quality and depth of this experience?'. The above examples do not mention a minimum time period for such experience. There is a rule of thumb that the use-by date of some credentialled learning is ten years - but this is not stated anywhere in university policy nor is it adhered to *formally and carefully*. After all, if one gained a teaching qualification in the 1960's, surely it is still a teaching qualification in the 1990's - even though a two-year Diploma of Teaching then obviously involved less coursework than the minimum qualification now, which is a four year Bachelor of Education.

This raises the question of whether a degree is a degree is a degree, as there now seems to be some inconsistency in comparing formal credentials amongst the various universities in Australia, some of which offer up to two-thirds of their awards as credit, and others which offer none at all.

RPL in practice

In the VET and Workplace Learning sectors, recognising prior learning and assessing current competency has become part of the teaching, learning and assessing practice of adult educators who then have an expectation that this will also apply to their own studies when they enrol in a university course.

There are credit transfer agreements between the university and the VET sector under which students may apply for credit against a number of recognised certificate courses - mostly staff development programs offered to TAFE lecturers - which can mean a significant reduction in time and fees for completing a degree. Currently the university charges no fees for this service, even though it actually costs the university in reduced Federal Government funding,

according to the formula where higher education funding is directly linked to actual subject enrolments.

However, precisely because of the RPL environment existing in the TAFE and VET sectors, these packages and courses mentioned above have more often than not been assessed and awarded on the basis of recognition of prior learning - which by the way is a process that TAFE and other registered providers do charge a significant fee for - and the university has no input and very little control over these assessment practices. The result is what amounts to a form of double dipping - where a person can be awarded a certificate based on a prior learning application, then use that certificate for a further credit application in a university award. The question that presents itself is when, where and how did the actual learning take place? Is there a danger of throwing the baby out with the bathwater in awarding credit for prior learning, when maybe we should be concerned with recognising the need for current learning, or even the possibilities for future learning?

A specific example of the confusion over the actual value of credentials in the RPL environment is that of the Certificate IV in Workplace Training Category 2. This qualification is based on nationally agreed competencies for workplace trainers and assessors, and was initially designed to meet the needs of those people in workplace and industrial settings who had significant responsibility for training. Under the requirements of the Accreditation and Registration Council (ARC), because of the strong links between TAFE and industry, the increasing role of VET providers in assessing trainees and apprentices on and off the job, but mainly because of having to compete in the training marketplace with private providers, this certificate has now become mandatory for all TAFE lecturing staff. There is now a perception in the VET sector that the Workplace Trainer Category 2 Certificate is the benchmark qualification for trainers, and indeed, in order to qualify for accreditation, registered providers must also ensure that their staff all have this credential.

This is despite the view of observers such as Michael Tovey from Griffith University, who believes that 'to be effective and help organisations achieve their performance objectives, trainers needed a solid grounding in contemporary learning theory and the skills to tailor learning to individual needs'. Tovey goes on to say that 'there should be a compulsory minimum three-year degree qualification for trainers as well as a professional guarantee, similar to 'Certified Practising Accountant' status, to embed the 'E' in VET.' (Menso, 1997:10).

We at the University of South Australia are also concerned about the 'E' in VET - the educational imperative for providing that solid grounding in contemporary learning theory, and so we offer a three-year degree qualification in adult education which aims to do just this, and encourage adult educators to develop a critical and reflective approach to their practice that is linked to theoretical constructs as well as being grounded in applied practice. The Bachelor of Teaching in the Education and Training of Adults, for many years was seen as a thorough and appropriate initial qualification for an adult educator - yet graduates are being told that in the current deregulated training environment they need the Category 2 Certificate as well. This is despite the fact that the competencies upon which the certificate is based are more than covered in the coursework of the Bachelor of Teaching, and graduates should have the skills and knowledge and more. But recently we had the absurd situation of training providers contacting us to ask if the Bachelor of Teaching was equivalent to Workplace Trainer Category 2. This makes us very nervous when there is a perception in the sector that a nominal thirteen work course is *equal in value* to a three year degree!

Even more disturbingly, the 'Cat 2' credential, as it's known in common parlance, can also be attained by a process of recognition of prior learning! So if our graduates do have to gain the

certificate, they can do so by going through an RPL process - for a fee. There are also a number of providers who offer this certificate and the associated RPL option, and they all have differing fee structures - an example of the free market economy in educational currency! The TAFE institutes of course are included in this list of providers - and most TAFE staff do not do the actual coursework involved in the certificate, but are awarded some or all of the modules - eight in all - more or less on the basis of already being there. However, a cursory glance at the documentation from four different TAFE institutes for the RPL process shows some disturbing issues in terms of quality assurance and consistency.

Examples include different interpretations of the learning outcomes in the various modules, eg in one institute you are required to 'discuss principles of effective training', in another institute you only have to identify them. For the RPL process you have to supply evidence of having achieved these outcomes. Who assesses this? Often other TAFE colleagues!

Accreditation or education?

Another example of the client driven approach emerging in tertiary education is the award that has been specifically structured in collaboration with industry partners. We have seen the proliferation of awards in Australia such as a Bachelor of Taxation, even a Masters degree in golf! The University of South Australia has collaborated with the Department of Education and Children's Services in South Australia to develop a Graduate Certificate in Professional Practice, aimed specifically at school teachers and school managers. The structure of the award is such that only one of the four subjects is actually taught by the university - the other three are 'empty shells' which are filled in by the participants completing in-house development programs, with topics including mentoring and leadership etc.

Again, while this represents flexibility for the learners and meets the needs of the client - in this case the schools sector - the university is not actually involved in delivering or assessing the learning in three-quarters of the certificate, which is effectively awarded as RPL. Even though in theory the assessment processes are determined in collaboration under a 'Quality Assurance' agreement, in practice it reduces the university to a provider of *accreditation* rather than a provider of *education*.

In one sense though, isn't this what institutions of higher learning are for - to provide credentials for a society and a system of work based on a hierarchy of educational qualifications? After all, look at the language of higher education - university courses are known as *awards*, a term which implies judging, decision making and rewarding with a prize, ie a sorting process. The word *credential* comes from the same Latin stem as the words *credibility* and credence - the stem that also gives us the word *creed*, which of course refers to a statement of *belief* or a confession of *faith*, something that implies *trust*. So we collectively put our faith and trust into a system of beliefs that is based on the judgment and decision making of academics, and if one can successfully jump through all the right hoops, one is awarded with a qualification - a piece of paper which is actually a form of currency in the educational and employment marketplace. Whether certain qualifications have much value anymore as currency in the employment marketplace is another question for another time - however it does link back to my earlier statement about universities devising courses that are market and demand driven rather than educationally driven.

Not surprisingly, many students who enrol in the adult education awards at the University of South Australia are quite up front about being there only because they are under pressure to get the piece of paper in order to satisfy employer requirements or to be able to break through a salary barrier that is linked to qualifications. These students - generally from the VET sector rather than ACE or HRD contexts - usually engage with tertiary learning at a surface level, wanting to be told all the answers, or failing that, wanting to know what questions to ask so they will get all the right answers!

However, an interesting thing often occurs - over time, these students, almost despite themselves, grow to appreciate and actually enjoy the process of learning; the value of finding the questions and answers for themselves; the satisfaction of developing their professional skills; and the stimulation of social and intellectual interaction with other consenting adults! Many of them are even ready to continue post-graduate studies on completing their initial award - often despite being initially terrified at the prospect of university study - as if they have almost come to rely on the constant stimulation of studying and learning. The awarding of a credential then can become a secondary motive to the more primary one of learning for learning's sake. Observing this process occurring for a number of individuals over the last few years has given me a certain amount of optimism about the future role and relevance of higher education in the bigger picture of learning from life - despite the rather cynical picture I have been painting of the effects of credentialism on learning.

In addition, those of us co-ordinating the adult education awards at the University of South Australia have attempted to take into account some of the issues raised above in the development of a new undergraduate award, the Bachelor of Adult Education which was introduced in 1998 to replace the Bachelor of Teaching.

The new award takes particular account of the need to build in recognition of the prior learning and experience of adult students, without 'giving away' large parts of the coursework, and allows for the two-way recognition of competency by including the Workplace Training Category 2 competencies in the learning objectives of three core subjects. An agreement has been reached with the accrediting bodies in the state which effectively embeds this certificate within the degree; while those students who already have completed it will be exempt from that part of the coursework.

Students are now encouraged to document their own current competencies and apply for credit at the time of enrolment using an RPL Application Kit that the university has developed, which clearly spells out what is applicable and what the assessment criteria are in each case. This booklet provides a number of examples of individual case studies in a variety of adult education contexts in order to give a picture of the type of prior learning and experience that will be recognised and credited. The whole process has been tightened up, with less likelihood of credit being applied for competencies unless they can be clearly substantiated or demonstrated. This is in recognition of the strongly held view amongst the staff that the new degree is an in-service professional award for adult educators, and provides the opportunity for updating skills and knowledge as well as introducing concepts, theories and models which extend the learning process beyond the notion of 'training trainers' and developing competencies, to educating and developing professionals. This view, however, has to be continually re-stated in the face of the rationalist market-driven agenda which sees tertiary qualifications as commodities that can be packaged, marketed and sold for a quick return.

Conclusion

Finally I would like to rephrase some of the questions raised in this paper - are we diminishing the depth and breadth of formal learning by so generously awarding credentials on the basis of a person's accumulated informal learning and experience? Will Australia be a cleverer country if we all have certificates or degrees or doctorates? Are the processes of debate, discourse, discussion and reflection just as important for the development of individuals, communities and society as the processes of sorting, assessing and qualifying? If RPL stands for recognition of prior learning, what about recognising current and future learning? And will universities necessarily be the gatekeepers of all so-called 'higher

learning'? I suggest not, and in fact it is probably conferences like this one where the real issues are debated and learning that is unencumbered by credentialism can occur. In closing therefore, I leave you with this thought. With the trend in higher education towards assessment becoming more of an administrative process rather than a teaching and learning one, and the emerging role of universities as institutions of accreditation rather than education, I sometimes wonder whether as an educator what I can offer my students might be summarised by the reply that the Wizard of Oz gave to the Scarecrow who wanted to become clever -

'I can't give you a brain but I can give you a diploma!'

References

Crothers, J (1996) *RPL means getting credit where it's due ...Recognition of Prior Learning in Adult and Community Education*, Devonport: ANTA

Fletcher, S (1992) *Competence-based assessment techniques*, London: Kogan Page

Karpin, DS (1995) *Enterprising nation - renewing Australia's managers to meet the challenges of the Asia-Pacific century: Report of the Industry Task Force on Leadership and Management Skills*, Canberra: AGPS

Lessem, R (1990) *Developmental management*, Oxford: Basil Blackwell

Marsick, V (1988) 'Learning in the workplace: The case for reflectivity and critical reflectivity', *Adult Education Quarterly*, Vol 38, No 4, 187-198

Marsick, V & Watkins, K (1990) *Informal and incidental learning in the workplace*, London: Routledge

McCormick, R (1982) *Curriculum evaluation and assessment in educational institutions - Approaches to evaluation*, Milton Keynes: Open University Press

Senge, P (1990)*The fifth discipline: The art and practice of the learning organisation*, New York: Doubleday

Shore, S (1997) *Bachelor of adult education: Recognising prior learning for adult educators*. Underdale: University of South Australia

Menso, M (1997) 'National training reform agenda drops the ball' *Campus Review*, May 28 - June 3, 10

Watkins, K & Marsick, V (1993) *Sculpting the learning organisation: Lessons in the art and science of systematic change*, San Francisco: Jossey Bass